The Asian ESP Journal
Summer Edition

Volume 9 Issue 3
2013

Chief Editor: Professor Winnie Cheng
Index

1. Foreword. Professor Winnie Cheng 4

2. Hsiao-I Hou. A Needs Analysis of Culinary Arts Majors’ ESP Learning in Taiwan’s Context 5-34

3. Farzana Masroor. Argumentative Strategies of Newspaper Editorials in English across Cultures 35-72

4. Aileen Ng, Chan Soon Keng, Chin Soo Fun, Li Shu Yun, and Alvin Leong. Resume Writing in the Real World – Do Business Communication Textbooks Really Give Good Advice? 73-97


6. Wenhsien Yang. “All’s well that ends well?” A Generic Analysis of Applicants’ English Autobiographical Statements of Purpose for Applying to Undergraduate Programmes in an EFL Context 126-161

Foreword

Welcome to the December 2013 issue of The Asian ESP Journal!

We are happy to publish six articles that cover a range of research topics contributed by authors from China, Saudi Arabia, Singapore and Taiwan, namely:

1. A needs analysis of culinary arts majors’ ESP learning in Taiwan’s context, by Hsiao-I Hou
2. Argumentative strategies of newspaper editorials in English across cultures, by Farzana Masroor
3. Resume writing in the real world – do business communication textbooks really give good advice? by Aileen Ng, Chan Soon Keng, Chin Soo Fun, Li Shu Yun, and Alvin Leong
4. Academic vocabulary in the abstracts of nursing journals: a corpus-based study, by Ming-Nuan Yang
5. “All’s well that ends well?”: a generic analysis of applicants’ English autobiographical statements of purpose for applying to undergraduate programmes in an EFL context, by Wenhsien Yang
6. Construing experiential organization in research article abstracts: a genre-based approach, by Yu Hui

I hope you will enjoy reading the papers and recommend them to your colleagues and students to further disseminate the findings and enhance the impact of the research studies. Last but not least, I would like to take this opportunity to express my heartfelt gratitude to the professional contribution of our Associate Editors and Academic Editors* whose quality review work has made the current issue possible. I also wish to thank our proof readers for their great work!

Chief Editor
The Asian ESP Journal
Winnie Cheng
Department of English
The Hong Kong Polytechnic University
egwcheng@polyu.edu.hk

* Details about our Associate Editors, Academic Editors and proof readers can be found on http://asian-esp-journal.com/asian-esp-journalbeta/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=90&Itemid=53.
A Needs Analysis of Culinary Arts Majors’ ESP Learning in Taiwan’s Context

Hsiao-I Hou

National Kaohsiung University of Hospitality and Tourism, Taiwan

Biodata

Dr. Hsiao-I Hou obtained her Master’s degree in TESL from McGill University (Canada) and her PhD from University of Minnesota (USA). She has worked as a full-time assistant professor at National Kaohsiung University of Hospitality and Tourism (Taiwan, R.O.C.). Her research interests include corpus linguistics and English for specific purposes.

Abstract

This paper investigates culinary arts majors’ learning and target needs to improve an existing ESP curriculum at a hospitality-specialized institution in Taiwan. The design of this study is largely influenced by the works of Purpura and Graziano-King (2004) and Kikuchi (2004). Their work suggests that a needs analysis should use multiple methods and multiple sources. Through documentary analyses, questionnaires with culinary arts majors including sophomores and seniors with internship experience, and interviews with an ESP instructor, a senior student, and a chef, this multi-faceted investigation has led to a deeper understanding of the English communication needs placed on culinary arts majors and this industry in Taiwan. The results show that there are some significant differences between learning needs and target needs. The problems of the current ESP program are also identified. A curriculum design model is proposed based on the research results. Recommendations for ESP curriculum design and teaching
methodology for culinary arts majors in vocational programs in Taiwan are discussed.

**Keywords:** English for Specific Purposes (ESP); needs analysis; culinary arts curriculum

### 1. Introduction

During the development of multimedia and internet in the 1990s, food and cooking became serious cultural preoccupations in many countries. In the book publishing industry, cookbooks and food magazine sales consistently lead all other categories. The topics surrounding food and cooking pervade everyday communication among friends, family, and colleagues. Chefs become celebrities and cooking competitions are constantly held by government, the private sector, and TV stations. Through chefs’ narratives, TV shows, books, magazines, and blogs, society weaves plots and stories around food, eating, and recipes. This phenomenon can also be observed in Taiwan in the past ten years. Being a chef has been regarded as a prestigious job, and majoring in culinary arts has become a popular choice for vocational college or university students.

According to the Ministry of Education’s (MOE) statistical data (2011), in 2011, there were five higher institutions enrolling students in four-year culinary arts or in baking and pastry arts programs; the total student population was 1,543, an increase of 43 percent from 2010 to 2011.

For today’s culinary arts students, the rise in tourism and hospitality markets around the world has provided international mobility opportunities, especially within East and Southeast Asian regions and Western countries such as Australia, Canada, and the UK, which have signed special visa agreements with the Taiwanese government. Students can go to other countries for work, be placed in overseas internships, pursue advanced studies, or participate as exchange students for short-term periods. In addition, the government of Taiwan has tried to utilize local culinary specialties and traditions as a marketing strategy to attract international tourists coming to Taiwan. Another trend that can be observed is that with the increasing popularity of Asian
fusion cuisine in North America, Europe, and Australia, more international chain restaurant representatives are coming to Taiwan to recruit culinary arts professionals. These internationalization phenomena have forced higher institutions to re-examine whether the English curriculum design for culinary arts majors at universities can meet today’s changing and competitive culinary industry.

1.1 The case

This research investigates the needs of culinary arts students for their English for Specific Purposes (ESP) learning at a public vocational university, the National Kaohsiung University of Hospitality and Tourism (NKUHT) in Taiwan. The demand for English language teaching in the culinary field is an example of ESP field (Hutchinson & Waters, 1987; Robinson, 1991). NKUHT is a leading hospitality-specialized public institution in Taiwan. This vocational university was founded in 1995 as a vocational institute in southern Taiwan. It was promoted to college status in 2000, and was promoted to its university status by the MOE in 2010. Until 2011, this university consisted of approximately 4,053 total students (undergraduate and graduate) and 124 full-time faculty members. There are thirteen undergraduate and six graduate departments and programs housed in the following schools: School of Hospitality Management, School of Tourism, and School of Culinary Arts.

Compared with other culinary institutions around the world and in Taiwan, the School of Culinary Arts at the university provides comprehensive and varied training that cultivates professions in the culinary industry. The undergraduate programs include Chinese Culinary Arts, Western Culinary Arts, Baking Technology and Management, and International Culinary Arts; graduate programs consist of Taiwanese Food Culture, and Food and Beverage Innovation Research. Those programs focus on a broad range of specializations including pre-professional
training education in the culinary arts, academic research in applied food and baking science, food and beverage management, and applied social science research in food culture. Furthermore, to advocate the philosophy of “learning by doing and doing by learning,” the university is the first institution in Taiwan which promotes service learning and the sandwich model. This means that the students have to actively participate in community service work. During their junior years, they must gain relevant industry experience. These learning models have been widely adopted by other vocational schools because of the unique curriculum design and school culture. The university always ranks at the top in students’ national entrance exam results among universities in Taiwan.

1.2 The problems

At NKUHT, culinary arts students have been described as having lower than average competency in the English language and their passing rates for General English or ESP classes are the lowest among the three schools. This has been illustrated by the lower grade averages in university entrance exams and the preliminary interviews with English language teachers and culinary arts graduates, and the researcher’s personal teaching experience. The graduates mentioned that the culinary arts students had completed their study without being benefited from the English language courses they had taken during their university career. They mentioned that when they were working in the back house of a Chinese restaurant establishment, they were not given any opportunities to speak in English. However, they emphasized the importance of learning English for their future professional development or for obtaining overseas work opportunities. For instance, when applying for overseas internships or studying abroad programs at foreign institutions, they have to compete with candidates who are more competent in using English. As a result, the culinary arts students have limited international learning opportunities
and are not confident in English. Personal teaching experiences with culinary arts students indicate that they have difficulties in reading professional textbooks and documents in English. They are generally passive learners and they are not confident about their English ability in general.

The aforementioned problems are caused by many factors. One of the factors is curriculum design. Many indicators have suggested that the present curriculum at NKUHT fails to meet the learners’ needs. The current curriculum needs to be reevaluated and suggestions regarding program development have to be made to improve the use of English of culinary arts students. Until now, ESP research has not focused on this particular group of students and their needs. This study can contribute to syllabus design and English program development that will satisfy the specific needs of the culinary profession.

Another significant impetus for this research is previous research results (Bhatia, 1993; Charles, 1996; Forey, 2004; Long, 2005; Swales, 2004; 1990; Swales & Feak, 2004). Studies show that there is a gap between the workplace and classroom resources. Business people who are familiar with workplace materials in their professional lives need the chance to report what their needs are. In the context of the ESP classroom, some teachers are often involved in the use of business texts as example texts and, possibly, many teachers have limited exposure to the business world. Thus, it is important to obtain a deeper understanding of the day-to-day activities of the business world. Such a need is described by Hutchinson and Waters (1987). They stated that the “great majority of ESP teachers have not been trained in ESP teaching. They need, therefore, to orientate themselves to a new environment” (p.157).
2. Literature review

2.1 Needs analysis in ESP

As described by Rahman et al. (2009), a needs analysis is a necessary first step for ESP teaching. ESP differs from other English as a second language (ESL) fields in the sense that the words, lexicons, sentences, and pragmatics learned and the subject matter discussed are relevant to a particular field or discipline. The design of the curriculum and program is based on serving the learners’ needs to develop themselves in a particular occupation or in a specific academic field (Swales, 2004). Therefore, learners' needs are a critical aspect in the field. Recently, several types of needs analyses have been conducted by different researchers from varied perspectives. Purpura and Graziano-King (2004) have summarized the four types of needs analyses: learning needs analysis, target language use for situation analysis, the present learning situation, and means analysis. Firstly, the learning needs analysis mainly focuses on learners’ personal information, including their beliefs, goals, attitudes, motivations, expectations, and learning styles (Hutchinson & Waters, 1987). Secondly, target language use for situation analysis must consider learners’ needs that have to do with the target language outside of the classroom and, further, to provide descriptions of the communication in terms of language context, theme, function, and form (Purpura & Graziano-King, 2004). Thirdly, present learning situation analysis addresses issues related to what learners are offered instructionally and how the objectives are articulated. Finally, a means analysis that focuses on language policy analysis and the organizational impact on resource allocation is necessary. These four types of models provide different focuses and information for language program designers and content development writers. Scholars have suggested that the first two types are the fundamental components for any ESP needs analyses (Rahmana et al., 2009). Equally important, the analyzers should be careful
about the design and the implementation of the process of analysis. Multiple data sources from learners, instructors, clients, employers, colleagues, and documents related to the field combined with multiple methods that include qualitative and quantitative perspectives should be included. The analyzer must compare and contrast data from several sources and methods to generate the fundamental information for program development (Rahman et al., 2009).

In the past ten years, various needs analyses for ESP programs have been conducted in different contexts and they have provided valuable information for curriculum designers and researchers. Studies from non-English speaking countries including Thailand (Kaewpet, 2011), Malaysia (Rahman et al., 2009; Kassim & Ali, 2010), and Croatia (Bobanovic & Grzinic, 2011) have revealed multiple suggestions to improve ESP program development. Kaewpet (2011) described the ESP learning needs of Thai civil engineering students, emphasizing the usefulness of understanding learners’ needs before designing the program. By further investigating learners’ needs for ESP/EAP writing course in Malaysia, Rahman et al. (2009) and Kassim and Ali (2010) obtained research data from stakeholders and industrial representatives to advocate the importance of multiple sources in needs analysis. Bobanovic and Grzinic (2011) compared groups of tourist agency employees and graduate students of tourism department in Croatia and identified the different needs and motivations of English learning and communication.

The aforementioned studies have also shown that there is a gap between the target needs and learning needs of students of college or university ESP programs. The gap has resulted in negative effects such as employer unsatisfactory impressions of current graduate English performance, which consequently, has a serious impact on the learners (Liauh, 2010). As Long (2005) suggested, integrating inputs from domain experts for a specific field’s needs analyses is important and increases the reliability and validity. An approach that is oriented towards
integrating language learning and the content of the learner’s disciplines can emphasize the needs of learners and provide ample opportunities for them to use the language in meaningful situations.

2.2 Needs analysis in Taiwan’s context

Needs analyses for EFL/ESP programs in Taiwan’s context have caught more scholarly attention lately. Most previous studies have focused mainly on students’ learning needs from an investigation of data from surveys, questionnaires, or interviews (Chia et al., 1999; Hwang & Lin, 2010; Lee, 1998; Liao, 2009, Liu et al., 2011). These results have relied exclusively on data from learners via questionnaires, which do not provide a comprehensive view of the learners’ needs because the learners do not have related work experience and they do not know how English functions within a specific discipline. Other studies have failed to provide comprehensive descriptions for a better curriculum development plan. Furthermore, the data from questionnaires offers information on the sample population and is subject to bias due to factors such as wording and design of the questions. A systematic approach that includes learners and faulty, as well as potential employers and stakeholders has not been conducted by researchers in Taiwan.

Based on two previous studies that utilize triangulation research methods, the present research study obtains comprehensive data from different populations to investigate the needs of ESP courses for Applied English majors in Taiwan. Since most of the Applied English graduates choose to work in business related fields, the two studies examined the target needs in business industries. The first study was an MOE project conducted by Shih et al. (1998), which investigated the target needs of different companies and the learning needs of university students in Taiwan. The results showed that reading and listening are the most frequently used skills in business workplaces in Taiwan. Managers from the industries suggested that English programs in
higher education should focus on speaking and listening skills training. The secretarial and marketing departments need employees with higher English ability to perform other professional tasks. The study conducted by Chang (2011) has revealed similar results. Chang (2011) showed that English is the most frequently used foreign language in the business environment in Taiwan and that reading and writing are the two most frequently used skills. Secretarial, public relations, marketing, and sales departments usually set a higher requirement of English ability in their recruitment. Further, the study also describes that email writing, telephone conversations, and internet searches in English are three important skills within technological development.

Both Shih et al. (1998) and Chang (2011) have provided useful recommendations for ESP curriculum development in higher education institutions in Taiwan. Their triangulation approach demonstrates the importance of using multiple information sources in designing and analyzing a needs analyses. The scholars also highlighted the importance of long-term and on-going processes for needs analysis and suggested that more needs analysis studies should be encouraged in other disciplines to contribute to ESP programs in Taiwan to satisfy the needs for the market.

3. Method

This study identifies the learning and target needs of culinary arts majors at a public hospitality-specialized university (NKUHT) in Taiwan to increase teaching and learning effectiveness of an existing ESP program. An initial global level needs analysis was conducted to obtain up-to-date information on the types of English communication required in this industry and to identify the learning goals and styles for culinary arts majors. Although the study was based on a single institution in Taiwan, it is hoped that the leading school in Taiwan can also develop successful
ESP programs as a blueprint for other vocational institutions. The design and results can provide useful information for other non-English speaking countries as a reference for creating their ESP programs.

### 3.1 Design of the study

The research design is largely influenced by the works of Purpura and Graziano-King (2004) and Kikuchi (2004). To satisfy the research purposes, three research questions are addressed:

1. What is the context in which ESP course take place for culinary majors at NKUHT?
2. What are the culinary arts majors’ learning needs, including their learning goals and attitudes toward the ESP programs at NKUHT?
3. What are the target needs? Meaning - what do culinary arts majors in Taiwan need to learn to communicate effectively in the workplace?

To answer these research questions this study applied triangulation research from the collection of quantitative and qualitative data. Quantitative data were mainly from customized questionnaire analysis. Qualitative data involved documentary analysis and semi-structured interviews. Descriptive, interpretative, and statistical analyses were employed.

### 3.2 Data sources

In order to conduct a thorough needs analysis, multiple methods and multiple sources were used. For context analysis, brochures of culinary programs, departmental websites, departmental curriculum design reports, ESP course syllabi and materials, and student enrollment data were utilized. All documents were examined and interpreted. For analyzing learning needs and target
needs, data from the student questionnaires and interview results with the instructors, students, and industrial representative were gathered and interpreted.

### 3.3 Study subjects

The student subjects involved in this study were 225 students who were randomly selected from departments of Western Culinary Arts, Chinese Culinary Arts, and Baking Technology and Management from NKUHT. Among them, 126 (56%) were sophomores (SO) and 99 (44%) were seniors (SE). The sophomores were chosen because they have attended the ESP courses at school for four semesters and were able to provide useful information regarding their attitudes towards existing ESP courses and their goals of attending the courses. To understand the target needs for culinary arts majors in Taiwan, senior culinary arts students were the sample population. They spent the previous school year in a paid internship within hospitality-related industries. Most of them did their internship in Taiwan, but nearly 8 percent of them did their internship in a foreign country. The seniors had experience in working in the industry and all their internship positions were related to their profession. Therefore, they are expected to be able to identify the target needs of the workplace.

Among the student subjects, 44 percent were male and 56 percent were female. The demographic data showed that the average age of the participants was 21 years old. A total of forty-one percent obtained at least one type of English proficiency certificate, including TOEIC, TOEFL, or GEPT. Among them, 37 percent had been to a foreign country and the average mark of their previous English course was 74.4.

To analyze the learning needs, a questionnaire was designed to collect data from sophomore culinary arts students. The items of the questionnaire were divided into five parts: the
target situations for students using English; perceived English proficiency and the importance of English; perceived language skills needs and learning problems; activities they think to be included in their English course; and suggestions for course content. For senior students, a questionnaire that contains the same items but slightly different in wording as that provided to the sophomores was developed. The questionnaires were written in Mandarin. They were completed and modified according to the feedback from six respondents: four students and two faculty members from a private university and a national college respectively.

For the qualitative analyses, a semi-structured interview instrument was developed. The questions were based on the questions of the questionnaire, but they also included more in-depth investigations about learner’s needs. The interviews were used to supplement the data collected from the questionnaire to achieve a higher level of reliability and validity. The use of these sources of data helped to corroborate the results of the data. All interviews were tape-recorded and transcribed to form computer files for further analysis.

Information about the study subjects who were interviewed are as follows: first, a chef from a chain-hotel in Southern Taiwan was invited. He is 51 years old and has worked in the industry for over 10 years. He has worked at his current position as a sous-chef at a four-star hotel for six years. An interview with the chef was conducted in Mandarin to gather details of the communication profiles within this industry and to obtain his views about the culinary arts majors’ particular English communication needs. Second, a senior Western culinary arts student who did his overseas internship in Canada was invited to interview. The student participated in a study abroad program in a public college near Toronto for two semesters’ academic learning in culinary arts. After completing the academic course work, the student went to a resort hotel in the west coast of Canada and continued his paid internship for five months. He was invited to share
his opinions regarding how English is used in both academic and occupational contexts. Third, one ESP instructor was also invited to a semi-structured interview. The instructor has a Master’s degree in teaching English as a second language from a public university in the United States. She has worked at this institution for two years and teaches the second year ESP course, as well as the reading and writing courses for culinary arts majors. The interview conducted in Mandarin obtained her opinions regarding teaching the ESP courses for culinary arts majors.

3.4 Data analysis

The questionnaires were administered to target populations from May to June 2011. The interviews were conducted in October 2011. The quantitative data were computer-analyzed using an SPSS 14.0 program. Student responses were divided into two groups based on their years of study: sophomores (SO) and seniors (SE). Based on the school curriculum design, all senior participants finished their one-year internship training in the industry during their junior year (July 2009 – June 2010). It is believed that a comparison between the data collected from students with and without work experience will provide more information about English communication in the industry. Descriptive analyses, Chi-square, and t-tests analyses were conducted.

4. Results

4.1 Context analysis

As described earlier, with its unique curriculum design and outstanding reputation, NKUHT is the most popular higher institution among high school students. It regularly ranks as the top institution for hospitality education and always attracts top students. In 2009, the university
actively promoted the School of Culinary Arts as part of its strategic planning to attract international students and to expand its international reputation. To reach this goal, the school faced several challenges, including difficulties in internationalizing the curriculum and implementing English instruction, a lack of sufficient faculty with international experience, and an unsatisfactory level of students’ English ability. At the time of the data collection period, there were 788 students in the three departments, roughly 34 percent of the total school enrollment.

Before graduation, students need to obtain at least 132 credits and finish a one-year paid internship with a position related to their professions during their junior year. The internship is placed through the Internship Office at school, and both overseas and domestic opportunities are available. For the English curriculum design (Table 1), each student has to take six credits in English listening and speaking, and four credits in English reading and writing. These courses are part of the General Education (GE) required courses. The students are placed into appropriate levels based on their English placement test results. The placement test is given to all students during orientation week. The listening and speaking classes are arranged in smaller class sizes of less than 34 students, but the reading and writing classes are offered in a regular class size of about 65 students. In their second year students have to take an advanced two-credit English listening and speaking class as a GE requirement, and another foreign language class, either Japanese or French, for four credits. Moreover, they have to take a two-credit ESP course in either culinary arts English or Food and Beverage English. These courses are generally offered in a larger class size of over 60 students.

The first-year English training course prepares students with confidence and increases their motivation. The main themes are Survival English or English for general purposes. In order to familiarize students with the professional terms in English, the GE course in their second year,
English Listening and Speaking III, is designed to integrate with hospitality-related topics including restaurants, hotels, culinary arts, travel, and events. The GE Center recommends several textbooks to instructors but the use of these textbooks is optional. The instructors have the freedom to choose their own materials. Most of the instructors are part-time faculty and there is no standardized course outline or schedule in their courses. The ESP courses in the Second Year are offered by students’ own departments. Most of the courses are taught by part-time instructors and there is no standardized course outline or schedule.

According to the 2011 syllabi for second year Culinary Arts English for Chinese Culinary majors, industry specific topics such as kitchen utensils and facilities, kitchenware, raw materials and foods ingredients, herbs, and recipe writing are taught. In Food and Beverage English offered by the Western Culinary Arts department, teaching topics include types of breakfasts, taking reservations, types of alcoholic beverages, ordering food, and dessert and cheese. The
Food and Beverage English taught at the Baking Department covers topics including restaurant organization, making reservations, welcoming guests, small talk, dialogue in the restaurant, and handling customers’ complaints. It is obvious that the three ESP courses for culinary arts majors focus on different topics. Such inconsistency makes it difficult to evaluate the effectiveness of the programs or monitor student progress.

Compared with other vocational institutions in Taiwan, NKUHT emphasizes student foreign language training by arranging more required credits and courses. The total credit requirements for foreign languages at NKUHT are 16, while other institutions are roughly 10 to 12. Furthermore, students are placed into appropriate levels of learning. ESP concepts are integrated into GE English content to enhance their motivation and learning effectiveness. However, the curriculum is not implemented in a standardized format and courses are not arranged in appropriate order. For example, there was no evidence that the content of English Listening and Speaking II was more advanced than that of Speaking and Listening I. The level of difficulty depends on the teaching of the instructor and how he/she makes use of the textbooks and designs the course. Another major problem is the class size of the Reading and Writing course and the second year ESP courses. Problems with large class sizes include students’ misbehaviour and lack of attention, weak interpersonal reactions between students and instructors, and a generally poorer learning environment.

4.2 Quantitative analyses

The quantitative analyses are the statistical results generated from the students’ questionnaires.

4.2.1 Importance of English for studies and future careers

Most students believe that English is important to their current studies, future career
development, and advanced studies. 93.2 percent of the respondents reported that English was ‘very important’ or ‘important’ (SO: 95.2%; SE: 90.7%) for their current studies. In terms of perceptions of the importance of English for their future careers, 97.3 percent (SO: 97.5%; SE: 96.9%) believed that English was ‘very important’ or ‘important.’ Regarding the role of English for their future advanced studies, 94.2 percent (SO: 92.7%; SE: 95.9%) felt that English was ‘very important’ or ‘important.’ The SE group valued the role of English more than the SO group, both for their current studies and for their future careers. The SE group also reported that reading is the most frequently used skill in the workplace, followed by listening and speaking skills. Writing is the least used skill in the students’ working environment. This result is consistent with that of Shih et al.’s (1998) research of Taiwan’s business industry. The business industry group also reported that reading is the most important and the most frequently used skill, but writing is the least important.

4.2.2 Participants’ professional ability

Table 2 shows the Chi-Square analysis of the levels of student subjects’ self-evaluation of their English skills. When participants were asked to self-evaluate their four English skills both groups showed less confidence in their writing and speaking skills. Over 55 percent of the SO group rated their writing and speaking skills as ‘poor,’ while over 60 percent of the SE group rated all of their four skills as ‘poor.’ They were also more confident in their reading skills than in listening skills. There is a statistically significant difference in students’ self-evaluation of their reading ability by the two groups of subjects. The SE group were less confident in their reading skills than the SO group. The overall patterns were consistent with those of the MOE (2004) national survey, which indicate that college students in Taiwan performed better in English reading when compared to speaking and listening. The SE group rated their English skills as
poorer as compared to their SO counterparts probably because when they were participated in their off-campus internships, they were exposed to different reading texts and many people with different backgrounds. They may have had compared their English ability with that of the others and realized that their English especially their reading skill is not adequate enough to compete with the people who have similar professional skills.

Table 2: Participants’ Self-Evaluation of Their English Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>Fair</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>( \chi^2 )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SO</td>
<td>SE</td>
<td>SO</td>
<td>SE</td>
<td>SO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>42.4%</td>
<td>63.6%</td>
<td>40.0%</td>
<td>30.3%</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing</td>
<td>64.0</td>
<td>76.8</td>
<td>27.2</td>
<td>20.2</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listening</td>
<td>49.6</td>
<td>60.6</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>33.8</td>
<td>10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaking</td>
<td>56.0</td>
<td>65.7</td>
<td>34.4</td>
<td>28.3</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Level of significance of \( \chi^2 \) test: *\( p < .05 \); **\( p < .01 \); ***\( p < .001 \)

4.2.3 ESP curriculum, course content, and materials

Hu et al. (2006), based on research of culinary arts curriculum design, presented four fields that must be taken into account when developing a curriculum. These four fields are information technology, culinary arts, food and life sciences, and business and enterprise. The questions described in this section were generated based on the recommendations of Hu et al. (2006). A t-test analysis was performed to determine how the means of perception of topics to be included in ESP courses differ significantly by the two groups of student subjects. The SO group reported that English related to gastronomy and food knowledge were the most needed topics and were essential for inclusion in ESP courses. The SE group indicated that topics related to management and marketing are the most significant and they should be included in the course content. Between these two groups, there were statistically significant differences in whether topics related to management, marketing, food cultures, nutrition, and lifestyle should be integrated into
ESP courses (Table 3). The SO group is more interested in learning English topics that are related to daily life and culinary arts. However, the SE group is more interested in learning topics that are related to business and enterprise; and food and life sciences.

Table 3: Topics to be included in ESP courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SO</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily life</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>0.459</td>
<td>2.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural knowledge</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>0.622</td>
<td>1.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>0.567</td>
<td>2.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>2.06</td>
<td>0.482</td>
<td>2.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gastronomy</td>
<td>2.24</td>
<td>0.465</td>
<td>2.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health &amp; Safety</td>
<td>2.19</td>
<td>0.464</td>
<td>2.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food cultures</td>
<td>2.04</td>
<td>0.546</td>
<td>2.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nutrition &amp; Lifestyle</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>0.538</td>
<td>2.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant arts</td>
<td>2.14</td>
<td>0.534</td>
<td>2.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food knowledge</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td>0.480</td>
<td>2.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Technology</td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>0.585</td>
<td>2.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel</td>
<td>2.07</td>
<td>0.570</td>
<td>2.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel &amp; Tourism</td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>0.540</td>
<td>2.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For each topic in ranking, 0 is strongly disagree, and 3 is strongly agree. So that the higher the mean, the higher of the agreement.

Effective oral communication skills are essential in the hospitality industry. However, culinary professionals usually work in back of house, where communication skills are usually not as important as for front of house staff who are in direct contact with clients. The nature of their job requires high spirit in teamwork because they have to cooperate with their colleagues and front of house staff in order to meet customers’ expectations. To promote effective teamwork, good oral communication skills are important. The following questions were partially adapted from Kassim and Ali’s (2010) study which investigates oral communication needs for the engineering professions in Malaysia.

When obtaining students’ perceptions about which oral communication skills should be
included in the ESP class, significant differences between the two groups were observed (Table 4). The SO group discussed work-related matters and stressed the importance of negotiating with team members as the top two most important oral communication skills that should be included in ESP courses. The SE group suggested that working in a team and negotiating with team members are the most important oral skills. The significant differences between these two groups can be found in skills related to building relationships and working in a team. Apparently, the SE group rated these two skills higher than the SO group. Both groups showed different perspectives regarding oral communication issues. The results indicate that, with the internship experience, the SE group regard teamwork and maintaining relationships in the workplace as more important than the SO group. As a result, they emphasized the importance of communication skills in maintaining a professional network and relationships.

### Table 4: Oral Communication Skills to be included in ESP Courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SO</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Presenting new ideas</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>0.459</td>
<td>2.07</td>
<td>0.479</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussing work-related matters</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>0.566</td>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>0.547</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conversing informally and socially</td>
<td>2.07</td>
<td>0.526</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>0.531</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructing, explaining and demonstrating</td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td>0.611</td>
<td>2.01</td>
<td>0.489</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building relationships</td>
<td>1.76</td>
<td>0.616</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td>0.525</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resolving conflicts</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>0.607</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>0.574</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negotiating with team members</td>
<td>2.13</td>
<td>0.595</td>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>0.681</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working in a team</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>0.517</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>0.591</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For each skill in ranking, 0 is strongly disagree, and 3 is strongly agree. The higher the mean, the higher of the agreement. Level of significance of P value: * p<.05; ** p<.01; ***p<.001

### 4.2.4 Perceptions of ESP courses

Regarding the participants’ views on the usefulness of the ESP programs they took in their previous semesters, there are significant differences between the two groups of students in
instructors’ teaching methods, the materials, and the improvement of listening and speaking skills (Table 5). The SE group indicated lower mean scores regarding the usefulness of the teaching materials and the improvement of all the four language skills in the previous ESP courses than the SO group. Regarding teacher’s instructional methods, the SE group indicated a higher mean score in the item that their teachers used traditional lecture methods in ESP courses. Both groups reported lower mean scores regarding the total credits for ESP courses to indicate that students felt that they still need more ESP courses. The significant differences between these two groups suggest that the SE group disfavor traditional lecture methods and problems in materials and training for listening and speaking skills were perceived to be larger problems. Since the SE group has experienced real world workplace tasks, they should be able to identify the problems in their previous ESP programs better than the SO group.

Table 5: Usefulness of Previous ESP Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SO M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>SE M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My teacher used traditional lecturing methods.</td>
<td>1.77</td>
<td>0.556</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>0.550</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pairing or grouping activity is useful for my English learning.</td>
<td>1.91</td>
<td>0.568</td>
<td>1.77</td>
<td>0.655</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher encouraged active learning.</td>
<td>2.06</td>
<td>0.453</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td>0.598</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The credits for the ESP courses are enough.</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>0.738</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>0.655</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The materials are very practical.</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>0.686</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>0.721</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ESP course improved my listening skill.</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>0.650</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td>0.687</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ESP course improved my speaking skill.</td>
<td>1.77</td>
<td>0.582</td>
<td>1.57</td>
<td>0.658</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ESP course improved my reading skill.</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>0.613</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>0.698</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ESP course improved my writing skill.</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>0.658</td>
<td>1.53</td>
<td>0.721</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For each statement in ranking, 0 is strongly disagree, and 3 is strongly agree. The higher the mean, the higher of the agreement. Level of significance of P value: * p<.05; ** p<.01; ***p<.001
4.3 Qualitative analyses

4.3.1 Interview with the instructor

Findings from interviews with the instructor provided valuable input to the needs analysis. The instructor indicated that the culinary arts majors’ overall English abilities are not as good as their peers because they only focused on their culinary skills training during their high school years. English was not a major focus when they were in high school. In their university entrance exam, English is one of the required exam subjects, but it is not the key subject that influenced their enrollment. Therefore, students’ English level of competency varied. The instructor had positive comments regarding placement of students into appropriate levels. However, students with lower levels of English ability usually lack motivation and confidence. She also indicated that she was not satisfied with current teaching materials or textbooks that she used in the ESP courses for culinary arts majors. She mentioned that textbooks are not practical and they lack authenticity. Therefore, she had to spend a lot of time providing supplementary materials for the students.

Another major problem of the current ESP courses is the size of the class. In her reading and writing classes there were over 55 students. Her views on the professional English skills that the culinary arts majors need to improve are the same as those of the most of the students. She thought that oral communication skills should be enhanced because this is the greatest challenge for Taiwanese student. In the future, if the students work in chain hotels in northern Taiwan, they will probably have to work with foreign chefs. Under these circumstances strong oral communication is crucial. The instructor also mentioned that she hoped that the school will provide more ESP teaching resources such as the use of authentic materials from industry and more teacher training sessions because it is important to connect academia with the industry.
4.3.2 Interview with the chef
Findings from the interview with the sous-chef provided another perspective to this study. On the whole, the chef indicated that he was not satisfied with his employees’ and interns’ English communication skills, especially when they were required to perform more demanding tasks that involve a better command of English. When asked about the professional English skills the employees needed to improve, he responded in the same way as most of the participants. He suggested that the culinary arts ESP courses should emphasize students’ oral and listening communication skills. Regarding reading, the students should learn how to read food-related articles on the internet or food magazines in English, because as a professional chef it is important to absorb the newest information about this industry and learn from other chefs. He also expressed concerns about students’ acquisition of professional vocabulary if they want to work in the field in the future.

4.3.3 Interview with the senior student
The senior student commented positively regarding his Canadian learning and work experience. He believed that since most culinary arts majors are not confident enough in their English ability, they should be encouraged to have their internship outside Taiwan, either in Asia or in North America. In addition, the supplementary English programs of the school should be improved. The school should also provide comprehensive internship information to students in their freshman year, so that they could have sufficient time to prepare for their application or to improve their English ability and professional skills. He mentioned that technical terms in culinary arts are used repeatedly in labs, kitchens, and professional texts. He did not have problems in learning and utilizing these terms for his academic learning and internship. However, he find it difficult to follow the instructions given by teachers and chefs, explain ideas to peers,
and use small talk to expand his social network with Canadians. He believed that these problems were because of his low level of English competency in listening and speaking. Finally, he felt that the school’s ESP program did not help him to integrate effectively in a foreign country.

4.4 Conclusion of research results

To summarize the context analyses, the case revealed problems including unsystematic design of the ESP programs, lack of standardized format and course content, and a gap between the GE English courses and ESP courses offered by the academic departments. For example, topics including ordering food, greeting customers, or dialogue in the restaurant should be a part of survival English or daily life English topics in GE courses, not taught in second year ESP English for culinary majors. In addition, these topics probably overlap with English Listening and Speaking III.

The results of the case completed the picture of perceptions of professional language used, self-evaluation of English ability, and usefulness of current ESP courses offered at school by bringing the comments of students and chefs with industry experience and comparing them with those of present students and ESP teachers. A significant distinction was observed in self-evaluation in reading ability, topics, and oral communication skills to be included in ESP courses, and teaching methods and materials used in current ESP courses. Since reading skills is the most frequently used skill in this professional field, followed by listening and speaking skills, those three skills have to be emphasized in students’ first and second year training programs. Students need to be encouraged to continuously practice their English. Furthermore, according to the interviews with senior student, instructor, and chef, students should be alerted to the likelihood that they will need to communicate in English with co-workers, many of whom will not be native speakers of English. Therefore, oral practice and effective communication skills, including ways
to maintain social networks and work with team members, should be enhanced in ESP courses.

5. Teaching implications

This multi-faceted investigation has led to a much deeper awareness of ESP demands placed on culinary arts majors in Taiwan. ESP content has unique linguistic characteristics and most English instructors misunderstand the real concept of ESP in Taiwan. As a result, there is an urgent need to modify and integrate the GE and ESP English curriculum as a whole at NKUHT. Course objectives and standardized course outlines should be identified and developed. Materials and textbooks should be carefully selected. Ongoing needs analyses should be implemented regularly and professional training for instructors should be held. Finally, language training classes should be run with a smaller student-teacher ratio.

The research results also show that the learning needs between the SO and SE groups are different. Students commented that the current existing ESP programs do not satisfy their needs. As mentioned by the instructor and students, teaching methods and materials used in the ESP program are problematic. Traditional lecture methods and inauthentic materials in textbooks do not help students to learn effectively. It is recommended that techniques such as task and group-based work should be used in ESP courses to improve students’ communication skills and to create more opportunities for them to practice oral English. Regarding teaching materials, authentic materials such as articles from food magazines, restaurant reviews, and recipes from newspapers or internet, or advertisements from restaurants should be collected and used to encourage students to read and write in English. Searching through websites containing authentic materials and corpora should be implemented and encouraged by the school.

A curriculum design model for the culinary arts students at NKUHT is proposed based on the research results (Figure 1). It is suggested that in the first semester, the English training
should focus on survival English and daily life topics. Critical reading skills and basic paragraph writing should be taught. In the second semester, theme-based and hospitality-related topics should be integrated into the curriculum. Technical terms, food cultures, nutrition and life style, health, and safety should be taught in reading courses. Simple recipe reading and writing should be arranged in this semester as well. In the third semester, the listening and speaking should focus on effective oral communication training such as working with team members and maintaining networks and social relationships. In the final semester, before students begin their industrial internship, students should study culinary arts English which has been integrated with business and global concepts including marketing and management, technology applications in culinary, culinary tourism around the world, and new trends in the field, as suggested by the SE group and Hu et al. (2006). For students who will go abroad for internship or studies, cross-cultural communication issues should be addressed. In students’ senior year, more advanced ESP courses integrated with case studies or project-based instruction can be designed as elective courses.

Figure 1: Proposed Curriculum Design for Culinary Arts Majors
The detailed investigation into the needs of English learning for the culinary arts group will enable the course designers and developers of teaching and learning materials to provide more specifically focused English courses. While this study concentrated on this particular population, it is believed that students in many other profession-related majors, such as hairdresser, fashion designer will have similar needs, and these areas will be benefited from further investigations. It is hoped that the findings described above will be of value to course designers and teachers working with personnel who need to communicate in similar environments.

References


Chang, Y. (2011). From the needs of foreign languages in Taiwanese enterprises to the curriculum design for undergraduates students in department of foreign languages and applied linguistics. *English Teaching and Learning, 35* (2), 139-183.


Argumentative Strategies of Newspaper Editorials in English across Cultures

Farzana Masroor

Jubail University College, The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

Biodata

Dr. Farzana Masroor is a faculty member in English language department at Jubail University College. She teaches English composition and phonology. Her research interests involve ESP/EAP, Genre Analysis and Contrastive Discourse Analysis.

Abstract

This paper investigates the structure of English editorials from two elite newspapers, Dawn of Pakistan and New Straits Times of Malaysia in an attempt to uncover the argumentative techniques of editorial persuasion employed across cultures. The data comprises 20 editorials systematically chosen within a duration of two month period from each newspaper to make up a corpus of 40 editorials. The paper employs Swales’s (1990, 2004) move analysis to determine the global structure of editorial genre. Even though the results show similarities at the macro level, the two newspapers reveal striking differences in the preferred argumentative strategies adopted when taking a stance which is the definitive move of an editorial. In arguing for its position, Dawn appeared to be more authoritative, judgmental and critical in nature while New Straits Times used less authoritative but more convincing strategy. The differences gave different ‘texture’ to written persuasive argumentation commonly reported in editorials. This study attributes the findings to situated, contextual factors, such as the time of genre production, the presumed role of the newspaper in its society as well as its relations with the target audience.
Implications are drawn from the analysis for the teaching of students’ critical reading skills and skills of writing argumentative essays, besides teaching grammar and vocabulary in context.

**Keywords:** English Newspaper Editorials, Argumentative Strategies, Cross Cultural Persuasive Discourse, Genre Analysis.

1. **Introduction**

A crucial development in the historical evolution of newspaper industry could be attributed to the separation of news pages from opinion and commentary. The movement not only gave birth to the notion of impartial journalism, but also authorized newspapers in the explicit articulation of opinions on issues of contention through opinion discourse. The category includes a vast range of genres differing in their audience and communicative purpose such as editorials, columns, opinion articles, reviews, commentaries and letters to the editor. Opinion discourse is assuming growing interest for its powerful role in public sphere. Still, it has received less interest from researchers than hard news stories (Rodríguez, 2008; Greenberg, 2000). A body of significant research, however, has highlighted some notable aspects of opinion discourse including studies on opinion articles (Rodríguez, 2008; Smirnova, 2009), opinion columns (Marín-Arrese, 2008; Dafouz-Milne, 2008), newspaper commentaries (Wang, 2008), and letters to the editor (Smirnova, 2009).

Among the sets of genres in newspapers’ opinion category, editorial is the most powerful and the most discursive. It is distinct from other opinion discourse due to its function as a mouth piece for newspaper’s ideological standing which is evident through its unsigned nature, allowing an immense authority to the newspaper to articulate its explicit opinion on issues of contention. Often referred to as the “voice of the newspaper” (Schaffer *et al.* 1998: 251), editorial is used to criticize, make recommendations, or call for action to various actors in the
society’s political or public arena. It makes use of various pressure tactics and argumentative manoeuvres to achieve audience consensus. The presentation of arguments to influence a wide readership makes editorials be categorized as texts whose primary function is persuasive and argumentative (van Dijk, 1992). The power of editorial manipulation is evident through its huge influence on society’s opinion formulation, socially and politically, which takes its shape based on the criticism made in this media outlet (Simurda, 1997).

Since editorial is a social genre, it plays a crucial role among various political actors within the society. In fact, the deliberate selection and projection of certain particular issues as more significant and using recommendations aimed at various key players in the political debate clearly point towards the political orientation of this media outlet as distinct from everyday news reporting (Firmstone, 2003). Similarly, political leaders also need support of the news media to reach out to the masses and they often manipulate this powerful source to further their political goals. Clearly then, the discourse of newspaper editorials is shaped by the interaction of several complex factors depending upon the purpose that the newspaper is trying to achieve within a particular society.

Studying the language of news media makes us understand the function of language in a society; due to its importance as a social institution, newspaper is not only the best medium for reflecting social values but also becomes a means for creating them (Bell, 1996). For a public genre such as editorial, textual patterns used for persuasion are highly dependent on social and political trends. The challenging task that editorial undertakes demands careful use of various linguistic devices, keeping in mind the expectations of its audience. In addition to audience expectation, its textual structure is shaped by the interaction of various situational factors such as the local institutional culture and the time of text production. Indeed, as editorial is highly situational, it cannot be de-contextualized and studied autonomously; contextual factors such as
“authorial intention, cultural and/or educational background, intended use, reader response, relationship of the written configuration to a theory of text production” (Martin, 1992: 19) may have crucial role in shaping the text. The question of how newspaper editorials linguistically achieve their aims of persuading a vast range of audience to accomplish their purposes thus becomes an appealing inquiry in applied linguistics (see Belmonte, 2008). This study attempts to answer this question by carrying out a structural analysis of newspaper editorials to uncover the underlying argumentative strategies embedded in its structure across two newspaper cultures. The study provides a detailed investigation on how these argumentative strategies function to fulfill the persuasive aims of newspapers.

Among various frameworks for analyzing text structures of various discourses, the theory of genre analysis in English for Specific Purposes (ESP) has been considered as “powerful and useful” (Bhatia, 1993: 11). ESP approach to genre analysis gives a central role to the concept of communicative purpose (Swales 1990; 2004), which in turn shapes the structure of a text. The widely known ‘moves analysis’ views text as a sequence of stages called ‘moves’, each one subservient to the overall communicative purpose, and realized through smaller rhetorical units called ‘steps’ (Swales, 1990). The framework also emphasises the role of genre as a ‘social action’ (Miller, 1984) in which genre is viewed as an enactment to fulfill a set of social purposes in various situations (see Flowerdew, 2005). Genre analysis therefore offers the best framework to reveal the roles newspaper editorials perform in a society.

Despite numerous studies that have been carried out to reveal the textual structure of editorials, most of them were done from a journalistic point of view, and discourse studies on the genre are comparatively scarce (see van Dijk, 1996; Vázquez y del Árbol, 2005; Ansari & Babaii, 2005, 2009). Discourse studies on editorials produced across cultures can offer valuable insights into comparative persuasive discourse. Dantas-Whitney and Grabe (1989) highlighted the
difference in Portuguese and English language discourse style and found that Portuguese editorials adopted a more personal and involved style in comparison to English editorials which were found to be more formal and detached. Tirkkonen-Condit & Liefländer-Koistinen (1989) compared Finnish, English and German editorials’ argument statements and claimed that German editorials in comparison to English editorials placed argument statements more often at the beginning, whereas Finnish editorials preferred to inform rather than argue and had no argument statements at all. Tirkkonen-Condit (1996), when comparing the styles of argumentation in American, British, and Finnish editorials, found that Finnish editorials are marked by comparative absence of thesis summary and are less expressive in disagreement than Anglo-American editorials probably out of politeness. Pak (1997) looked into argumentation device of attribution in American, Spanish and Mexican cultures and argued that American editorials make frequent use of facts and evidence to persuade the readers in comparison to Mexican editorials which place more value on the opinions of political figures. Pak (2000), on persuasion strategies in recommendation language among Spanish and American editorials, found that American editorials stay direct and explicit when giving recommendations, while Spanish editorials preferred implicit ways of influencing the readers. These studies, however, have largely concentrated on the analysis of editorials situated in Anglo-American and European cultures.

A rather limited number of studies have focused on providing macro-structure of editorials. Such studies include van Dijk’s (1989) three-part structure of ‘Definition, Evaluation, and Recommendations or a Moral’ from five British English newspapers, i.e., Times, Daily Telegraph, Daily Mail, Sun and the Guardian. Bhatia (1993) provided the four-part cognitive structure of ‘Presenting the Case, Offering the Argument, Reaching the Verdict, and Recommending Action’ for editorials. Both studies are useful for providing functional categories but they are restricted to the level of generic moves only. The studies of Gunasekera (1989) and
Pak (1996) are significant for providing cross-cultural differences in the structure of editorials at
the macro-level of organisation. Gunasekara’s data were English editorials from Sri Lanka, India
and Singapore, while Pak used English and Spanish editorials from the US, Spain and Mexico.
Gunasekara (1989) proposed the categories of ‘Title, (Preparation for Main Topic) Main Topic(s),
Criticism/Analysis, Current Situation, Advice’ for editorials and Pak (1996) categorised her
editorial corpus into ‘Title, (Preparatory Comment), Main Topic, (Main Thesis), Analysis,
Directive’ structure. Both studies, however, do not provide a detailed functional ‘moves and
steps’ with some categories being too general (such as the categories of ‘Title’ and ‘Main Topic’).
Neither of them shows argumentative strategies that are embedded in the editorial structure. On
the other hand, de Bolivar (1994) provides a highly detailed layered analysis up to the level of
sentences (Artifact → Movements (A, B & C) → SDR → Triads (Lead, Follow, Valuate) →
Sentences) following the Birmingham school of text analysis, but the corpus was restricted to
British editorials and was found too complex for other editorials. Dayag’s (2004) study used
Toulmin’s (1964) framework of argumentative structures (Claim-Data-Warrant) on editorials
from the Philippines.

Other studies on editorials include Ansari and Babaii’s on editorials originating from the
USA (2004) and later on USA, Pakistan and Iran (2009), representing Kachru’s popular circles of
World Englishes (Kachru, 1985; Kachru and Nelson, 1996) based on Systemic Functional
Linguistics (SFL). The studies proposed a Generic Structure Potential (GSP) of newspaper
editorials with the categories of ‘Run-on Headline, Providing Background Information,
Addressing an Issue, Initiation of Argumentation, Argument 1, 2, 3, …, Closure of
modifies van Dijk’s three-part model and provides the categories of ‘the introduction section’,
‘the intermediate section’ and ‘coda’, which highlight generic moves but not sub-moves that
might exist within the moves.

The structural categorization by So (2005) is the only detailed study which goes to the level of sub-moves to expose the function of moves while providing useful pedagogical implications: Move 1 comprised ‘Introducing the Issue’ (Situation, Problem/ Issue, Stance); Move 2 is ‘Outlining the Arguments’ (Contextualization, Explanation, Evaluation, Recommendation), and Move 3 is ‘Providing Closing Evaluation’ (Evaluation, Recommendation). So’s (2005) model, however, does not provide a comprehensive analysis of Move 3, which is considered to be the most crucial one among the structural categories identified in editorial discourse. The final move deserves a comprehensive exploration as it is the place where newspaper editorials most explicitly take a stance.

While all studies described earlier explore textual structures of editorials, there is still a need to establish an overall picture in which genre is situated and produced. For a more pragmatically successful cross-cultural genre analysis, local limitations and constraints have to be considered for situated discoursal factors that influence the characters of a genre and the way it is accomplished linguistically (Bhatia, 1993). The present study looks at English editorials written and published in newspapers from Asian cultures, i.e., Pakistan and Malaysia, where English is a common and influential second language. This study aims to expose the argumentative structure of editorials at the macro-level from the two countries by highlighting their similarities and differences in their structural preferences. Even though the study focuses on comparative structural patterns, it restraints, however, from attributing all differences to cultural proclivities, but instead shows the crucial role of contextual factors in shaping the argument structure including the situated role of the news media and its relations with the target audience, and socio-political circumstances at the time of writing.
2. The corpus

The data for this study consists of 40 editorials written in English, retrieved electronically from two newspapers, *Dawn* (from Pakistan) and *News Straits Times* (from Malaysia) collected within a two month period from December 2007 to January 2008. Twenty editorials were selected on every third day from each newspaper’s website during that period, all of which were not by-lined. *News Straits Times (NST)* publishes only one editorial per day; *Dawn*, however, publishes three to four editorials daily but only the first editorial was chosen, on the assumption that the first piece would be giving voice to the most important issue of the day.

The two English newspapers are considered elite newspapers with a long history of publications in their country. English is considered a second language in both Malaysia and Pakistan, and both newspapers claim its history dates back to the British colonial era. The background of newspapers and corpus features are summarised in Table 1 below.
Table 1: Corpus features of *Dawn* and *NST*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Corpus Features</th>
<th><em>Dawn</em></th>
<th><em>NST</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Signature</td>
<td>Not By-lined</td>
<td>Not By-lined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Words per editorial</td>
<td>450-550</td>
<td>400-500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total words in corpus</td>
<td>9,937</td>
<td>8,193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status of newspaper in society</td>
<td>Oldest widely circulated English newspaper since 1941</td>
<td>Oldest widely circulated English newspaper since 1845</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Readership of newspaper</td>
<td>759,000</td>
<td>429,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Audience of newspaper</td>
<td>Majority of Pakistan’s English reading public, policy and decision-makers at government level</td>
<td>Literate Malaysian readers including the professionals, executives, managers, students, and the ruling elites (NSTP, 2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Censorship policies of newspaper</td>
<td>Faces severe criticism for its outspokenness (See Haroon, 2007)</td>
<td>Tolerant towards the ruling government; censors or avoids sensitive subjects (Reporters without Borders, 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers’ Self-image in society</td>
<td>Considers itself as “the most authoritative newspaper” (The Dawn Media Group, 2009)</td>
<td>Claims to have “always been an authoritative newspaper” (NSTP, 2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topics covered by selected editorials</td>
<td>Focuses more on political issues (70%)</td>
<td>Gives equal representation to all issues but concerned most with economic issues (35%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The types of issues raised by editorials and the frequencies of reporting of the issues are considered as crucial to highlight the influence of times of data collection on the argumentative structure. Table 2 below summarizes the topics covered by the editorials examined in this study.

Table 2: Frequency of topics covered by *Dawn* and *NST*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topics</th>
<th><em>Dawn</em></th>
<th>%</th>
<th><em>NST</em></th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. Move analysis

Following Swales’s (1990, 2004) move analysis, each editorial was analysed to determine the argumentative structure employed. This was achieved through breaking texts into smallest meaningful chunks, a sentence or a meaningful clause, according to the rhetorical functions they served. Boundaries of moves were determined through various linguistic clues (logical connectives, frame markers, hedges, modals, evaluative lexis, etc) and typographical clues (such as paragraph divisions and bold typeface). Within each move, texts were further chunked into steps. Steps are various units of meaningful rhetorical manoeuvres of achieving an overarching similar purpose of the move. Therefore, under one generic move, there might be several argumentative steps taken to give the effect of the main move. The ensuing discussion explains how moves and steps were defined and categorized.

3.1 Definition and elaboration of moves & steps

Each move or step found in the corpus is described and illustrated below. All examples are excerpts taken from the data and all emphases (underscored) are indicated by the researcher.

Move 1: Defining the issue

In this move, the main issue is announced and details of the issue in question are provided. This move could be achieved in four steps:

Step 1: Stating the Issue: Presenting the issue.

[1] It’s been a bloody Eid weekend in the Frontier province, where more than 60 lives were lost to terrorism and on-going sectarian clashes in separate incidents (D8).
Step 2: Making a Claim: Making a claim with respect to the issue to be later defended by evidence.

[2] It is so not just because rights abuse in its many forms has shown an increase, but also because by putting basic rights guaranteed by the Constitution in abeyance under emergency rule, the state itself has joined ranks with the abusers (D4).

Step 3: Identifying Initiating Event(s): Event(s) responsible for initiating the newspaper to raise an issue are presented.

[3] On Monday, palm oil reached the highest price in its history. Yesterday, corn prices approached 11-year highs. Tomorrow, it might be soybeans or wheat (NST13).

Step 4: Elaborating the Issue: Cause and effect, and facts and figures are provided to explain the issue in question.

[4] In 1993, after Yasser Arafat and Yitzhak Rabin signed the Declaration of Principles (DoP), the rich nations pledged billions of dollars to reconstruct Palestine. However, Israel never tried to faithfully implement the withdrawal timetable, and a solemn agreement that expected the final settlement to be in place in April 1999 went up in smoke (D7).

In general, Move 1 serves to provide an outline of the issue the newspaper has decided to raise, express its opinion, and present its position. The move is accomplished through a number of strategies. Move1-Step1 (M1S1) satisfies the readers by providing an answer to the question
of *What is the issue?* Besides, an editorial also tends to align itself in relation to the stated issue by making a claim, as in M1S2 which is to be later defended in the next move (Move 2). M1S3 answers the question *what caused the newspaper to raise the issue?* The last step, M1S4 helps further elaborate the issue by providing supplementary explanations via facts, figures, and cause and effects.

**Move 2: Validating the Claim**

In this move, the claim(s) made in Move 1 is substantiated by providing evaluations and contextualization. This move is generally realized through two steps:

*Step 1: Contextualizing the Claim:* To substantiate the claim(s) made, certain facts and figure or background information are provided as evidence.

[5] While our per capita greenhouse gas emissions may have doubled since 1990 and we are now the 26th largest emitter, with a per capita emission that is less than half of Australia’s and about a third of the United States’, and with a 0.6 per cent share of the world's emissions, our "carbon footprint" is still light *(NST1).*

*Step 2: Assessing the Claim:* This involves making evaluations on the basis of contextualization.

[6] Yet the crisis has underscored the fact that not a single megawatt has been added to the country’s generation capacity in ten years. That brings us to the real source of the persistent power crisis — lack of political will, planning and
foresight on the part of the Musharraf government that has presided over what is described as an ‘economic boom (D12).

In sum, Move 2 serves the function of validating the claim that the newspaper has made in M1. This move tends to be argumentative as it often includes assessments and evaluation of claims made earlier in M1 and thus prepares readers for the explicit articulation of the newspaper stance in Move 3. M2S2 is characterized by making assessments to validate the claim it has made in Move 1, meanwhile, M2S1 makes use of attributions or statistical or numerical figures as a means to back up the claim to appear reasonable and unbiased. As pointed out by Rodríguez (2008), the rhetorical and persuasive nature of opinion discourse necessitates the incorporation of both facts as well as assessments in articulating opinions.

Move 3: Taking a Stance

In this final move, editorials clearly articulate the position adopted by the newspaper in relation to the issue in question. This could be achieved in six possible steps.

Step 1: Expressing an Opinion: This step involves presenting views of the writer based on the writers’ feeling about an event, action or a person.

[7] Not that the obscurantists and their barbaric brand of militancy are not a genuine threat to the stability and integrity of the country. Far from it. However, the way extremism has been tackled in Pakistan since 9/11 leaves a lot to be desired. Deals have been cut with militants from positions of patent weakness, and until recently almost every ‘crackdown’ was followed by a ‘soft’ period of relative tolerance (D2).
Step 2: Giving Suggestions: In this step, editorials offer recommendations as possible solutions to solve the issue in question.

[8] Nevertheless, we should certainly do what we can to reduce carbon emissions. Certainly, we should be doing a better job of protecting the "carbon sinks" in our rainforests and wetlands (NST1).

Step 3: Urging for Action: In this step, a more forceful call for action with an air of authority is expressed.

[9] But as the report points out, wealthier countries must take the lead in cutting emissions because they account for almost half of the world total. The global scale of climate change, however, means that no one country, no matter how rich, can do it alone (NST1).

Step 4: Making Future Predictions: In this step, editorials surmise the issue based on previous events, and make conclusions about some future possible outcomes.

[10] Otherwise, at the first feeling of uncertainty, consumers and shopkeepers will hoard. Continued for long enough, the vicious cycle of shortage and hoarding would lead to black markets and more corruption (NST13).

Step 5: Passing a Judgment: In this step, editorials draw some conclusions based on either opinions or facts.

[11] The plain fact is that the Election Commission and the caretaker regime have been surrounded by controversy and have yet to rise convincingly above
it. And the more categorically the president declares that pre-poll rigging charges are baseless, the stronger are the misgivings about pre-election official integrity (D9).

*Step 6: Expressing Future Expectations:* This step involves the editorials expressing hope for the future.

[12] The hope is that the regional development corridors will be able to put more money in the pockets of those who have too little and to provide them with the utilities, skills and opportunities that they need to make a better life for themselves and their families in the future (*NST15*).

The third move (Move 3) is crucial in the argumentative structure of newspaper editorial. In this move, the ‘voice of the newspaper’ is most explicitly heard as it serves to present the newspapers’ stance or position it has decided to take on the issue. In this move, the newspaper editorial makes use of much more explicit strategies such as expressing opinions, passing judgments, giving recommendations, making predictions and expressing future expectations to present its position or stance and encourage the readers to act according to the editorial’s position or stance.

4. **Results and discussion**

Table 3 shows the frequency counts of each move and step in the two newspapers.
As can be seen from Table 3, there is no significant difference found in editorials from *Dawn* and *NST* at the level of moves. Ansary and Babaii (2009) have made a similar claim that there is minimal difference in the generic structure of newspaper editorials across cultures regardless of socio-political and cultural contexts. However, this study holds that differences, though minimal, are highly significant for this type of professional genre, where writers are experts and extremely vigilant about lexical choices and their impact on the audience.

The next sections provide a discussion of the results proposed in Table 3. A comparison is provided to justify the current model by juxtaposing the moves/steps found in the data with those of previous studies. The differences in the persuasive strategies preferred across target cultures observed in Table 3 are also discussed in detail.

### 4.1 Comparison with earlier studies and justification for current model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Moves &amp; Steps</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Dawn</em></td>
<td><em>NST</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frequency (n=20)</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>Frequency (n=20)</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M1 Defining the Issue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S1 Stating the Issue</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2 Making a Claim</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S3 Identifying Initiating Event(s)</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S4 Elaborating the Issue</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M2 Validating the Claim</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S1 Contextualizing the Claim</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2 Assessing the Claim</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M3 Taking a Stance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S1 Expressing an Opinion</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2 Giving Suggestions</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S3 Urging for Action</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S4 Making Future Predictions</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S5 Passing a Judgment</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S6 Expressing Future Expectations</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In a broader context, the model proposed in this study agrees with many earlier studies that the structure of editorial genre at the level of ‘moves’ can be called a three-part structure (c.f. Pak, 1996; Katajamäki & Koskela, 2006; So, 2005; van Dijk, 1989). However, unlike the abstract categories of previous models of editorial structure such as Pak’s (1996) categorization of ‘Title, Main Topic, Analysis and Directive’ or formal categories of Katajamäki & Koskela’s (2006) ‘The introduction section, The intermediate section and Coda’, the present study has attempted to provide more detailed functional demarcations.

Table 4 compares the moves categorized in the model proposed above with similar structures proposed in earlier studies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Moves</th>
<th>M1 ‘Defining the issue’</th>
<th>M2 ‘Validating the Claim’</th>
<th>M3 ‘Taking a Stance’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>‘Presenting the case’</td>
<td></td>
<td>‘Offering the Argument’</td>
<td>‘Reaching a Verdict’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Bhatia, 1993)</td>
<td></td>
<td>(Bhatia, 1993)</td>
<td>and ‘Recommending Action’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Definition of events’ (Van Dijk, 1989)</td>
<td></td>
<td>‘Evaluation of the events’</td>
<td>(Bhatia, 1993)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Introducing the Issue’ (So, 2005)</td>
<td></td>
<td>‘Outlining the Arguments’</td>
<td>‘Recommendations or a Moral’ (Van Dijk, 1989)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(So, 2005)</td>
<td>‘Advice’ (Gunesekera, 1989)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>‘Directive’ (Pak, 1996)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 4, all studies have pointed out some similarity of purpose in the demarcation of moves. However, van Dijk (1989) and Bhatia (1993) did not provide further categories to the level of steps. So’s (2005) model is the only one which provides detailed functional demarcation to the level of steps. The steps provided by So (2005) under M1 show some similarity of purpose with the steps of this study. For example, M1S1 ‘Stating the Issue’ is comparable to So’s (2005) ‘Problem/Issue’, while M1S4 ‘Elaborating the Issue’ to So’s
'Situation’.

With respect to M2, So’s (2005) model sub-divides it into four sub-functions: ‘Contextualization’, ‘Explanation’, ‘Evaluation’ and ‘Recommendation’. The present study differs from So’s study in only two steps in M2, i.e., ‘Contextualizing the Claim’ and ‘Assessing the Claim’. This study holds that functionally, this move can be sorted out into two categories: one, based on the evaluations or assessments of the writer, and the other, providing information for backing up the views of the writer. Therefore, the two steps, ‘Contextualization’ and ‘Explanation’, in So (2005) can functionally be subsumed under one step of ‘Contextualizing the Claim’. Moreover, through the data analysis, the present study has identified the category of ‘Recommendations’ in So (2005) to be part of Move 3 rather than Move 2.

A move similar to Move 3 ‘Taking a Stance’ has also been identified in earlier works (such as Gunasekera, 1989; Pak, 1996) as shown in Table 4. However, they have only addressed the strategy of giving advice under this move. Although the aim of influencing the readers is achieved by directing them to think or act in a certain manner, it has been found that Move 3 achieves more than just giving recommendations. Bhatia (1993) has in fact provided a four-part structure and identified a similar kind of move as ‘Reaching a Verdict’. Indeed, Move 3 identified in the present study incorporates both Bhatia’s ‘Reaching a Verdict’ and ‘Recommending Action’ as these moves can be considered as serving one common purpose of ‘Taking a Stance’. Only So (2005) provides a similar description in her final move, ‘Providing Closing Evaluation’, which comprises two sub-functional moves i.e., ‘Evaluation’ and ‘Recommendation’. The two sub-moves, however, do not explicate the ways and strategies adopted by editorialists in taking stance in the final move. The data analysis of the present study reveals that a newspaper can realize this move by making use of a number of strategies such as expressing opinions, judgments, predictions, and recommendations. This proposed model
identifies six steps in the definitive Move 3 in editorial persuasion and highlights more possible strategies embedded in the global structure of editorial genre.

As shown in Table 3, all three moves identified in the model of the present study are found to be obligatory. However, at the level of steps, some differences point out to the cross-cultural preferences in employing different strategies of taking a position. This is in line with Bhatia’s (1993) observation that local circumstances among various cultures may not have any significant effect on the generic structure of a genre though differences in the underlying objectives may influence the realization of moves.

In Table 3, at the level of steps, there are no significant differences found in Move 1 and Move 2 and all steps in these two moves can be considered as obligatory. Being part of newspaper discourse, editorial genre is meant for public consumption with the aim of influencing a diverse range of readers, including those who have active roles in the genre production such as political actors and analysts to common readers having limited knowledge on the issue. The obligatory nature of all steps in the first two moves point out to this aim which is realized by providing enough information on the issue in Move 1 and then by quelling all doubts of the readers in Move 2.

The similarities in Move 1 and Move 2 are, however, in direct contrast to the differences found in the steps of Move 3. This move is considered extremely crucial in the argumentative structure of editorial genre; here, the editorial acting as the voice of newspaper takes an explicit stance in order to change and influence the reader’s beliefs. The differences show that even though editorials from both countries have the same schematic structure, they differ in their ways of persuasion. As is evident in Table 3 above, there are differences in Move 3 with respect to the stance preferred by each newspaper. The differences are reflected by the strategies of expressing opinion, giving suggestions, urging for action and passing judgments. *Dawn* is found to be more
expressive in its opinion articulation by making greater usage of M3S1 *Expressing an Opinion* (20% vs. 14% of *NST*) and M3S5 *Passing a Judgment* (18% vs. 4% of *NST*). A clear difference is also found between the preferred ways of persuasion through directives where *Dawn* is pre-occupied with greater usage of forceful directives. It mostly directs via M3S3 *Urging for Action* (13% vs. 5% of *NST*). Meanwhile, *NST* prefers a suggestive stance when directing the readers by making greater usage of M3S2 *Giving Suggestions* (16% vs. 9% of *Dawn*). The results reveal a comparatively aggressive stance adopted by *Dawn* when persuading the readers in comparison to *NST*.

In the following segment, these differences are discussed in greater detail to unpack the preferred ways of persuasion adopted by each newspaper through the structural analysis of the present study.

### 4.2 Persuasive strategies in editorial genre

The results of the study reveal that across culture, editorial as a genre subscribes to a similar generic structure (see Ansari and Barbari 2005, 2009). Editorials, being the ultimate voice in the publication of news reports, encapsulate the position of newspaper on current issues deemed important in the society it represents. To that effect, it is not surprising to find that Move 3 reveals marked differences between the two newspaper editorials studied. The choice of argumentative strategies deployed in Move 3 is heavily influenced by local contexts in which the genre is shaped. The editorials in *Dawn* are more expressive, urgent and judgemental when compared to the ones in *New Straits Times* which are more guarded, toned down and suggestive. The differences found in overall argumentative strategies of Move 3 in both newspapers are perhaps better reflected by the following four dichotomies:
**Suggesting vs. Urging**

The argumentative strategy of directing the readers to take or not to take a certain action (labelled under Move 3 in the present study) has also been identified in other studies as directives (Pak, 1996), advice (Gunesekera, 1989) or recommendations (van Dijk, 1989; Bhatia, 1993; So, 2005). Since editorial is a professional genre, lexical choice and the employment of manipulative linguistic devices such as directives are significant. The way a newspaper takes a stance in the form of directives reveals a lot about editorial persuasion. Even though both newspapers take a stance, each takes it in a different manner.

To highlight the difference in editorial persuasion between the two newspaper cultures, the directives given to readers were categorized into two steps of Move 3, Giving Suggestions (M3S2) and Urging for Action (M3S3), according to the tone and degree of commitment expressed in the recommendations. The differences in persuasion are achieved through less authoritative and less confrontational suggestions as expressed in M3S2, or more authoritative and committed ones as reflected by M3S3. The suggestive tone is characterized by less authoritative stance while directing the readers, whereas urging tone gives a feeling of urgency, often evoking an air of authority. The distinction between the two categories is made based on the form used to direct the readers, also depending upon the co-texts surrounding the form used. The form used could either be modal verbs (e.g. *must, should, can, would*) or non-modal phrases (e.g. verbs of obligation like *calls for, requires*, adjectives of obligation such as *it is necessary, it is time to*, nouns of obligation like *the duty/task is*, and finally an indirect means like *what is missing...* etc). The category can be best exemplified by the modals of obligation *should* and *must* which explicitly reflect the force of directive distinguished here: suggestive force is typified by the modal *should* and urging stance is expressed with the modal *must* (see Quirk *et al.*, 1985: 221, for differences between obligation modals *must* and *should*). The results show that the
strategy of M3S2 *Giving Suggestions* is employed more frequently in *NST* (80%) than in *Dawn* (45%). Meanwhile, M3S3 *Urging for Action* is realized more frequently by *Dawn* (65%) compared to *NST* (25%). This highlights the dichotomy existing in the stance adopted by each newspaper when directing the readers: *Dawn* appears to be more urging, while *NST* adopts a comparatively suggestive stance.

This difference is more prominent if we take a look at the total frequency of modals of obligation in directives employed by each newspaper. As noted earlier, directives are realized through various linguistic triggers, both modal and non-modal. In both newspapers, however, modals are key linguistic means to direct the readers. In total, *Dawn* directs 63.9% in Move 3 through modals, while *NST* 67.3%. The modals of obligation, among all modal forms, are crucial as they explicitly reflect the suggestive and urging force of the directives used. It is important to note that among all other modal and non-modal forms used to direct the readers, the percentage of modals of obligation in both the newspapers is the highest, where *NST* realizes a total of 49.3% of its directives through obligation modals and *Dawn* does so for 31.2%. Following Quirk *et al.* (1985: 221), the modals of obligation can be classified into modals with “committed obligation” (*must, have to* and *need*) and modals with “non-committed obligation” (*should* and *ought to*). The frequency analysis of committed and non-committed obligation modals of *Dawn* and *NST* is provided in Table 5 below:
Table 5: Frequency of Committed and Non-Committed Obligation Modals in *Dawn* and *NST*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DIRECTIVES (n=61)</th>
<th>DAWN</th>
<th>NST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Committed Obligation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Must</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Have to</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Need</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>26.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-Committed Obligation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Should</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Ought to</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 further confirms that *Dawn* is more urging in its stance as reflected by a greater use of the most committed obligation modal *must* (11.5% vs. 6.5% in *NST*) whereas *NST*’s suggestive stance is reflected by its frequent use of the less obligatory modal *should* (26.2% of all directives instances vs. 5% of *Dawn*) to influence the readers.

The following excerpts illustrate the difference in the persuasive strategy of directing the readers in the two newspapers:

[13] Perhaps better front-office management at public hospitals could reduce this abuse. Perhaps, compulsory health insurance should be implemented, not just for locals but also foreign workers (*NST12*).

[14] The president must listen to the people of Pakistan and do that which he has advised those in Afghanistan to do — put more reliance on political steps to follow the military operations (*D19*).

In [13], *NST* gives suggestions to the government hospitals’ management by making use
of the modals *could* and *should*. The force of directive is further mitigated by the use of *perhaps* as a hedging device. This is in contrast to the apparent bolder voice of *Dawn* as shown in [14] when it urged the ruling establishment to take some actions by using modal *must*.

The difference in the tone of the newspapers can be explained by the context of socio-political circumstances in both countries. Due to the reign of military regime in Pakistan at the time of data collection, *Dawn’s* stance is driven by the urgency to revive democracy and save the country from further crisis by using more direct persuasion. Taking upon a role as the institution standing up for its people’s welfare, *Dawn* thus speaks with authority. *NST* adopts a less authoritative and more suggestive stance, reflecting comparatively peaceful times of genre production and a lower level of urgency to take hold of the course of future actions of the readers than *Dawn*.

*Explicit vs. Implicit*

In order to provide valid arguments, a newspaper editorial, according to Edward C. Jones, the managing editor and former editorial editor of *The Free Lance-Star* in Fredericksburg, Virginia, is required to express explicit opinions during stance taking (as quoted by Simurda, 1997). The process of argumentation involves provision of factual knowledge to support subjective views, judgments and evaluations. News media holds a considerable control over the formulation of policies and actions by political leaders due to its judgmental stand taken through persuasive and evaluative language (Eilders, 2000). The more explicit or judgmental a newspaper is, the stronger its argumentation and stance.

The two newspaper editorials reported in this study differ in the ways in which opinions are articulated. *Dawn* is found to be more explicit in its articulation of opinions as the frequency of M3S5 *Passing a Judgment* (90%) compared to only 20% in *NST*. The following examples
illustrate this point:

[15] The transition to full democracy will not be complete with the doffing of the uniform; that was an essential prerequisite for civilian supremacy in the body politic. The true transition to democracy will be complete after a fair election that leads to the establishment of a government that derives its mandate to rule from the people of Pakistan (D1).

[16] Could this mean that dissatisfaction with democracy is itself an inherent part of democracy in such constituencies? If so, it should bear repeating that democracy is not an end in itself so much as a means to an end, and that end is a safe, prosperous and reasonably content society with a voice for all. If two-thirds of Malaysians surveyed can express such satisfaction, not necessarily with the status quo as with how the status quo is determined, small wonder the majority is quiet (NST3).

While expressing the views on democracy, both newspapers, as shown in [15] and [16], differ in their ways of taking stance. Dawn’s more judgmental and overt stance over the supremacy of democracy is shown by the use of judgmental will. The views of NST are less overt and more hidden by the use of a rhetorical question, marked by modal of doubt could in the expression ‘Could this mean…?’ followed by two conditional statements ‘if’. Dawn also has a higher frequency of passing verdicts (M3S5; 90% vs. 20% of NST), thus its criticism was considered as bolder and more judgmental. NST’s implicitness and less forceful strategies in changing the public opinion is also reflected by its preferences for giving suggestions M3S2
(80%) over passing judgement M3S5 (20%).

Careful attention needs to be given when analyzing opinion discourse, as direct expressions of opinions may often be avoided and hidden for various social pressures such as face-keeping and maintaining politeness in relations (van Dijk, 1996). As pointed out by van Dijk (1996), when identifying opinion statements, both textual and contextual analyses are required as sometimes it is more important to see how views are expressed rather than what is being expressed (van Dijk, 1996). Implicit stance in a newspaper editorial can sometimes be expressed by reducing the threat to readers’ face by making use of the device of inclusivity when directing the readers, or appealing to the common cause of humanity and reducing the division between newspaper and its audience by identifying itself with the common readers. The indirectness of claims is sometimes expressed through the use of inclusive we when directing the readers. NST’s indirectness is evident in its use of directives where it makes use of inclusive pronoun we (4.1% in Dawn vs. 11.2% in NST) mostly along with less obligatory modal should when suggesting the readers to act in a particular manner. The following examples highlight this contrast:

[17] In short, we should not be confined by the straitjacket of law and order but leave ourselves open to different ways to address the problem (NST11).

[18] Pakistanis must depend on their own maturity and level-headedness for a way out (D11).

In both examples, the target readers are the whole readership community. In [18], Dawn directs through ‘voice of newspaper’ when it addresses the audience as ‘Pakistanis’. In [17],
however, the voice of the newspaper is not independent of the readers as NST aligns itself with the readers through the use of inclusive we. The effort could be attributed to the newspaper’s policy of showing solidarity with the readers, and mitigating the effect of imposition and authority of newspaper on the readers. The avoidance of showing direct authority can be seen in NST’s strategy of reducing the boldness of its claim in the face of pressures from the establishment and target readers with diverse social backgrounds.

**Optimistic vs. Pessimistic**

Editorials being products of their times are very contemporary. The tone of editorials may vary according to the times of their production. Under critical circumstances, newspaper editorials tend to be more argumentative. A clear difference is found in the two newspaper editorials’ attitudes when placing hope for the future. Dawn is found to be more pessimistic and argumentative. Meanwhile, NST expresses more hope and optimism through the use of M3S6 Expressing Future Expectations. The results show that NST’s corpus consists of information related to hope two times more than those in Dawn (10% vs. 5% respectively). The size of the corpora, however, is unfortunately not large enough to make a conclusive generalization; nonetheless, the following typical excerpts illustrate the case:

[19] **The hope is that** the regional development corridors will be able to put more money in the pockets of those who have too little and to provide them with the utilities, skills and opportunities that they need to make a better life for themselves and their families in the future (NST15).
Would it be wishful thinking to hope that the day will dawn in Pakistan when the sole arbiter of what is illegal is not the army chief? Perhaps one day the superior judiciary will decide matters of law and constitution (D5).

The above example of NST is taken from a reassuring statement expressing its hopeful expectations about economic prosperity to be brought about by the government’s proposed regional development schemes. In contrast, the desire of Dawn to see a revival of democracy in

[20] seems doubtful when hope is enveloped in questions about the future of its people’s fate. The pessimistic tone of Dawn is driven by the politically difficult period through which Pakistan has been passing. NST, however, is more hopeful about the future, owing to its country’s comparative economic prosperity and political stability. As an opinion discourse, newspaper editorials not only attempt to influence the political system by overtly voicing opinions but also by giving preference to some issues more over others (Eilders, 1997). The hopeful outlook of NST was reinforced by its more frequent selection of topics related to economic issues (35% vs. 15%) when compared with Dawn’s focus on political issues (70% vs. 20%) (see Table 2).

Supporting vs. Criticizing

The use of attribution or other voices to strengthen an argument is a significant persuasive strategy. Pak (1997) defines three basic functions of attributing ideas to sources in editorials: to strengthen the credibility of arguments, to maintain the truth value of statements, and to enhance the comprehension of information. Since the type of target readers and the relations between the newspapers and readers is crucial in shaping the editorial structure, utilizing other voices when presenting stance forms an important component of argumentative structure. The use of attribution mostly occurs in M1S4 Elaborating the Issue and M2S1 Contextualizing the Claim.
The steps show a significant difference in the comparisons of the elites who are cited in two newspapers: *NST* cites authorities to support its arguments, whereas *Dawn* cites them to ridicule and criticize. The following examples illustrate the contrast:

[21] According to a senior Islamabad police official, “participation of people in such protests is increasing, which is a threat to peace”. Let’s stop here for a second. Who is entitled to define ‘peace’ and ‘public order’? Musharraf and his baton-wielding enforcers, or the citizens of Pakistan? *(D3).*

In [21], *Dawn* questions the statement given by a government official and uses it as a means to argue against the position adopted by the authorities and ridicule them by marking their notions of ‘peace’ and ‘public order’ in scare quotes. In comparison, *NST* portrays cited government officials in a much favourable light:

[22] While this does not preclude users of the shipping lane from lending a hand to keep the straits safer for their ships, cargoes and crew, it does exclude any “involvement of foreign assets”, as Abdullah asserted *(NST2).*

The supportive tone of *NST* is in direct contrast to *Dawn*’s and is marked by the use of the cited person’s name, and attributing phrases such as ‘as pointed by’, ‘as asserted by’ showing *NST*’s alignment of stance with the officials.

The dichotomy of supporting vs. criticizing in attributing sources indicate newspaper’s affiliation when taking up a stance on the issues discussed and perhaps the influence of local constraints such as the nature of readers and newspaper’s position in the society. The fact that
NST has close ties with the ruling government of the country and that Dawn constantly faces criticism by the government for its outspokenness may be one of the reasons for the newspaper editorials’ preferences in adopting different argumentative tactics.

5. Conclusion

The study has provided a prototypical macro-structure analysis of English newspaper editorials in two cultures, Pakistan and Malaysia. Newspaper editorial has proven to be, in terms of Bhatia (1993: 68), a ‘universally conventionalized’ genre, for it shows minimal differences in schematic structure across cultures. Despite the minimal differences, the study has revealed intricate moves and steps employed to accomplish the overall communicative purpose of the genre, which is to influence readers or to mould public opinions.

This cross-cultural corpus study has addressed the need to explore the role of situational and contextual factors which are involved in the process of genre production, as opinion genres such as editorials are often shaped by locally hidden, social and non-linguistic pressure (c.f Ansari & Babaii, 2009; van Dijk, 2008). With the view of genre as a powerful social action (Miller, 1984), the study has provided useful insights into the working of editorial genre in different socio-cultural settings. The differences in the argumentative strategies employed by the newspapers in this study arose from the different aims the editorials serve in their respective societies. The study proves that despite having a global structural pattern, editorials were very much shaped by local constraints, as indicated by the differences in the use of persuasive strategies to accomplish their communicative goals in the four dichotomies.

The findings from this study reveal that the frequent use of explicit argumentative moves in M3S3 Urging for Action and M3S5 Passing a Judgment and adoption of a critical attribution towards the authorities make Dawn’s editorials more argumentative in nature as the newspaper
positions itself as an authoritative voice representing the society. As Kachru and Smith (2008) observe, in argumentative discourse, the goal of winning acceptance of arguments from audience demands the adoption of a clear and direct style when articulating one’s stance. In contrast, NST’s less critical and more cautious stance as reflected by the preference of adopting M3S2 Giving Suggestions and supportive attitude when attributing source from the authorities make it more implicit in persuading the audience. The same pattern has been observed in the choice of issues raised: Dawn is overtly preoccupied with political themes which understandably involve more confrontation and argumentation (70% in Dawn vs. 20% in NST), while NST is mostly concerned with economic issues (35% in NST vs. 15% in Dawn).

News media is primarily a social institution and thereby takes its shape out of the social values and cultural tendencies it represents; however, it is also a source of inventing socio-cultural values through, among others, its linguistic manipulation. News media, therefore, becomes a valuable asset for studying the working of a language in a particular society (see Bell, 1996). Both Dawn and NST, despite having similar backgrounds such as being the oldest, the most prestigious ‘authoritative newspapers’ with colonial pasts and enjoying wide circulations, clearly have different persuasive preferences. The preferred strategies for argumentation must be re-located in their circumstantial settings such as the role of the newspaper and its target audience. Within the news media, the type of readers becomes a decisive factor in shaping the genre and language choice (Pennock, 2000). NST acts as a representative voice of a multi-racial Malaysian society where untempered explicit opinions might end up creating ethnic discord. A newspaper working under constraints from various sides such as the governing body and its multi-racial, multi-ethnic, multi-religion readership must therefore delicately balance itself to meet its varying audience expectations; these constraints ultimately manifest the implicit, tolerant, and less authoritative stance when expressing opinion. The differences also underscore
the significance of readers’ identities and roles in the structural organization of a genre.

Additionally, opinion discourse such as editorial is a product of its time. The sense of authority, urgency and disappointed outlook, portrayed through the voice of *Dawn* is a manifestation of critical socio-political period Pakistan has been going through; the explicit and critical stance depicted in *Dawn* is driven by the urgency to restore peace and bring an end to the political turmoil. This is in sharp contrast with Malaysia’s *NST* editorials, produced in relatively peaceful times with stable political and economic conditions, and the choice of less divisive topics such as the economy and the environment.

As an opinion discourse, the impact of editorials is not an immediate one. Editorial, however, is influential in ‘agenda-setting’; it “helps give the public a syllabus, a list of things to think about” (Newsom and Wollert, 1988: 417). Therefore, while taking cues of the prevalent social attitudes, newspaper editorials also try to influence these attitudes by winning the readers through use of various persuasive strategies. The analysis of argumentative structure such as the one carried out in this study then becomes a means to highlight the preponderances in accomplishing underlying purposes through strategic language manipulation.

6. Pedagogical implications

A functional structural analysis of various genres promises significant findings for ESP classrooms. Bhatia (2004) advocates English language practitioners to use real world discourse in language classes to familiarize students with their future linguistic encounters in real life. A cross-cultural structural analysis especially of argumentative discourse is even more promising pedagogically for teaching critical reading and persuasion writing (Pak, 1997; Connor, 1996). In particular, argumentative text types are highly valued (Fulkerson, 1996; Kachru and Smith, 2008) as the learning of argumentative writing proves to be a challenging task for emerging writers to
substantiate their subjective views, judgments, evaluations, beliefs and opinions successfully. Even more difficult is to gauge the audience expectations. In this respect, opinion discourse such as newspaper editorials is suitable as they set the standard for written persuasion (Connor, 1996) and they are widely available.

Since media texts are meant for public consumption and they comment on real life events, they are more likely to make teaching relevant and interesting. As shown in this study, editorials could easily be employed to raise students’ awareness of the role of contextual meta-linguistic factors involved in written persuasion. The study also shows how readers’ role and expectations shape the discourse in an established genre such as newspaper editorials. Using authentic newspaper editorials, ESP teachers could impart contextualized genre awareness to show preferred structural patterns in opinion discourse. Students could learn the role of communicative purpose when writing argumentative texts by acquiring knowledge of how various parts of texts function to achieve the overall unity at the genre structure level, and how various lexical devices support the overall functional unity of a text at the sentential level. Findings from this study can be used as resources to teach how writers take a stance by showing them various argumentative strategies and how writers manipulate them to meet their underlying aims. Students could be asked to write an opinion article and take a stance on issues immediate to them. ESP teachers could also highlight the grammatical devices commonly employed to make arguments more convincing, such as persuasive verbs, directives, modal verbs and non-modal phrases. Teacher-guided analysis of a real genre could enhance learners’ critical reading and thinking skills, raise their understanding about form-function relationships, and make them aware of the effect of various linguistic choices through the selection of certain specific forms over the others.
References


Resume Writing in the Real World – Do Business Communication Textbooks Really Give Good Advice?

Aileen Ng, Chan Soon Keng, Chin Soo Fun, Li Shu Yun, and Alvin Leong

Nanyang Technological University, Singapore

Biodata

Aileen Ng teaches communication skills courses to engineering undergraduates at the Nanyang Technological University (NTU) of Singapore. Her research interests include curriculum development and discourse analysis.

Chan Soon Keng works at the Nanyang Technological University (NTU), Singapore. She teaches Professional Communication, Technical Writing, and English Proficiency. She has designed and coordinated various language and communication skills courses for Science and Engineering undergraduates.

Chin Soo Fun has more than 20 years of experience in teaching and designing ESL and ESP courses for students, professionals and government officials from Southeast Asia, Japan, China and Singapore. Her teacher-training experience includes teaching teacher training programmes for in-service teachers as well as teacher trainees. Her research interests are grammar, syllabus design, materials development and education management.

Li Shu Yun is a Senior Lecturer at the Language and Communication Centre, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. She teaches English language and communication skills related courses to undergraduate students of various ethnic and linguistic backgrounds. Her
current research interests are curriculum development, materials and course design.

Alvin Leong is a lecturer at the Language and Communication Centre, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. He teaches academic writing courses to Science and Engineering students. His research interests are Systemic Functional Grammar and Discourse Analysis.

Abstract
With an increasingly competitive job market, graduating students in Singapore have little else but a resume to convince companies to call them up for job interviews. Given the high value of resume in this context, it is no wonder that there is a deluge of resources on the topic. Nonetheless, the question remains as to whether advice from Business Communication textbooks can reflect accurately current industry practices, especially in relation to an Asian context. This paper seeks to address the question by comparing the actual preferences of human resource (HR) professionals with information on resume-writing provided in Business Communication textbooks. In the study, eight HR professionals with vast experience in gate-keeping exercise were interviewed. Their opinions on the important aspects of resume-writing were examined against suggestions offered in eight selected Business Communication textbooks. The results from the study revealed that advice from these textbooks, to a large extent, did reflect current industry practices. However, some differences were also evident, mainly in terms of resume content that was deemed sensitive, vis-à-vis job applicants’ personal information. A contributing factor to this disparity could be the context-dependent expectations of HR professionals that are not dealt with in the textbooks. The study addresses the need for more industry-related research on professional writing to equip language teachers with relevant knowledge in actual workplace practices in order to help graduating students to hone their communication skills in preparation
for the workforce in future.

1. Introduction

Singapore, a country without any natural resources, relies heavily on the human resource to power its economy. The rapid growth and development of the small island state has, over the years, led to an increasingly competitive job market. This is particularly true of the private sector where a job applicant, at the preliminary stage, has little else but a resume to convince the employer that he or she deserves an interview. Such is the value of a well-written resume that Keyser (1974, p. 64)’s observation of it being “the most important document [one] may ever write” is perhaps timeless. Graduating students and other job seekers who need help in crafting their resumes are spoilt for choice. There are numerous books and articles on this topic, ranging from general guides (e.g. Rosenberg, 2008; Schaffer, 2005) to those for specific job sectors. McKinney (2000, 2003, 2004) and the editors of McGraw-Hill (2006) for instance, have published a series of books on resume-writing for different careers such as teaching, nursing, firefighting and computing, among others.

The question that arises from a survey of these guides is how well their content mirrors real-life practices and more crucially, the preferences of employers. Hornsby and Smith (1995, p.4) note that while “[s]everal authors have discussed the importance of resume in the job search…only a handful have examined the content, format and appearance of resumes from an empirical perspective”. There are, to be sure, notable exceptions in the way some of these guidebooks are put together (e.g. Bright & Earl, 2001), but calls for greater attention to be paid to this end have remained somewhat muted.

Research efforts seeking to establish empirical support for the various recommendations in resume guidebooks – e.g. inclusion of references, exclusion of photographs – have been
modest (e.g. Field & Holley, 1976; Olney, 1982; Schramm & Dortch, 1991; Stephens, Watt & Hobbs, 1979). Hutchinson (1984) summarized research from 1969 to 1983 to establish the content elements that employers would like included or excluded in a resume. This study was followed up a decade later in the work of Hutchinson and Brefka (1997), who surveyed the preferences of the top organizations in the United States (according to *Fortune* magazine). Their study largely supported the conclusions of earlier research work (with minor exceptions) showing that “personnel administrators have remained quite consistent in their preferences for resume content over the last decade” (p.74). Their findings were also corroborated by two other American studies conducted around the same time (Hornsby & Smith, 1995; Thoms, McMasters, Roberts & Dombkowski, 1999). Hornsby and Smith (1995), who approached 150 human resource specialists from eight industries, similarly found that it was important for applicants to list their job objectives and achievements from both their college or work experience. They also found that elements such as photographs and personal attributes (e.g. honesty, dependability) were not required for resumes. Where the appearance and structure of resumes were concerned, these studies also revealed a preference for one-page (Thoms et al., 1999), chronological resumes (Hornsby & Smith, 1995), rather than functional or hybrid ones, reflecting the employers’ concern “that applicants at all levels be able to chronologically account for previous work and educational history” (Hornsby & Smith, 1995, p.8).

While such empirical studies do allow job applicants to make informed decisions about what to include and exclude in their resumes, their usefulness is constrained by their relevance in foreign contexts where norms may differ radically. Many of the current resume guidebooks and research studies are American in orientation and targeted at American readers. However, in the situations in other countries, such as Singapore, different strategies may be necessary, possibly due to cultural influences. This is supported by Scollon and Scollon (2002)’s case study which
reveals that professionals from Hong Kong, Beijing and Finland approached the writing of resumes differently. These distinctions included type, length, as well as whether to include personal information such as age, marital status and gender. The case study revealed that resumes were generally not required for job applications in Finland as opposed to Hong Kong and Beijing. In fact, Finnish professionals normally presented their portfolios and emphasized “interpersonal trust” (Scollon & Scollon, 2002, p. 63) in the recruitment process. Conversely, resumes were important in Hong Kong and Beijing but the length differed. Hong Kong resumes tended to be longer, where even an eight-page resume was considered acceptable while Beijing resumes typically consisted of about two pages, similar to those of American resumes. This study highlights a salient point about contextual influences in resume preparation. Although past studies in America have shown resume-writing to be more or less consistent through time, there lies the issue of cultural context that has yet to be addressed adequately.

To our knowledge, besides Scollon and Scollon’s study, there is no other study addressing employer preferences on the content and structure of resumes with regard to foreign contexts and specifically, the Singapore context. The most relevant studies are those related to personnel selection techniques, of which resumes form only one aspect (e.g. Anderson & Witvliet, 2008; Phillips & Gully, 2002). No comment of local employers, however, is offered in those studies on what makes a quality resume. The findings from the empirical studies surveyed above serve merely as a guide, and will need to be compared against local studies to better reflect the norms and preferences of employers and hiring agencies in Singapore. Furthermore, as professional communication training in Singapore is heavily influenced by American resources, it would be helpful to compare the preferences of Singapore employers against the information on resume-writing found in these guidebooks, specifically business communication textbooks that are a staple for professional communication courses offered in the tertiary institutions in Singapore.
Such a comparison would enable language teachers facilitating such courses to provide their students with more accurate and reliable information on resume-writing depicting the local context, instead of relying solely on the textbooks that are more targeted at the American audience.

2. Research motivation and objective

The impetus for this study came from a communication skills course that we teach at the university. The course, aptly titled, “Professional Communication” is offered to all final year engineering students with the aim of equipping them with the necessary skills required for communicating effectively in the workplace. These skills include learning how to prepare their job application package, constituting the cover letter and the resume.

Our suggestions to the students on writing effective resumes mostly come from the information in business communication textbooks as well as our personal experiences. However, these are not the only source of information. Our university offers a career centre for students to obtain guidance and advice on any matter relating to their future careers including learning how to write resumes. The centre periodically offers workshops and seminars for students to hone their resume-writing competency. In addition, resume assessment sessions are also available at the centre, allowing graduating students to obtain feedback on their resumes for applying jobs in the real world.

With the large amount of support offered to the students, it was believed that they would be highly confident and adequately competent in writing resumes. However, we found out from our classroom interaction with the students that instead of feeling more assured, they were more confused about how best to approach resume-writing due to contradicting information that they had obtained from both the career centre and from the Professional Communication course. The
contradictions are whether or not to include sensitive information such as referees, photos and personal details and how to select a suitable type of resume to be use. Furthermore, many of our students had also raised the question of how much emphasis to place on resume appearance.

Our experience in teaching Professional Communication revealed to us that most of our students were especially good at writing the components of the course. This was understandable given the significance of resumes in securing job interviews in the local context. Therefore, we felt that it was our responsibility to provide the students with accurate and reliable information, to align academia with industry practice (Adam & Artemeva, 2002; Auerbach, 2002; Belcher, 2004) by obtaining the views of the people directly involved in job recruitment instead of merely depending on textbook advice.

This paper is a modest attempt to examine the preferences of HR professionals in Singapore regarding the preparation of resumes in relation to information found in selected business communication textbooks in order to determine if a gap exists between industry practices and classroom teaching.

It is hoped that the study will provide language teachers with a better understanding of the importance of cultural context in instructing resume-writing. Additionally, it is hoped that it encourages language teachers to reflect on best ways to teach professional writing - to collaborate with HR practitioners to provide more reliable information to improve students’ awareness and writing skills.

3. Methodology

To develop a better understanding of how HR professionals actually perceive resume-writing as compared to textbook advice, the study began with a series of interviews with highly experienced HR personnel who have all been actively involved in job recruitment. This was
followed by a careful analysis of a list of selected textbooks to ascertain if textbook advice was indeed sufficient for language teachers to teach resume writing effectively.

The comparison focused on the following aspects:

- Features of an effective resume
- Resume organization in terms of types of resumes and summary of qualifications
- Sensitive information including salary expectation, referees, personal information and the inclusion of photo
- Format and visual appeal

3.1 Interviews with HR professionals

Eight recruitment professionals from diverse organizations including government statutory boards, multinational corporations (MNCs), and small and medium enterprises (SMEs) were interviewed to gather their views on resume-writing. These professionals were selected based on their vast experience in the hiring process, having been involved in recruiting entry-level executives, executives as well as managers in their respective organizations for more than 10 years.

The face-to-face, structured interviews were employed to obtain detailed responses from the HR professionals. Each interview lasted between one and two hours. There were a total of seven interview questions (please see Appendix A) focusing mainly on issues that our students had often raised in class. Prior to the scheduled interviews, the questions were e-mailed to the interviewees so that they could better prepare for the interviews. To facilitate the data analysis, some of the interviews were tape-recorded with permission of the interviewees and there were also follow-up sessions with the interviewees to clarify any doubts about their responses.
3.2 Textbook analysis

The guidelines on resume-writing from the eight selected Business Communication textbooks (please see Appendix B) were compared with the HR professionals’ opinions. The textbooks were selected simply for their easy availability; they were offered by the two major publishers and they have been used by teachers and students in tertiary institutions in Singapore.

Our brief survey revealed that these textbooks generally have more or less the same author profile; all authors are North Americans who have been teaching and researching English for Specific Purposes (ESP) in the last 30 years, having taught and held high-ranking faculty positions in their respective tertiary institutions in the United States. In addition, they are also active and seasoned contributors to business communication books and conferences as well as consultants to Fortune 500 companies, schools and universities in their home country and abroad. We also discovered that these textbooks emphasize on similar contents regarding resume writing. Their introductions include the definitions of resume. This is followed by descriptions of the standard content elements to be included and typical language conventions to adhere to. The next section contains suggestions on creating visual appeal and in some of the textbooks, these is also a list of do’s and don’ts for crafting a resume.

The interview questions for the HR professionals formed the basis of the textbook analysis. Considering the same set of questions in the textbook analysis ensured that we were focusing on the same issues as those discussed in the interviews. This helped the development of a clear-cut comparison, enabling us to arrive at the conclusion of whether there lies a gap between industry practices and classroom teaching.

4. Results and discussion

To compare the views of HR professionals with textbook information, we started off with a
broad analysis of what constitutes an effective resume followed by looking at specific issues that were deemed controversial in resume-writing. These specific issues are related to organization, content pertaining to sensitive information, and format and visual appeal.

4.1 Features of an effective resume

Based on the responses gathered from the interviews with HR professionals regarding the features of an effective resume, it is obvious that quality content ranks very highly among the features of an effective resume. This can be seen in Table 1 below that presents the HR professionals’ opinions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OPINION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Provides basic details such as nationality, race and age or applicant’s standard particulars such as contact information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Highlights information that fits job requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Presents details of education results and achievements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Displays career objective which aligns with job requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Indicates career history with months and years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Describes work experience in terms of what was done, achieved and learned</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Includes specific, relevant skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Highlights best attributes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Provides self-introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Includes clear and concise descriptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Gives information in point form and short phrases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Displays appropriate headings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Uses relevant keywords related to the job</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In Table 1, it can be seen that a majority of the opinions reflected the HR professionals’ preference for quality content including information about work experience, educational qualifications, skills, career objective and personal information (Items 1 to 9). Other than
personal information, the findings support earlier studies (Hornsby & Smith, 1995; Hutchinson & Brefka, 1997) on resume-writing conducted in North America. These studies also revealed the strong emphasis placed by American HR professionals on work experience, educational qualifications, skills and career objective when short-listing applicants for job interviews. Given that these are key or standard information to ascertain the suitability of an applicant, it seems unlikely that the situation will change across time and space.

From the opinions gathered, it appears that personal details and attributes could also help to form an effective resume (Items 1, 8, and 9). This is supported by one of the HR professionals who stated that a job applicant must not show what he or she possesses in terms of skills and qualifications only because these would not be sufficient to make him or her “shine” in the midst of other applicants. In addition, the applicant needs to show that he or she has the right kind of attitude and personal background for the job. According to the HR professional, recruiters are looking “to gauge the job and motivational fit of candidates” and this is perhaps why there is a need to present an all-encompassing resume.

Although the suggestion to include personal details and attributes is not found in the textbooks, our analysis does reveal that there are some similarities between the textbooks and the opinions of the HR professionals in terms of the content to be included. It is described in most of the textbooks that relevant content ensures resume effectiveness. According to Dwyer (2005, p. 642), “a successful resume is specifically targeted to a particular position”. In the same vein, Adler and Elmhorst (2008, p. 518) indicate that “the most effective resumes are tailored to the interests and needs of a particular position and employer”. This resonates with the HR professionals’ preference for customized resumes that refer closely to the job requirements (Items 2, 4 and 7). The textbooks also describe other specific features of effective resumes relating to language and visual appeal that concur with the HR professionals’ opinions. For
instance, clarity and conciseness, according to O’Rourke (2007), are what makes resumes effective. Additionally, one of the key features of successful resumes includes using “jargon and buzzwords of industry and organization” (Locker and Kazcmarek, 2009, p. 469), which is in line with one of the HR professionals’ views on employing relevant keywords related to the job (Item 13).

4.2 Types of resumes

One of the things that we discuss with students in our resume writing class is how to format the resume using a particular type of resume. The two main types of resumes usually introduced in textbooks are the chronological resume, also known as the traditional resume, and the functional resume. As its name suggests, the chronological resume focuses on the history of a candidate’s typical experiences required for a job in reversed order. The headers for this kind of resume are standard, consisting of terms like “Education”, “Work Experience” and “Extra-Curricular Activities”. On the other hand, the functional resume which is synonymous with the skill-based resume, highlights the skills set of a candidate by using specific headers that are related to the job requirements.

In our opinion, presenting one’s resume in a certain way is tantamount to projecting visual appeal as it could be a useful strategy to highlight important information that would render the resume effective. Except two HR professionals, all professionals agreed that the chronological resume was their preferred choice as they would like to see the timelines regarding each type of information. One of them stressed that the chronological resume is suitable for young job hunters while another, who did not indicate any preference, mentioned that instead of determining which type to use, it was more important for job applicants to arrange their contents carefully by placing highly important information at the top or on the first page of their resumes.
Overall, their views resonated with the findings from Hornsby and Smith (1995)’s study, which discovered that North American HR personnel generally preferred the chronological resume.

Different views on which type of resume should be used were provided by the textbooks. While Dwyer (2005, p. 644) described that the targeted resume is a good option as it “emphasizes relevant skills and experience for a specific job”, both Adler and Elmhorst (2008, p. 520) and O’Rourke (2005, p. 470) advise job applicants to consider the job requirements in relation to their own qualifications and experiences before deciding on how to write their resumes. Other textbooks (Bovee & Thill, 2008; Locker & Kazcmarek, 2009) introduce the typical formats, most notably the chronological and functional resume but do not prescribe their usage. Moreira (2007, p. 31), on the other hand, explains that the chronological layout is not a compulsory format but is only ideal for people who have a stable working history. She recommends the skill-based resume for those who are changing careers or who are recent graduates. Among the textbooks selected for analysis, only two (Guffey & Du-Babcock, 2008; Krizan, Merrier & Jones, 2005) indicate that the chronological resume is preferred by most employers, being in line with the views of the HR professionals. It is also suggested that a combination resume might work favorably for individuals with little work experience (Krizan, Merrier & Jones, 2005, p. 463). According to the authors, a combination resume is actually a hybrid of both the chronological resume and the functional resume.

4.3 Personal information and photo

In our opinion, personal information such as age, gender, marital status, race, etc are non-essential in resumes as they do not help recruiters to determine if a candidate possesses the right expertise for the job. This is also the case for photos which in fact could harm candidates especially if they are used by recruiters to discriminate against certain individuals. However,
when we related this to our students, some of them argued that personal information and photo were in fact essential to some recruiters, as they had been informed in the career workshops organized by the university’s career centre as well as companies which recruit fresh graduates. To substantiate the students’ claims, this issue was brought up in the interviews with HR professionals. Of the eight HR professionals interviewed, six felt that giving certain personal information in the resume is helpful, especially for age, gender and marital status. Such information could help them understand the suitability of a candidate in working with an existing team. Furthermore, one of the HR professionals explained that although personal information was optional, it could provide a “holistic picture” of the candidate while another professional held the view that the maturity level of a candidate could be determined through such information. None of the HR professionals disagreed with the inclusion of a photo. In fact, three of them felt that it might be useful “to put a face to the name” and especially for frontline positions in sales and marketing. Generally, the interviews indicate that the HR professionals felt that personal information and photo could facilitate the selection process but they are not compulsory elements in resumes.

All the textbooks indicate that personal information and photo should be excluded. Some of them (e.g. Bovee & Thill, 2008; Krizan, Merrier & Jones 2005) cite U.S. legislation as the reason for the exclusion of personal information and photo. Krizan, Merrier & Jones (2005, p. 474) state that “employment laws prohibit employers from discriminating among applicants on the basis of race, color, religion, age, gender, etc [and] such information is not recommended”. Another reason brings to question the relevance of personal information on a candidate’s work competency. As Dwyer (2005, p. 642) puts it, “if age and marital status have nothing to do with [one’s] ability to do the job, the question should not be asked”. Nonetheless, the analysis of these textbooks also revealed that the authors’ views on personal information and photo are not an
unequivocal non-inclusion. Some leeway is given for including personal information if “[it] enhances the employers’ understanding of why [someone] would be the best candidate for the job” (Bovee & Thill, 2008, p. 560). Likewise, a photo could be included if it can reflect certain significant features of a job such as in the case of modeling (Krizan, Merrier & Jones, 2005). Therefore, it can be concluded that there is some alignment between the needs of the industry and textbook information with respect to this controversial issue but it is necessary for students to understand the importance of relevance in choosing personal information to be included in their resumes.

The inclination towards personal information and photo in resumes could be culturally-motivated. As illustrated in Scollon and Scollon (2002)’s study, giving personal information might help HR professionals to know a job applicant better. This was also the sentiment of the local HR professionals interviewed. However, in the west, especially in North America, the situation seems to be somewhat different. Hutchinson and Brefka (1997)’s study on HR professionals’ preferences for resume content show that personal information, including date of birth, marital status, race, religion and physical or health status were not considered important. On the other hand, other types of information such as expressing willingness to travel or relocate and last drawn salary from previous employment were considered somewhat important. Given the importance of cultural influence on resume-writing, language teachers should ensure that students are aware of the fact that cultural differences could be a contributing factor in producing a successful resume, especially when this concept is not described in the textbooks.

4.4 Summary of qualifications

This information category does not seem to be a common feature in Singapore-based resumes as we discovered through the course of teaching resume-writing. In fact, we only started
introducing and discussing the term with our students when we chanced upon it in the prescribed textbook (Locker & Kazcmarek, 2009) for the Professional Communication course. We observed that not only were many of our students unaware of this term, they neither saw its importance nor knew how to write it in their resumes. For this reason, we chose to ask the HR professionals about it to determine its importance for recruitment selection in the Singapore context. One of them indicated that this category is “good to have but it needs to be concise, related to the job and not generic” while another echoed her by saying that “it should be kept concise”. The rest of the HR professionals were somewhat ambivalent on the matter. One HR professional mentioned career objective as being more important for a resume while another stated that it was not important. Additionally, another HR professional suggested putting the category at the top of the resume but right after career objective and still others did not offer any views on it.

Although we were first acquainted with the term in one of the selected textbooks, this term is mentioned in all the analyzed textbooks and seems to be an important feature of U.S. resumes. Moreira (2007, p. 24) calls it “the new name for the objective statement” where it provides the best opportunity for attracting the recruiter’s attention. Other textbooks (e.g. Adler & Elmhorst, 2008; Dwyer, 2005; Krizan, Merrier & Jones, 2005; O’Rourke, 2007), use the term interchangeably with other terms such as “profile statement” and “career objective”. All the authors indicate that it should be placed at the top of the resume, usually after contact information. Krizan, Merrier and Jones (2005, p. 469) further emphasize the significance of this category by stating that it is a “brief abstract” that some employers would like to see at the beginning of a resume to ascertain if qualifications match job requirements. The same sentiment is echoed by Bovee and Thill (2008, p. 558) who mention that the category “help[s] companies to categorize candidates” and is a useful tool to highlight a candidate’s strongest points “particularly if [he or she has had] a good deal of varied experience”.
4.5 Salary expectation

We decided to approach the HR professionals about the question of salary expectation as it was a question that many of our students had raised in class. From the eight HR professionals we interviewed, only one said “Yes” to including salary expectation while the others indicated that it was not an advisable move citing the common reason that most companies already have a salary structure especially for fresh graduates and it was non-negotiable. Accordingly, salary expectation could be included only if it is stated as one of the application requirements in the job advertisement but the suggestion of some of our interviewees is to provide a salary range with the term “negotiable” displayed next to it. In addition, two of them advised fresh graduates to “conduct some market research” or “check out the current market rate” before putting down their salary expectation so as to project an image of being well-informed about the job market situation and not to be disadvantaged during the selection process.

This issue is only given a cursory mention in all the textbooks we analyzed. When it is touched upon, the suggestion is a clear non-exclusion where the authors liken it to giving personal information (Bovee & Thill, 2008; O’Rourke, 2007). In this case, we can conclude that this topic is generally a sensitive one even within a non-western context but there may be some exceptions depending on company requirements. Ultimately, fresh graduates in Singapore are best advised to refer to the job advertisements carefully coupled with being cognizant of current job market rates before deciding on whether to include salary expectation in their resumes.

4.6 Referees

In teaching about resume writing, we are of the opinion that it is important to include information about referees since they are the ones who would be able to support a candidate’s application by vouching for his/her abilities. However, some of our students raised the issue of
its importance given that referees are usually placed at the bottom of resumes. The issue was taken up with the HR professionals and nearly all of them viewed it as an important part of the resume. One of them revealed that referees are important as they “show that you are upfront about your character”. Others reported that they are helpful “for quick reference checks” and would put a candidate in good stead if they are “known and respected” in the field. In fact, it may be helpful for applicants to consider including references from former employers or professors since they could be rated highly by some HR administrators (Hutchinson & Brefka, 1997). Only one of the HR professionals indicated that referees are “not very important” but could be useful for commercial recruiters who play the “middlemen” between companies and job applicants in the hiring process.

None of the textbooks we reviewed discussed the importance of referees as part of resumes. Most of them suggest attaching a separate document for referees (Adler & Elmhorst, 2008; Dwyer, 2005; Guffey & Du-Babcock, 2008; Krizan, Merrier & Jones, 2005; Moreira, 2007). According to Locker & Kazcmarek (2009, p. 482), “including references anticipates the employers’ needs and removes a potential barrier to getting the job”. However, in the end, the benefits they professed are downplayed when they suggest including referees only if one has “trouble filling up the page”. Another word of advice given in some of these textbooks is not to include the phrase, “references available on request” as it takes up space and seems to imply that a candidate is not entirely forthcoming or genuine in his/her application (Guffey & Du-Babcock, 2008; Moreira, 2007). Although the information from both the HR professionals and textbooks is somewhat contradictory, we think that this could be a result of contemporary contextual influences. A recent study (Lim & Rajah, 2011) conducted in Singapore has found that resume embellishment is common among graduating students, especially if they do not have a social network to help them ease into the workforce. This could be why most of the HR professionals
have begun to acknowledge the importance of referees notwithstanding their awareness that this information element is normally placed at the end of the resume.

4.7 Format and visual appeal

We believe that a successful resume, just like a successful job interview candidate should be all-encompassing. In other words, as a whole package, what counts as important is not just the linguistic aspect or content of the resume but the non-linguistic aspect or layout of the resume as well. Henceforth, we have always emphasized to our students the need to strike a balance between producing good content and creating visual appeal for their resumes. When we brought up this issue with the HR professionals, all of them agreed with us that format and visual appeal are important mainly for the sake of “facilitating reading”. Words that frequently came up during the interviews with reference to format and visual appeal were “neat”, “tidy”, “clear”, “concise” and “uncluttered”.

The HR professionals’ sentiments are presented in all the textbooks that were analyzed. Specifically, Dwyer (2005, p. 642) recommends resume writers to “format and order the information in the resume skillfully [to] demonstrate personal standards of excellence and good written communication skills”. She believes that employers value these two attributes. For the textbook writers, a resume’s format and visual appeal refers to white space, margins, alignment, font, paper quality and even the type of printer used.

Besides discovering that both the HR professionals and textbooks have the same opinion on this issue, we also observed that both shared the same underlying principle of effective formatting and visual appeal which is that it supports the building of first impressions in resumes. As mentioned by one of the HR professionals, “the resume gives employer a first impression of the applicant”. Similarly, Krizan, Merrier & Jones (2005, p. 480) state that “the resume’s
appearance is important because it is a potential employer’s first impression”. Given its important role in impression-building, we think that students should give due attention to their resumes’ layout aside from dealing with content. In this regard, they need to be aware of the virtues of proofreading and editing their resumes before mailing them or in the case of electronic resumes, hitting the “send” key.

5. Conclusion and recommendations

This study was motivated by the endless debates that we had with our Professional Communication students regarding resume-writing. It was unsettling for them and us, their teachers, that there were many conflicting opinions about how best to prepare a winning resume. What we suggested to them about resume-writing came mainly from business communication textbooks that were written by American authors. The question of whether we were in sync with industry practices led us to carry out this modest research which attempted not only to gather the preferences of local HR professionals on resume-writing but also to compare their preferences with the advice dispensed by the myriad of business textbooks that we have been using for our teaching.

The findings from our study revealed that the information in the textbooks was not far removed from the preferences of the HR professionals in the local context. We found many similarities in terms of the features of an effective resume, types of resumes to use, and formatting and layout. However, there were also differing opinions especially related to candidates’ personal attributes and any other information that is deemed private such as personal particulars, photo and referees. Our study showed that this difference could be attributed to contextual influence that is generally not addressed in the textbooks.

Based on our findings, we can conclude that across time, resume has remained constant
in many aspects relating to content and visual appeal. Nonetheless, due to cultural differences, there are to be sure anomalies, as evident in our comparison of Singaporean HR professionals’ preferences with that of textbooks authored by Americans. It is important for teachers to acknowledge such differences in their classrooms and to raise awareness that there is no such thing as a one-size-fits-all resume. In order to be a successful resume writer, it is not enough just to consult guidebooks and to heed their advice unthinkingly. Rather, we recommend that teachers teach resume writing by first communicating the fundamental principles of good writing involving an awareness of the writing purpose, audience and context. Furthermore, teachers should create opportunities for students to analyze and discuss job advertisements as well as to explore the various hiring avenues (campus recruitment drive, networking session, recommendation, etc) available in Singapore to drive home the significance of context awareness. Instead of accepting the suggestions given in the textbooks, students should be trained to think critically about the suggestions and how they are applicable to their own situations.

The study was a small attempt to bridge the gap between industry practices and classroom instruction. While we understand that our findings from the HR professionals may not represent the opinions of the majority, due to a limited number of participants, the study has given us some interesting insights on the actual hiring practices of HR professionals in Singapore in order to enhance our teaching of resume-writing to cater to the specific needs of our students in the local context. Nonetheless, it is recommended that future research considers interviewing more HR professionals in order to provide a better reflection of general reality. In addition, research into HR preferences on resumes could also be extended to other parts of Asia to determine if cultural difference does indeed play a significant part in resume-writing and if so, whether teachers in Asia should consider producing their own textbooks to better reflect their situation and effectively cater to the needs of their students.
In effect, our study has revealed to us that the resume can be seen as a cultural artifact that implicitly represents the norms and beliefs of a particular social setting. In order to become successful resume writers, it would therefore be helpful for students to actively engage in the writing process by questioning and negotiating their understanding of what makes an effective resume instead of adhering strictly to textbook advice. For this to happen, teachers must take the first step in creating a more interactive environment in the classroom as well as constantly engaging with industry.

References


**Appendix A**

**Interview Questions for HR Professionals**

1. In your opinion, what are the characteristics of an effective resume?
2. Do you think it is really necessary for a job applicant to consider which type of resume to adopt before he or she begins writing?
3. Do you think the applicant’s personal information (i.e. age, marital status, hobbies, etc) and photo should be included in a resume?
4. What is your opinion on including a summary of qualifications in a resume?
5. What is your opinion on including salary expectation in a resume?
6. Do you think referees are important in a resume?
7. To what extent do you think format and visual appeal in a resume is important?

**Appendix B**

**Business Communication Textbooks Selected for the Study**

Academic Vocabulary in the Abstracts of Nursing Journals:
A Corpus-based Study

Ming-Nuan Yang

Chang Gung University of Science and Technology, Taiwan

Biodata

Ming-Nuan Yang is currently an associate professor of English in the General Education Center at Chang Gung University of Science and Technology. Her main research interests include corpus-based study, English learning strategies and English for Specific Purposes.

Abstract

The present study aimed to investigate the frequency and use of Coxhead’s (2000) academic word list (AWL) in the abstracts of nursing journal articles. A 239,117-word corpus called Nursing Journal Abstract Corpus (NJAC) was created for this study. The corpus consists of 1,000 abstracts of nursing research articles that have been published in four international nursing journals and four Taiwanese nursing journals over twelve years. The findings of this study suggested that the text coverage of AWL vocabulary accounted for 13.98% of the entire corpus. Word-token and word-family analyses of the corpus showed that the abstracts of the international nursing journals used many more academic words than the English abstracts of Taiwanese journal papers. To help non-native speaking graduate students comprehend and appropriately use academic words, the study provided a frequency-based academic word list, 174 (30.53%) out of the 570 AWL word families. Pedagogical implications are made for teachers, course designers,
researchers and nursing students with academic purposes.

**Keywords:** Academic Word List (AWL), nursing journals, academic words, corpus

1. Introduction

It has been widely accepted that the acquisition of vocabulary is a major element of learning a language because the abilities to read and write depend on adequate linguistic knowledge (Laufer, 1991; Perfetti, 1991; Nation, 2001). Vocabulary has also been considered the building blocks of listening, speaking, reading and writing proficiency. In other words, learning vocabulary is the first and necessary step to develop learners’ language proficiency and comprehension. In a review of research on vocabulary learning, Anderson and Freebody (1981) concluded that vocabulary knowledge is an excellent predictor of general language ability. Read (2000) claimed that vocabulary knowledge is one of the basic and crucial roles in learning languages. Laufer (2001) also pointed out that lexical knowledge is related to reading, writing and general language proficiency, and also to academic achievement.

How much vocabulary does a second language learner need? Most researchers agree that at least 95 percent coverage of text is needed for reasonable comprehension of a text (Liu and Nation, 1985; Laufer, 1988). Although a language makes use of a large number of words, not all of these words are equally useful. A small number of the words of English occur very frequently and if a learner knows these words, he/she will know a very large proportion of the running words in a written or spoken text. In the academic contexts, for example, Laufer (1992) argued that if L2 readers want to successfully comprehend academic research articles, they need to know 95% (about 3,000) of the words contained in academic reading texts, that is, familiar with the words in both West’s (1953) General Service List (GSL), which contains 2,000 word families in English and Coxhead’s (2000) Academic Word List (AWL). Even though academic words
occur with a much lower frequency than general-service items in the academic texts, research has shown that they play a significant role in writing and reading academic texts. They are frequently used in a wide range of academic genres but uncommonly used in other kinds of texts. AWL vocabulary, for example, is common in academic texts of different genres and fields and is regarded as a practical tool for language learners with academic purposes. In addition, unlike technical vocabulary, which is specific to a specialized field or discipline and different from subject to subject, it is considered to have the advantage of being accessible to language teachers (Coxhead and Nation, 2001).

Acquiring academic words is essential for learners who are learning English for academic purposes (EAP). They should be given more attention in the EAP classroom (Mudraya, 2006). However, this set of vocabulary is more problematic for the majority of non-native English speakers to acquire than high frequency words and technical words which they are usually more familiar with (Shaw, 1991; Thurstun & Candlin, 1998; Coxhead and Nation, 2001; Chung and Nation, 2003; Cobb and Horst, 2004). Helping non-native speaking learners acquire these so-called problematic words becomes an important issue for EAP teachers and researchers. This paper is thus concerned about what academic vocabulary needs to be taught in an academic English course for EFL nursing graduate students.

In Taiwan, the nursing graduate students have learned English for at least nine years at university, senior high school, junior high school, elementary school and probably before that. Except for reading English documents such as admissions notes, operation notes, progress notes, discharge notes, doctor’s orders, medical recorders, and consultation sheets and writing English nursing notes, these nursing graduate students also have to read English academic research articles. Moreover, they have to write English abstracts for their thesis/dissertation for graduation requirement. In academic setting, nursing students need to be able to show their nursing
knowledge through the use of specialized vocabulary. According to Raimes (1985), if language learners are going to generate, develop and present ideas in their writing, they need to have an adequate vocabulary. Previous studies show that Taiwanese nursing students’ receptive vocabulary size is between the most frequent 1,000 and 2,000 words in English and their productive vocabulary size falls below 1,000 words (Huang, 2009; Yang, 2011). It is obvious that there is a large gap between nursing students’ vocabulary knowledge and targets of 3000 words and AWL vocabulary purportedly needed to read academic materials and write English abstracts for their thesis/dissertation. The researcher, therefore, assumes that Taiwanese nursing graduate students have difficulties in academic English reading and writing. In other words, they are very poorly equipped by their English education for reading English nursing journal articles and writing English abstracts. To provide these students with an in-depth insight into the use of academic vocabulary in the abstracts of nursing journals articles, the present study aimed to explore the frequency and the use of AWL vocabulary in the abstracts of nursing journals, an aspect of AWL that has not been well explored. The study also examined differences in the use of AWL vocabulary between international and Taiwanese nursing journal abstracts to provide empirical data for needs-based teaching and learning of academic reading and writing. The use of comparisons between international and Taiwanese writers will enable the teachers to understand Taiwanese writers’ productive vocabulary knowledge and help nursing students upgrade their academic vocabulary knowledge. Moreover, in the case of English for Nursing Purposes (ENP), before we can address how to acquire the academic vocabulary, we need to define clearly what it is that constitutes the core part of the vocabulary of the nursing abstracts. The study thus planned to provide a frequency-based academic word list for nursing students, so that these words can be taught and directly studied in the same way as the words from West’s (1953) GSL.
2. Review of literature

In this section, the category of vocabulary is discussed. Following that, Coxhead’s (2000) study on AWL, the most recently produced word list which provides the vocabulary necessary to function in academic contexts, is reviewed. Then, recent studies on AWL used in English for Specific Purposes are discussed.

2.1 The category of vocabulary

To help language learners acquire vocabulary more efficiently, Nation (2001) classified English words into four categories—high-frequency words, academic words, technical words and low-frequency words. High-frequency words are those basic English words frequently used in conversation, reading and writing. By looking at frequency counts of vocabulary in a particular group of texts, teachers and learners can get information about which words will be most useful for learners of English. If learners know these high-frequency words, they will learn a very large proportion of the running words in a written text or spoken text. Knowing enough of them allows a good degree of comprehension of text, so these frequent words deserve considerable time and attention from both teachers and learners. Academic words refer to “formal, context-independent words with a high frequency and/or wide range of occurrence across scientific discipline, not usually found in basic general English courses; words with high-frequency across scientific disciplines” (Farrell, 1990, p.11). They also have a wide range—that is, they occur in many different kinds of material on many different topics. Technical words are the words used in specialized fields and are different from subject to subject. Low-frequency words are the rarely used terms, covering a very small proportion of any text, with each word occurring very infrequently. These four different categories of words play different roles in different stage of language learning. Depending on learners’ learning purposes, learners can decide which category
they need most.

### 2.2 Coxhead’s Academic Word List

Coxhead’s (2000) Academic Word List (AWL) was compiled from a corpus of 3.5 million running words, selected from academic journals and university textbooks in four fields—Arts, Commerce, Law and Science. The AWL list excludes words in the most frequent 2000 word families in West’s (1953) General Service List (GSL). For a word to be included in the AWL, a member of a family has to occur 10 times or above in each of the four areas of the corpus and in more than half of the 28 subject areas and occur more than 100 times in the entire corpus. Range is prioritized over frequency in order to avoid bias that may be generated by longer text and topic-related words. A total of 570 word families met the selection criteria, each consisting of a head word and other family members. These 570 words expand to about 3000 when all their family members are counted. The AWL is divided into ten sublists based on frequency. The first nine sublists include 60 word families each while the tenth sublist contains 30 word families. The words in the first three sublists occur with comparatively high frequency. The 60 word families in the first sublist account for over one-third of the total coverage of Coxhead’s Academic Corpus, and the first two sublists comprise half of the total coverage. The 570 word families in the AWL account for approximately 10.0% of the tokens in Coxhead’s corpus. Its coverage in the four disciplines is 9.3% in Arts, 12% in Commerce, 9.4% in Law, and 9.1% in Science. And a combination of the AWL and the 2000 word families in the GSL cover up to 86.1% of tokens in the corpus. Due to its high and wide coverage of academic texts, Coxhead’s AWL has become the major list of academic vocabulary regarding teaching English for academic purposes (EAP). Therefore, Coxhead (2000) claimed that AWL is essential for students pursuing higher education irrespective of their chosen field of specialization. AWL constitutes a specialized vocabulary
with good coverage of academic texts, regardless of the subject area. Furthermore, Coxhead and Nation (2001) argued that AWL vocabulary is common to academic texts of different genres and fields. AWL and West’s GSL (1953) combined are expected to account for around 90% of any academic text, which implies that a learner will find only one unknown word in every 10 running words.

2.3 AWL used in English for Specific Purposes (ESP)

In recent years, AWL has been considered important in academic contexts. Due to its high coverage and common use in different genres and fields, many researchers have used AWL to replace Xue and Nation’s (1984) University Word List (UWL), which is an amalgam of several previous lists based on diversified academic texts. Some studies have explored its usefulness in numerous fields, such as applied linguistics (Chung and Nation, 2003; Huang, 2007; Vongpumivitch, Huang and Chang, 2009), engineering (Mudraya, 2006; Ward, 2009), agriculture (Martinez, Beck and Panza, 2009), medicine (Chen and Ge, 2007), and business (Chen, Hu, and Ho, 2009).

Chung & Nation (2003) examined the technical vocabulary respectively in an anatomy book containing 450,000 tokens (Moore and Dadley, 1999) and applied linguistic book consisting of 93,445 tokens (Ellis, 1999). They found that most of the technical words were from the GSL and the AWL, and the applied linguistics had few technical words (16.3%) than the anatomy text (37.6%) but more AWL words (17.4%) than the anatomy one (8.6%). It seems that the AWL words play an important role in such specialized texts, especially in the field of applied linguistics.

To provide further evidence for the coverage of AWL in the field of applied linguistics, Vongpumivitch, Huang, and Chang (2009) explored the use of words in Coxhead’s (2000) AWL
in journal articles in the field of applied linguistics. A 1.5 million-word corpus was compiled by collecting 200 research articles from five international journals—*Applied Linguistics, Language Learning, The Modern Language Journal, Second Language Research,* and *TESOL Quarterly*. They found that AWL vocabulary accounts for 11.3%, a high percentage, of the language in the field of applied linguistics. They also identified 475 AWL and 128 non-AWL word forms that are used more than 50 times in their applied linguistic corpus and at least five times across the five journals. Most of the AWL word forms belong to the word families included in Coxhead’s first and second sublist.

Mudraya (2006) developed an academic word list of 1200 word families for engineering students, using a corpus of 2,000,000 running words. The texts in the corpus were selected from engineering textbooks in 13 engineering areas. The word families in her word list represented the vocabulary that engineering students, regardless of their fields of specialization, were likely to encounter in their university studies. She suggested that academic vocabulary should be given more attention in the ESP classroom. More recently, Ward (2009) established the Engineering Corpus (EC), containing nearly 271,000 words selected from 25 engineering textbooks in five engineering disciplines and produced a basic word list of 299 word types for less proficient foundation engineering students.

Chen and Ge (2007) explored the word frequency and the text coverage of the 570 word families from Coxhead’s AWL in medical research articles. They created a Whole Paper Corpus, which consisted of 50 English medical research articles with totally 190,425 running words. They found that the coverage of the AWL accounted for 10.07% in English research articles, 292 (51.2%) out of the 570 AWL word families were frequently used in English medical research articles. The coverage of AWL in English medical research articles is similar to that of Coxhead’s study.
Chen, Hu and Ho (2009) employed a corpus-based study to examine the frequency and use of Coxhead’s academic word list in the abstracts of business and management journal articles. They established a corpus by collecting Taiwanese and international academic journals published over five years (2003-2007), including the fields of business management and technology management. They found that AWL vocabulary was frequently used in business and management journal abstracts and that the abstracts of the international business and management journals used many more academic words than the English abstracts of Taiwanese journal papers. They also provided a list of useful academic vocabulary for non-native speaking business and management graduate students.

Yang (2011) established the Nursing Corpus, containing nearly 289,884 running words selected from nine nursing English textbooks, and produced a Basic Nursing Word List of 683 word types for nursing students. These basic words were not in the first 2000 word families of the GSL but those were of high frequency and wide range in academic texts. The words in her word list are frequently encountered in nursing English textbooks compulsory for all nursing students, regardless of their fields of specialization. She suggested that such words should be taught and directly studied in the same way as the words from the GSL. She also noted that these basic words should receive more attention in the English for Nursing Purposes (ENP) classroom.

As evidenced by the studies mentioned above, more studies on academic words across different subject disciplines are needed. Although academic word lists for some disciplines have been compiled, there were few detailed studies focusing on AWL vocabulary used in the field of nursing. While Yang (2011) established a basic word list for less proficient nursing pre-professionals in her study, her corpus was limited to nursing English textbooks with 289,884 running words. The study reported in this paper was designed to explore the frequency and use of Coxhead’s (2000) academic word list (AWL) in the abstracts of nursing journal articles. The
study also investigated the differences in the use of AWL vocabulary between international and Taiwanese nursing journal abstracts. The findings of this study will enable researchers to understand the distribution of AWL words in nursing journal abstracts. It will not only extend the research on AWL vocabulary used in the nursing field, but also provide nursing graduate students and their teachers with an in-depth insight into the use of academic vocabulary for reading and writing nursing abstracts of research articles.

3. Methodology

A corpus-based approach was adopted to study the 570 word academic families from Coxhead’s AWL in the field of nursing, with an emphasis on their frequency and coverage in the abstracts of international and Taiwanese nursing journals. The study also provided a frequency-based academic word list used in the abstracts of nursing research articles.

3.1 Data collection

Nursing Journal Abstract Corpus (hereafter referred to as NJAC) was specifically compiled for this study by the researcher. NJAC consists of 1,000 nursing journal abstracts that have been published in four international and four Taiwanese nursing journals over twelve years (2000-2011). The four international journals selected were Journal of Clinical Nursing, Journal of Advanced Nursing, Journal of Emergency Nursing, International Journal of Nursing Studies. These four journals were selected because they are all internationally renowned and cover a wide range of topics in the field of nursing. They were downloaded from the database ScienceDirect Online, the world’s largest scientific, technical and medical database, which contains over 1800 journals. The four Taiwanese nursing journals selected were The Journal of Nursing, The Journal of Nursing Research, Journal of Nursing Healthcare and Research, and Chang Gung Nursing.
These four Taiwanese journals are published by nursing professional associations or well-known universities. Table 1 presents the eight selected nursing journals.

Table 1: The List of the Selected Nursing Journals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Journal Titles</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td><em>Journal of Clinical Nursing (JCN)</em></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Journal of Advanced Nursing (JAN)</em></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Journal of Emergency Nursing (JEN)</em></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>International Journal of Nursing Studies (LJNS)</em></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwanese</td>
<td><em>The Journal of Nursing (JN)</em></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>The Journal of Nursing Research (JNR)</em></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Journal of Nursing Healthcare and Research (JNHR)</em></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Chang Gung Nursing (CGN)</em></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>1000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To compile the nursing corpus, the abstracts were collected in their electronic versions. 125 abstracts from each of the eight journals were collected. The final NJAC corpus had 239,117 words. The shortest abstract contained 109 running words and the longest one contained 452 running words. The average length of the abstracts was 239 running words. The two categories of journals—international and Taiwanese journals—were put into two separate sub-corpora, which together formed the integrated NJAC. In our corpus, the abstracts of international journals contained 137,056 words and those of Taiwanese journals contained 102,061 words. The use of nursing corpus consisting of abstracts of research articles in this study will enable the researcher to create a list of AWL words that are frequently used in the abstracts of nursing journals.

### 3.2 Data analysis

To answer the research questions of this study, quantitative analyses of the research corpus were
conducted by using software *Compleat Lexical Tutor* (version 6.2), which was developed by the well-known Canadian corpus researcher Tom Cobb. The program can easily perform lexical text analysis and measure the proportions of low and high frequency vocabulary used in written texts. Additionally, it can be used to classify the words into four lists representing the first and second thousand words, the AWL and the remaining items, which are not found on the other lists (Laufer and Nation, 1995).

When all the data were successfully input, we employed the computer software program to count the AWL word’s frequency and calculate the AWL word’s coverage in NJAC and in the sub-corpus of each category of the nursing journals. We also made a study on the frequencies and distribution of AWL words in the two categories of journals and in each of the eight nursing journals through both word-token and word-family analysis. The frequency, tokens and family output were then saved into Excel to facilitate further data analysis. Tokens are defined as the number of occurrences of each type; and families as a collection of base word and its inflected and derived forms (Bauer & Nation, 1993). To find out the most frequently-used academic words in nursing journal abstracts, three selection criteria, *range*, *frequency* and *word family*, were adopted. The *range* criteria is that the word forms have to occur at least in 6 or more of the eight journals; the frequency criteria is that the AWL word forms have to occur at least 50 times in the entire NJAC corpus. As suggested by Coxhed (2000), *range* is prioritized over *frequency* to avoid bias caused by longer text and topic-related words. Third, the “word” in the present study is defined as a word family, which consists of a collection of base word and its inflected and derived forms, for example:

*legislation*: legislated, legislates, legislating, legislation, legislative, legislator, legislators, legislature
Coxhead (2000) argued “comprehending regularly inflected or derived members of a family does not require much more effort by learners if they know the base word and if they have control of basic word-building process.” A number of researchers also argued that learners who know one family member can easily master all its inflected and derived forms (Hyland and Tse, 2007; Nation, 1990; Read, 2000). For this reason, the notion of word family will be appropriate for the establishment of most frequently used academic words in the abstracts of nursing research articles.

4. Results and discussion

4.1 Coverage of AWL vocabulary

Table 2 presents the frequency and the coverage of the 538 AWL word-families that occur in the entire NJAC. Only 538 of the 570 AWL word families occurred in our NJAC corpus. 32 word families did not appear at all. The total frequency counts of these 538 word-families are 33,432 times, which is 13.98% of the whole NJAC. The occurrences of the top 100 word-families account for 9.46%. In other words, the remaining 101-538 word-families make up 4.52% of the whole NJAC. It can be seen that AWL vocabulary makes up a very large proportion of the running text (13.98%) -- much higher than that reported by Coxhead (2000) of her cross-disciplinary academic corpus as a whole (10%). The figure (13.98%) is also higher than the AWL coverage in Coxhead’s four sub-corpus of commerce (12%), arts (9.3%), law (9.4%) and science (9.1%). It is interesting to note that it is even much higher than the AWL coverage reported in Chen and Ge’s (2007) medical corpus (10.07%).

Table 3 shows the coverage of the 538 AWL word-families (that were identified in NJAC) in each Coxhead’s sublist. Except for sublist 4 and 6, the coverage of the top 100 AWL word families declines from Coxhead’s 1 to 10. With respect to the frequent word families used in
NJAC. 54.9% of these 538 word families in NJAC corpus come from Coxhead’s sublists 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5. Since the frequency of words in Coxhead’s ten sublists goes downward from sublist 1 to 10, this illustrates that most of these 538 word families are high frequency AWL words.

Table 2: Frequency and Coverage of 538 AWL Word Families in NJAC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AWL Word Families</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Coverage of NJAC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-100</td>
<td>22,628</td>
<td>9.46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101-200</td>
<td>6,331</td>
<td>2.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>201-300</td>
<td>2,679</td>
<td>1.12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>301-400</td>
<td>1,286</td>
<td>0.54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-500</td>
<td>462</td>
<td>0.19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>501-538</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>33,432</td>
<td>13.98%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Coverage of the 538 AWL Word-families That Occurred in NJAC in Each of Coxhead’s Sublist

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AWL sublist</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-100</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101-200</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>201-300</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>301-400</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-500</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>501-538</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percentage 10.9 11.2 10.8 11.2 10.8 10.8 10.0 9.5 10.4 4.5 100

4.2 The use of AWL vocabulary in the abstracts of international and Taiwanese nursing journals through a word-token analysis and a word-family analysis

The AWL vocabulary is important for nursing graduate students due to its high frequency and high coverage in the abstracts of nursing research articles. To help EAP teachers understand nursing students’ productive academic vocabulary knowledge and upgrade nursing students’ academic vocabulary knowledge, this study aimed to explore the differences in the use of AWL
vocabulary between Taiwanese and international nursing journal abstracts through a word-token analysis and a word-family analysis. To understand the differences between native-speaking writers and local writers in the use of AWL vocabulary, both international and Taiwanese nursing journals were selected for study. Table 4 shows the use of AWL vocabulary in the abstracts of international and Taiwanese journals. A total of 33,432 AWL words are used in NJAC including 19,791 tokens from international journal abstracts and 13,641 tokens from Taiwanese journal abstracts. The coverage of AWL words was 14.44% for international nursing journal abstracts and 13.36% for Taiwanese ones.

The 500 abstracts with 19,791 AWL word tokens were from four international nursing journals, while the other 500 abstracts with 13,641 tokens were from four Taiwanese nursing journals. On average, approximately 39.58 tokens were used in each international journal abstract, whereas 27.28 tokens were used in each Taiwanese journal abstract. In the international journals, there are 42.04 tokens used in the JCN, 36.07 in the JAN, 39.35 in the JEN and 40.86 used in the IJNS. With regard to Taiwanese journals, there are 26.64 word tokens used in the JN, 35.50 in the JNR, 26.09 in the JNHR and 20.89 used in the CGN. The results of the study showed that more AWL word tokens were used in the abstracts of international nursing journals than in those from Taiwanese journals. A t-test procedure was performed to further explore the differences in the use of AWL word tokens used between international and Taiwanese journal abstracts. As shown in Table 5, the t-test results ($t = 3.73, p < .05$) demonstrated significant differences between international and Taiwanese nursing journal abstracts through a word-token analysis. These findings are in line with the findings of previous research (Chen, Hu and Ho, 2009), which found that more AWL words were used in the abstracts of international journals than in those from Taiwanese journals.
Raimes (1985) argued that if language learners are going to generate, develop and present ideas in their writing, they need to have an adequate vocabulary. Both Huang (2009) and Yang (2011) found Taiwanese nursing preprofessionals had limited vocabulary knowledge, which was between the most frequent 1000 and 2000 words in English. These nursing students’ receptive vocabulary size is much lower than the vocabulary knowledge, as Laufer (1992) suggested, needed for reading academic text. Yang (2011) also found that nursing students’ productive knowledge fell below the most frequent 1000 words. Their limited English vocabulary
knowledge is highly related to their academic English reading and writing proficiency. Nation (1990) argued that there are two reasons why language learners may not be able to write what they want to write. First, they may not know enough receptive vocabulary, which referred to the words which could only be recognized and comprehended in the context of reading and listening materials. Second, the learners may know enough vocabulary, but they are not able to put this vocabulary to productive use, that is, learners could not recall and use these words appropriately in speech and writing (Nation, 1990). It seems that the much less use of AWL words in the abstracts of Taiwanese journal papers is related to Taiwanese’s nursing students’ limited receptive and productive vocabulary knowledge.

Table 6 presents the number and percentage of the academic vocabulary used in nursing journal abstracts with regard to the AWL word families. Within the 5,255 word tokens used in Journal of Clinical Nursing (JCN) abstracts, the researcher identified 433 word families (75.96% of 570 of AWL families) used in the abstracts of international nursing journals published between 2000 and 2011. The other three international journals, Journal of Advanced Nursing (JAN), International Journal of Nursing Studies (IJNS) and Journal of Emergency Nursing (JEN), had 409 (71.75%), 407 (71.40%), and 400 (70.18%) word families in their abstracts, respectively. The AWL vocabulary used in Taiwanese journal abstracts for Journal of Nursing (JN), Journal of Nursing Research (JNR), Nursing and Healthcare Research (NHR), and Chang Gung Nursing (CGN) had 395 (69.29%), 388 (68.07%), 332 (58.25%), and 343 (60.17%) word families, respectively. The findings of the study showed that more AWL word families were used significantly more in the abstracts of international nursing journals (72.32%) than those used in Taiwanese ones (63.94%). AWL words were used with particular high frequency in the abstracts of Journal of Clinical Nursing (433 word families, 75.96%), while AWL words were used with only 332 word families (58.25%) in the abstracts of Journal of Nursing and
Table 6: AWL Word Families Used in the Abstracts of Nursing Journal—A Word-family Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>AWL Families Used in Nursing Abstracts</th>
<th>Nursing/AWL Word Family Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td>JCN</td>
<td>433</td>
<td>75.96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JAN</td>
<td>409</td>
<td>71.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JEN</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>70.18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IJNS</td>
<td>407</td>
<td>71.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average</td>
<td>412.25</td>
<td>72.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwanese</td>
<td>JN</td>
<td>395</td>
<td>69.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JNR</td>
<td>388</td>
<td>68.07%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NHR</td>
<td>332</td>
<td>58.25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CGN</td>
<td>343</td>
<td>60.17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average</td>
<td>364.50</td>
<td>63.94%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A t-test procedure was further conducted to see whether the differences in the use of AWL word families between Taiwanese and international nursing journals are significant. As shown in Table 7, the results showed AWL word families are used significantly more frequently in international nursing journals (AWL families = 412.25) than in Taiwanese ones (AWL families = 364.5, \( t = 2.75, p < .05 \)).

Table 7: The t-test Results for International and Taiwanese Nursing Journal Abstracts—A Word-Family Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S. D</th>
<th>( t )</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Word-Family</td>
<td>International</td>
<td>412.25</td>
<td>14.36</td>
<td>2.75</td>
<td>.03*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Taiwanese</td>
<td>364.50</td>
<td>31.62</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. \( p < .05^* \)

4.3 Frequently used academic words in the nursing journal abstract corpus

One of the major purposes of the study was to find out the most frequently used AWL words in
the abstracts of nursing research articles. The frequencies of all word-forms of each AWL word family in NJAC were calculated. The frequency and the coverage of the AWL word families have been listed according to the frequency of their occurrence in NJAC, and the AWL word’s distribution in NJAC is presented in Table 8. Among the 570 AWL word families, only 385 word families (67.55%) occurred more than 10 times in NJAC. In our study, the most frequently used AWL word was *method*, appearing 801 times in our corpus. Other AWL word items such as *participate, data, research,* and *analyze* also occurred very frequently. Using both *frequency* and *range* as the criteria for word selection, this study identified 174 AWL word families that are used more than 50 times in the corpus and appear at least six journals across the international and Taiwanese nursing journals. 174 (30.53% of 570) words were the most frequently used word families in NJAC, with these items appearing 27,820 times, accounting for approximately four-fifths (83.21%) of the 33,432 study tokens (see Appendix A). Of the 174 word families, 157 (90.23%) appeared in all the eight nursing journals, 15 (8.62%) word families occurred in seven journals and 2 (1.15%) word families in six nursing journals.

Table 8: AWL Words Distribution in the Nursing Journal Abstract Corpus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Times of Occurrence</th>
<th>Number of Words</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Accumulative Percentage</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Accumulative Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>≥ 200</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>6.84%</td>
<td>6.84%</td>
<td>14,324</td>
<td>14,324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100~199</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
<td>16.14%</td>
<td>7,533</td>
<td>21,857</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50~99</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>14.39%</td>
<td>30.53%</td>
<td>5,963</td>
<td>27,820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40~49</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>4.04%</td>
<td>34.57%</td>
<td>1,022</td>
<td>28,842</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20~39</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>16.49%</td>
<td>51.06%</td>
<td>2,626</td>
<td>31,468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10~19</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>11.58%</td>
<td>67.55%</td>
<td>1,322</td>
<td>32,790</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5~9</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>15.26%</td>
<td>94.39%</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>33,235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1~4</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>5.61%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>33,432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>570</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 9: The Distribution of 174 Most Frequently Used AWL Word Family in Coxhead’s Sublists

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coxhead’s Sublists</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Accumulative Number</th>
<th>Accumulative Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>25.28%</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>25.28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>22.41%</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>47.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>11.49%</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>59.18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>14.37%</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>73.55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>8.05%</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>81.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>8.05%</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>89.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>93.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>96.55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.30%</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>98.85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.15%</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 9, 44 (25.28%) out of the 174 word families are the words in Coxhead’s sublist 1 such as method, data, research and so on (see Appendix A). The words in Coxhead’s sublist 2 also occur very frequently in NJAC as well (39 out of the 174 word families) such as participate, design and conclude (see Appendix A). Altogether, 83 of the 174 word families (47.69%) in NJAC derive from Coxhead’s sublist 1 and 2. 20 (11.49%) out of the 174 word families are the words in Coxhead’s sublist 3, 25 (14.37%) of the 174 word families are in Coxhead’s sublist 4 and 14 (8.05%) of the 174 word families are in Coxhead’s sublist 5. Most of the 174 AWL word families in NJAC occur in Coxhead sublists 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 (81.60%), whereas the AWL word families from sublists 6 account for 8.05% of the 174 AWL word families and those from sublists 7 to 10 make up only 10.35%. Therefore, the word families from sublists 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 (81.60%) greatly exceed those from sublists 6 to 10 (18.4%). This distribution tendency demonstrates that the components of 174 word families consist of more from sublists 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5, which is similar to the result of the distribution of the 538 AWL word families in Coxhead’s sublist as mentioned in section 4.1 and the findings from previous studies (Vongpumivitch, Huang & Chang, 2009).
5. Conclusion

While there is considerable research evidence about the coverage of academic words in research articles, there has been little investigation of academic words in nursing field. This study filled the gap by focusing on nursing field so that the findings are valuable to nursing students who are interested in pursuing higher education, to teachers of academic English, and EAP and ENP course designers and researchers. This study aimed to explore the use of Coxhead’s AWL words in the abstracts of nursing research articles, compare the different frequency of AWL vocabulary in abstracts published in international and Taiwanese nursing journals and provide a frequency-based and field-specific AWL for learners of academic English.

The present study yields a number of important findings. First, the results showed that the text coverage of AWL words accounted for 13.98% of the entire corpus, which shows that the AWL words play an important role in nursing field that is at least as important as in other fields that have been previously researched. The coverage of the AWL in nursing (13.98%) is even higher than 9.3% in the Art discipline investigated in Coxhead’s (2000) research, 10.07% in medical research found in Chen & Ge (2007) and 11.17% in applied linguistics discipline investigated in Vongpumivitch, et al (2009). Second, of all eight selected journals, AWL vocabulary was more commonly used in international nursing journal abstracts than in Taiwanese ones. Third, this study provided a frequency-based academic word list, which clearly shows what constitutes the core part of the academic vocabulary of the abstracts of nursing research articles, for nursing students. This list is short but gives excellent coverage of abstracts of nursing research articles. Such a frequency-based list more closely meets the needs of language learners because it is established directly from the target texts of possible users.

The results of this study have generated a number of important implications for EAP and ENP teachers, course designers and researchers and nursing graduate students. The frequently-
used AWL vocabulary reported in this study can serve as reference for Nursing English lexical materials. These word families are worth special attention in designing English for Nursing Purposes courses. For learners of nursing English who are interested in pursuing further study in nursing, these frequently-used AWL vocabulary can help them expand their vocabulary size in a more conscious, faster and manageable way. Second, the abstracts in international nursing journals used more academic words than those in Taiwanese journals. Nursing students are thus strongly recommended to read more international journals if they want to improve their academic reading and writing skills. Finally, teachers should encourage nursing students, especially non-native English learners, to practice using these words in their writing of abstracts. Teachers can have students memorize the new words in original sentences they read in the academic texts and explore the possible collocations and lexical bundles in the academic texts. Learning these target words as chunks can help learners use them accurately and appropriately.

This study is a pilot study on the AWL words used in the abstracts of nursing journals and more efforts should be made in exploring the use of this set of words in the nursing field. In order to establish a more useful vocabulary database for nursing students, the development of a much wider corpus covering more genres such as English nursing textbooks are recommended for future studies. Second, although the corpus that has been created for this study contains over 239,117 words, it is still relatively small compared to Coxhead’s (2000) Academic Corpus, which has 3.5 million running words. Therefore, future researchers may want to expand the size of their corpus to be as large as possible in order to increase the generalizability of their findings and to see if their results would be similar to those of the present study. Third, because the purposes of the five research article sections are different, the words used in each section to realize the communication functions and rhetorical demands might be accordingly different (Chen and Ge, 2007). The studies by Marinez et al (2009) and Chen and Ge (2007) found that
the coverage of academic words across five different sections of research articles revealed variation. A study to establish a corpus containing full texts of research articles is necessary to assist researchers in finding out the coverage of AWL word families in nursing research articles. Fourth, Hyland and Tse (2007) and Martinez, Beck, and Panza (2009) argued that each subject discipline needs its own academic word list. Hence, it is worth conducting a study to explore whether it is necessary to develop a specific academic word list for students with nursing background. Finally, both medical and nursing belong to the field of healthcare, however; the coverage of AWL in nursing field is higher than that in medical field. A further study is needed to find out whether the difference really exists between these two fields.

References


**Appendix A**

174 Most Frequently Used AWL Word Family in NJAC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Headword</th>
<th>Sublist in AWL</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Headword</th>
<th>Sublist in AWL</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Headword</th>
<th>Sublist in AWL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>method</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>theme</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>seek</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>participate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>consist</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>contribute</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>data</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>author</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>expert</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>research</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>practitioner</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>occur</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>analyze</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>structure</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>challenge</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>significant</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>theory</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>prior</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>assess</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>psychology</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>initiate</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>design</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>job</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>construct</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>factor</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>enhance</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>document</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>intervene</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>resource</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>version</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>conclude</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>affect</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>technique</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>identify</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>assist</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>error</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>professional</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>evident</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>incidence</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>medical</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>item</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>monitor</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>process</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>negate</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>protocol</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>perceive</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>require</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>adjust</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>physical</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>specific</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>phase</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>role</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>intense</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>predict</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>evaluate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>register</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>goal</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>vary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>proceed</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>assign</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>conduct</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>qualitative</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>instruct</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>implement</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>adult</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>source</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>positive</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>potential</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>emerge</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>stress</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>achieve</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>locate</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>survey</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>establish</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>random</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>promote</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>project</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>dimension</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>indicate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>obtain</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>final</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>outcome</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>implicate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>internal</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>attitude</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>previous</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>similar</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>impact</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>gender</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>topic</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>respond</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>overall</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>available</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>valid</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>administrate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>ensure</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>function</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>utilize</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>commit</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>depress</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>reveal</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>consult</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>facilitate</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>adapt</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>create</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>individual</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>demonstrate</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>interpret</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>status</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>category</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>sufficient</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>period</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>index</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>undergo</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>strategy</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>accurate</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>ethic</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>relevant</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>guideline</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>framework</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>approach</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>range</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>normal</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>concept</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>team</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>modify</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>focus</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>adequate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>orient</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>statistic</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>benefit</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>integrate</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>investigate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>select</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>recover</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>area</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>aspect</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>component</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>communicate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>institute</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>initial</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>mental</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>context</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>labor</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>define</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>prospect</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>issue</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>perspective</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>region</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>rely</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>culture</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>shift</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>major</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>objective</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>confirm</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>sex</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>aware</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>transfer</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>appropriate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>maintain</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>percent</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>environment</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>policy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>access</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>interact</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>consequent</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>involve</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>criteria</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>incorporate</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>injure</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>reside</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>comprehensive</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. 1. Head words stand for stem noun or verb forms (Coxhead, 2000). In the Appendix, the word families are listed by headwords.
2. Sublist 1 and Sublist 2 are bolded and italicized.
“All’s well that ends well?” A Generic Analysis of Applicants’ English Autobiographical Statements of Purpose for Applying to Undergraduate Programmes in an EFL Context

Wenhsien Yang

National Kaohsiung University of Hospitality and Tourism, Taiwan

Biodata

Wenhsien Yang is currently Assistant Professor, teaching at National Kaohsiung University of Hospitality and Tourism, Taiwan. His major research interests include discourse analysis, genre analysis and ESP writing.

Abstract

Recent generic analysis of statements of purpose has constructed similar schematic structures of this occluded genre across different disciplines in L1 contexts. These studies indicate a need for further inter-contextual or cross-disciplinary examinations of this genre from sensitive and qualitative perspectives of accommodating situations, contexts and purposes of writing. In this study, I first identified a generic structure of English autobiographical statements of purpose (ASP) written by EFL learners and submitted to an English undergraduate programme in an EFL context. I also analysed how the keywords were used in the texts to realise the writers’ purposes. Furthermore, a questionnaire survey and interviews with ELT teachers and university
professors were conducted to elicit their views on how they treated ASP, and to discuss why distinguishability was contextually invisible based on the notions of large cultures and small cultures. The findings reveal that rhetorical moves and focuses of ASP vary across different statuses of English use, cultures and programmes. These findings lead to implications not only for writing instruction of this genre, but also for undergraduate programmes requesting ASP from prospective students.

**Keywords:** genre analysis, keyword analysis, statements of purpose, intercultural communication, Taiwanese EFL learners

## 1. Introduction

For the past few decades, genre analysis has been popularly adopted by researchers to examine the rhetoric structures and linguistic features of texts which are used by community members to achieve specific communicative purposes in their discourse communities. Much of the research focuses on studying texts in English for Academic Purposes (EAP) such as different components in research papers or books. Perhaps the ease of access for the collection of data contributes to the wider exploration of such texts. Compared to these open academic genres, supporting genres, also known as occluded genres, such as letters or applications with very limited access to the public view, have attracted relatively less research attention. Exemplars of these kinds of text are not easily available in libraries or archives, though a number of commercial books and websites provide some guidelines for writers to compose these genres. Hence, this would usually make compositions insensitive to context or too general to be helpful (Swales & Feak, 2011).

Furthermore, a large portion of the studies on analysing EAP genres position scenario in the contexts of English as the first language (L1) or second language (ESL), targeting English native speakers (NS) as quality gatekeepers and the majority readers; the flexibility and fluidity
of genres in those contexts where the status of English is as a foreign language or even a lingua franca might be relatively underestimated. Apparently, analysis of occluded genres written by EFL learners in EFL contexts, the readers of whom are also non-native speakers of English (NNS), are not commonly seen. Thus, this paper would like to put the focus on users of one of the occluded genres in an EFL context.

As one of the occluded genres, autobiographical statements of purpose (ASP) submitted for applying to undergraduate programmes are used as an example to fill this gap. It is generally believed that for NNS with comparatively narrower English proficiency compared to L1 users, how to promote themselves and impress the intended audience (e.g. readers, admission committees, etc.) in English can be a significant challenge, especially if they are not explicitly taught about this text and have few resources to rely on. The following sections first discuss the features and types of occluded genres further, then review the previous genre research on personal promotion genres, namely, job applications, admission applications and grants applications, and finally examine these genres from inter-cultural perspectives.

1.1 Literature review

Though the purposes of promotion texts are nearly the same for both open and supporting genres, i.e. to inform, to persuade, to advertise and to promote (Bhatia, 2011), yet compared to the public/open genres with open access and broader readership, the inter-communication and the intended recipients of the occluded/supporting genres are relatively more finite and predictable due to their targeted audience and limited accessibility (Swales & Feak, 2011). Thus, they should be more context-sensitive in order to reach specific purposes of communication. Personal statements (PS, or ASP in this study) submitted with applications for job offers, graduate programme admissions, or research grants are a typical example of this genre. The purpose of
ASP/PS involves a certain amount of *marketisation* to promote and link oneself to the intended discourse communities through elaborately structured and selective rhetoric (Bekins *et al.*, 2004; Hyland, 2004).

Bhatia (1993), firstly analysing how applicants promote themselves in job application letters, identified six moves including *establishing credentials, offering incentives, enclosing documents, using pressure tactics, soliciting responses* and *ending politely*. It is the first move, comprising three sub-steps, that indicates the value of candidature in order to promote oneself, and most of the later research follows Bhatia’s framework in examining this genre in different contexts. For instance, Maasum *et al.* (2004) analysed Malaysian graduates’ letters of job application based on Bhatia’s work and found that the applicants generally lacked the writing proficiency to realise the moves Bhatia proposes, and cultural factors such as *being reluctant to overtly demand* also affected their writing structure. Similarly, Wang (2005) studied 40 Chinese job application letters in terms of schematic moves and linguistic features applied to realise the moves. He encourages ESL teachers to attend to those features while preparing learners for writing such letters. In contrast to Massum *et al.*’s finding (2004), contextual differences were not appropriated in this study, although both studies applied a single method of text analysis only. However, these studies apparently did not investigate how readers approach these promoting texts; thus, the issue of how effectively these texts achieve their purposes from the perspective of the targeted readers was not appropriately addressed.

Another genre of promoting oneself is in applications or proposals for research grants. Compared to other academic genres, they involve a higher extent of marketisation to promote an applicant’s research and him/herself, and are targeted at a finite audience. Connor and her colleagues did much research on analysing the generic structures of these texts (e.g. Connor, 1998, 1999, 2002; Connor & Mauranen, 1999; Connor & Wanger, 1999). They identified a ten-
move structure of grant proposals, which became the model for later research on the same texts. For instance, in Feng and Shi’s (2004) study, they analysed nine Canadian grant proposals and concluded three strategies the applicants used to reach the purpose, namely, setting the scene for the readers, a niche-centred tide-like structure, and mixing moves to serve promotional purposes. They claim it is these three strategies that differentiate the genre of grants applications from other academic genres. Furthermore, they especially stress the argument that applicants would deliberately mix moves in order to fit their intentions of mixing their informative and promotional purposes in the texts. However, Connor in her later studies (e.g. 2002, 2011) not only focused on the generic structure but also emphasised how contrastive rhetorical theories can shape the importance of cultures or countries which influence the texts. She states that,

```
the structural categories of Western standards are often assumed to reflect a common platform of reference. In fact, all that is usually reflected is a cultural bias that downplays the significance of other perspectives valued by different cultures. Suitable comparisons need to be established that acknowledge these different cultural perspectives (2002: 174).
```

In other words, a genre with the same purposes across various social contexts or cultures could be constructed very differently due to the differences in language and culture. Hence, it is argued that apart from confirming the established ‘universal moves’ of a genre, the identification of ‘local moves’ could better exhibit the influences of both ‘large’ and ‘small’ cultures (Holliday, 1999) exercised on constructing texts.

Regarding PS in applications for admission to postgraduate programmes, many studies have examined the structure of PS for medical-related disciplines. For instance, Bekins et al. (2004) propose five rhetoric moves in PS, i.e. hook, programme, background, self-promotion and projection; however, they also emphasise that this genre is unstable in diverse contexts.
Applicants would reshape texts with the personal traits which medical schools are looking for. Barton et al. (2004) identified four moves in PS in residency applications, i.e. *opening*, *schooling/training*, *interests and activities*, and *career goals*. Although this study did not specify a promotional move like other studies, they still argue that the rhetoric structure of PS is highly personal and writers of PS construct their identities with the community “under the exigency of reflection upon transition” (p.76). In Brown’s (2004) study, he compared the writing differences of research experience, research interests and practical experience between successful and unsuccessful PS in the discipline of clinical psychology. He concludes that a PS is a very specific form of autobiographical writing and suggests that in successful PS, applicants should not only state what they would do in the future but be versed in “the epistemology of science through self-positioning vis-à-vis important binary oppositions” (p. 258). Both Barton et al.’s (2004) and Bekins et al.’s (2004) studies emphasise that PS should reflect applicants’ formative experiences, while Brown (2004) argues that successful applicants should focus on their public identities as apprentice scientists.

Later, Ding (2007) also compared successful and unsuccessful PS submitted to medical and dental schools. Her study generated five recurrent moves for successful PS, i.e. *explaining reason*, *establishing credentials*, *discussing relevant experience*, *declaring future goals* and *depicting personality*. She examined her two corpora and concluded that successful applicants highlight their relevant experiences and professional-related credentials, while unsuccessful applicants tend to use ineffective rhetorical strategies and lack related medical or dental experience. Furthermore, she differentiated the PS of applying for admission to graduate school from letters of job application even when both share the same purpose of promotion. Ding (2007) claims that letters of job application are more informative whereas PS are more descriptive and persuasive as promoting genres, and the former are very like her unsuccessful PS as they overtly
claim abilities and qualifications but overlook using good narrative to support their claims. These three studies (Barton et al., 2004; Bekins et al., 2004; Ding, 2007) investigated applications for postgraduate medical programmes, which is obviously classed as a hard science. Yet, arguably, applications composed by soft scientists may be different, as writers in the hard and soft science areas may have various academic identities due to their diverse assumptions of epistemology and ontology, which would affect how they construct the texts of a genre.

All of the above research studied the genre in homogenous contexts, but still other investigations have explored the issue from cross-contextual or cross-disciplinary perspectives. Henry and Roseberry (2001) examined 40 letters of application for different university programmes written by NS from various L1 countries such as Australia, New Zealand, the UK, Canada and the USA. Eleven moves were generated from their corpus, which was structured similar to Bhatia's (1993) model except that the move, using pressure tactics, was not seen. They also pinpoint the importance of context in determining whether moves are obligatory or optional. Furthermore, they also identified key lexical phrases of the genre; for example, the word ‘and’ is very frequently used in binary phrases, mainly with two nouns, and verbs are used in a rather direct manner to introduce positive self. Differing from other studies, Henry and Roseberry (2001) additionally examined how linguistic features are employed to realise communicative purposes.

Besides, Samraj and Monk (2008) also found variations in the structure across different disciplines. They compared the moves and steps of PS written in three disciplines, i.e. linguistics, business administration and electronic engineering, finding that when writing PS the applicants in these three disciplines followed the same five-move rhetorical structure, i.e. introduction, background, reasons for applying, extra-curricular activities and conclusion, but the component steps of each move were found to differ across disciplines. For example, in the background move,
the engineering applicants seek to develop themselves as field researchers, the MBA applicants identify a gap in knowledge which motivated their future study, while the linguistics applicants focus more on stating their previous education and work experience and their motivation to study in a master’s programme. The study signifies the diversities of structure construction across disciplinary variations within one genre. In addition, they also remarked upon the existence of diversities between NS and NNS, and among different geographical contexts in terms of promoting oneself.

Sii (2004) compared PS written by two different ethnic groups, i.e. British and Chinese, submitted for application to a master’s programme at a British university. She also found cross-cultural variations in constructing the genre. For instance, in the moves of explaining reasons and indicating and detailing values of the candidature, British applicants tended to evaluate their candidature in detail while Chinese writers preferred focusing on explaining the reasons; in addition, Chinese applicants (mainly from China), comparatively, depended much more than their counterparts on the strategies of self-glorification, self-degradation and adversary-glorification to present their positive self. Based on her analysis, Sii suggested that these Chinese applicants should be explicitly taught the writing processes, procedures and strategies of English PS. Yet, whether her conclusion about the strategies used by Chinese writers can be applied to other Chinese-speaking contexts such as Taiwan is still uncertain and thus a potential area of research.

The above cited studies clearly indicate that a genre can be flexible and fluid or even unstable across contexts or cultures. Analysing the genre of promoting self in PS has expanded from examining a single case to comparing diversities among contexts, namely, from one discipline to multiple disciplines, from one country to several countries, or from a homogenous culture to diverse cultures. This tendency reflects Halliday’s (1999) and Atkinson’s (2004)
notions of defining ‘culture’ in researching intercultural rhetoric. According to Holliday’s model of culture (1999), cultures can be divided into ‘big cultures’ and ‘small cultures’; the former refers to ethnic, national or international group features which tend to be normative and prescriptive, while the latter focuses on a dynamic process related to cohesive behaviours within social groupings. These two categories should be inclusive, rather than exclusive. Nations, disciplines, students, teachers or English use also have their distinctive cultures which reveal variations in their speech and writing acts, but analysing genres should recognise big cultures and value small cultures, acknowledge their respective variations and focus on give-and-take in intercultural interactions (Connor, 2011). In sum, new text analysis on genres is currently emphasising the sensitivity to and appropriateness of process, contexts and situations, and texts should be understood from textual, contextual and social perspectives (Bhatia, 2011; Connor, 2011; Fairclough, 1992; Gee, 2005; Hyland, 2009).

1.2 Research questions
Drawing from the above discussion, there is an apparent gap in the research in the area of analysing PS in ‘one big culture embedded with several small cultures’, that is, English PS written by EFL writers, read mostly by EFL readers including both high school and university teachers, and used for applying to undergraduate programmes in an EFL context. Hence, as one of the few exploratory studies, the purpose of this research is to examine how an occluded genre, PS/ASP, which has always been used and investigated for postgraduate programmes in L1 or ESL contexts, is composed by EFL learners for applying to undergraduate programmes in an EFL context. Furthermore, the research also hopes to probe potential readers’ opinions about EFL learners’ ASP. These readers are EFL teachers of English who help proofread ASP in senior high schools, and professional insiders in admission committees who actually read ASP and
make final decisions based on them. To be specific, the research focuses on the following questions:

1. What are the moves of ASP written by Taiwanese EFL learners for applying to undergraduate programmes in Taiwan? Are there any similarities to or differences from the structures established in other contexts?
2. What are the linguistic features employed in ASP to achieve the communicative purposes of promoting self, in terms of the top frequently-used words, the keywords, and the binary conjunctions? Are there any similarities to or differences from the features identified in other contexts?
3. What do the recipients, namely, high school EFL teachers and university reviewing committee members, who have different cultural backgrounds, expect from and focus on when reading EFL learners’ ASP?

2. Background to the study

The context this study examined is Taiwan, where English is taught as a foreign language (EFL). Currently, there are 176 institutes of higher education nationwide, including two major categories i.e. traditional research-based universities and practice-based polytechnic universities. Both of them offer undergraduate programmes for prospective students. Currently, two main tracks for entering a university exist in Taiwan: one is students applying by submitting the required documents and the other is students being assigned a place according to their grades in the official joint entrance examinations. English learning and teaching are highly promoted by the educational authorities concerned in Taiwan in order to achieve ‘globalisation’. English is not only an obligatory subject from primary education to higher education, but is also one of the
most popular undergraduate programmes for Taiwanese high school students. Thus, 126 universities have English-related (e.g. ELT, linguistics, literature or translation) departments\(^2\), and they also offer admission to prospective students through the application track (Ministry of Education, 2011). In addition, to facilitate globalisation, integrate professors’ expertise from all disciplines, and attract international students, the Ministry of Education (MOE) also encourages the establishment of English-based programmes at the tertiary level, termed international programmes, where English is the only medium for conducting all courses. At present, there are 17 undergraduate programmes and 229 postgraduate programmes of this kind (HEEACT, 2011). Similarly, these English-based international programmes also allow prospective students admission through individual applications.

When prospective students hand in their applications to any of the above departments or programmes, an autobiographical statement of purpose (ASP) is always one of the requested documents and is supposed to be written in English, though not all of the programmes explicitly require ASP to be written in English only. Together with other required materials, ASP serve as a quality gatekeeper for university committees to select their potential students. Thus, for the applicants of the above programmes, how to write an appealing ASP is crucial; however, unfortunately, the writing of ASP is hardly ever taught in the classroom as this genre is used for very specific purposes only and is also unlikely to be assessed in the English writing tests of the entrance examinations. Hence, English ASP from the above programmes\(^3\) can be fairly invaluable data for genre analysts to study this occluded genre used in a particular situation.

\(^2\) Both ‘departments’ and ‘programmes’ refer to academic units which provide bachelor degree programmes and these two words may be used interchangeably in this paper.

\(^3\) Other than these two English-related programmes, very few other programmes such as those offered by medical departments may also request an English ASP from applicants, but these cases are exceptional.
3. Texts, informants and methods

In order to reach “a balance between quantitative rigor and sensitivity to situations, contexts and purposes of writing” (Connor, 2011: 51), and to research this occluded genre written by EFL learners and used in an EFL environment from an in-depth contextual perspective, this study adopted multi-modals to analyse the collected texts. These included Hyland’s theories of analysing academic writing from an integrated conduction (2004, 2009), and theories and techniques from genre analysis of searching for a generic structure (Bhatia, 1997; Swales, 1990) and corpus analysis of comparing users’ language development across different corpora (Johansson, 1998).

Due to the great unlikelihood of obtaining ASP from other universities, the researcher could only use the data from his own teaching programme, the Department of Applied English, in a national polytechnic university in southern Taiwan. Owing to the fact that the programme had a history of only three years when the research was conducted (in 2011), only forty-two ASP written by applicants studying at various secondary schools nationwide were collected. Though the corpus size may not be large enough, it should still be representative, as all the other similar programmes in Taiwan follow a similar procedure of screening and accepting applicants’ ASP. Then, the texts were analysed from two different perspectives. In order to generate a rhetoric structure of the ASP, a multi-level hand-tagged move analysis was executed. This included reliance on the established structures from the previous research, the discourse markers and section boundaries used in the present corpus, and the follow-up interviews with the focus groups (Connor & Mauranen, 1999; Upton & Connor, 2001). The occurrences of moves/steps of the present corpus were manually categorised by the researcher; however, one pre-trained research assistant helped code 10% of the corpus, and the inter-coder reliability (Agreed steps/Total steps) between the researcher and the assistant reached 85.3%. Furthermore, with the
help of the concordance software, WordSmith (Scott, 2006), the study was able to identify the most frequently-used lexis, keywords and the binary conjunction ‘and’ in the ASP. The generation of keywords and the examination of their collocations in texts with reference to BNC and BAWE\(^4\) helped to analyse how closely the lexis was related to the move categories, and assisted in the classification of the ASP text into distinct moves (Ding, 2007).

In addition, to obtain different readers’ responses to these texts, both quantitative and qualitative methods were applied after the lexical comparisons (Connor, 2011). First, a self-designed questionnaire survey (see Appendix A) regarding how senior high school EFL teachers perceive EFL learners’ problems of writing ASP and how they are involved in the procedures of revising learners’ ASP was conducted. Totally, 48 surveys were returned, of which 46 of the respondents were experienced in helping with EFL learners’ ASP. Before distribution, the questionnaire was proofread and piloted by an EFL teacher in a high school with a PhD degree to ensure its readability and quality for other teachers. Thirty-eight of the 48 respondents were females. The teachers come from different high schools (including senior, vocational and comprehensive schools) in southern Taiwan, and their average teaching experience was over 10 years. Each of them had obtained at least a master’s degree, while 3 of them had doctoral degrees. Furthermore, all of the respondents were graders in a nationwide English writing and speaking proficiency test; therefore, these informants can be considered as being highly experienced in teaching and evaluating English writing. The data were treated with the help of Office Excel 2003 to generate the frequency, the mean (M) and the standard deviation (SD).

Secondly, the interviews with readers of the genre texts, as recommended by Hyland

---

\(^4\) The British Academic Written English (BAWE) corpus was developed at the Universities of Warwick, Reading and Oxford Brookes, under the directorship of Hilary Nesi and Sheena Gardner (formerly of the Centre for Applied Linguistics [previously called CELTE], Warwick), Paul Thompson (Department of Applied Linguistics, Reading) and Paul Wickens (Westminster Institute of Education, Oxford Brookes), with funding from the ESRC.
Asian ESP Journal. Volume 9 Issue 3

(2004), were formed. The decision to conduct the interviews was made because it was found that the structure and content of the applicants’ ASP were remarkably different from the high school EFL teachers’ perceptions of which elements made a sound ASP. Teachers’ expectations supposedly would affect how they instructed the composition of ASP if they had to. The aim of the interviews was therefore to explore this difference in more depth. The interviewees available included two EFL high school teachers and four university professors, all of whom had profound experience as members of admission committees screening prospective students’ applications. Three of them were the English department chairs from three different universities, and all but one were local non-native English speakers, with the exception being a native speaker of English from America. Each teacher was interviewed individually and each interview lasted for approximately half an hour. This composition of the interviewees with various backgrounds can facilitate an understanding of the expectations and purposes of writing ASP across different stakeholders and cultures, including big cultures like nations or ethnicities, and small cultures such as English writing classrooms, student cultures, teacher cultures, or school cultures (Holliday, 1999; Samraj & Monk, 2008). The interview questions mainly focused on how they approach ASP, what they value in students’ ASP as reviewers or helpers, and what makes a successful ASP. The concepts and categories generated from the interview transcripts were coded and interrelated with the help of the software, Weft QDA5, following the steps suggested by the grounded theory approach (Strauss, 1987). Both quantitative and qualitative data were used not only to facilitate the development of the moves and steps but also to support the results found in the present corpus.

5 It is a free tool to assist in the analysis of textual data such as interview transcripts, written texts and field notes.
Downloadable from http://www.pressure.to/qda/
4. Results and discussion

4.1 The establishment of a generic structure of undergraduate ASP in an EFL context

Five recurrent moves together with their sub-steps were identified in the study. The five moves are *Family background, Educational background, Self-promotion, Reasons for applying* and *Timeline for future plans*. Most of the ASP followed this generic structure, though there were a few exceptions. Below is the proposed generic structure with short definitions of the moves and steps together with the examples of each move based on the present corpus.

Table 1: Moves and steps of autobiographical statements of purpose and their definitions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Move/Step</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Family background</strong></td>
<td>The applicant introduces family, including self name, birth place and DOB etc., other members’ ages, professions etc., and family life, education, beliefs, or mottoes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Introducing self</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Introducing other members</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Stating family values</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Education background</strong></td>
<td>The applicant describes schooling, such as the schools where s/he studied and studies, the school life s/he has gone through, the important achievements s/he has obtained, and the non-disciplinary activities s/he has joined.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Listing schools chronologically</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Describing procedures of studies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Highlighting important gains</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Joining extra-curricular activities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Self promotion</strong></td>
<td>The applicant promotes him/herself by portraying positive personal qualities, making his/her likes relevant to the application, and showing awarded prizes or certificates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Depicting positive traits</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Relating to interests and hobbies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Presenting recognised merits</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Reasons for applying</strong></td>
<td>The applicant states reasons for applying, such as attending a well-known programme or institute, presupposing achievements from joining the programme, and making a promise if admitted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Praising the institute</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Expressing expected gains</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Emphasising determination</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Timeline for future plans</strong></td>
<td>The applicant pictures his/her plans after admission or graduation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A shortened excerpted, non-recursive structure can be seen as follows.

M 1.1  My name is X, born in a small town near Taichung county.
M 1.2  There are five persons in my family. My parents run a Chinese restaurant and my father is a good cook. Mother is broad-minded and outspoken.
M 1.3  Both of them educate us to be optimistic so we always look on the bright side of everything.
M 2.1  I studied in A elementary school and had been chosen as a class leader and model student. Then, I entered B Junior high school and had been chosen as different kinds of leaders, such as, a class leader, an assistant class leader, a study monitor, a discipline leader and a class treasurer.
M 2.2  During my junior high school life, I learned English grammar at a higher level and increased my vocabulary; hence I had a deeper understanding of English.
M 2.3  And, I competed in the English speech contest when I was in the second grade. After practicing again and again, I got the third prize.
M 2.4  Besides, I also joined The National Small Thesis Business Competition. Although my members and I encountered some trouble in the process, we still faced it without hesitation. Finally, we got the honour of the third place.
M 3.1  In my parents’ opinion, I have my own views and critical thinking ability and am responsible for myself. Consequently, when I confront any difficulty, I never give up easily and try my best to overcome it.
M 3.2  During my leisure time, I usually watch movies, play the guitar and hang out with my friends in my free time. I also read some English magazines to improve my English skills.
M 3.3  Due to my efforts, I obtained the certificate of GEPT at the elementary level and Levels 2, 3 and 4 of the Test of English Ability Association.
M 4.1  As is known, the Department of Applied English at National K University of Hospitality and Tourism differs from others in its special curriculum, professional faculty and advanced equipment.
M 4.2  Since I was a second-grader of senior high school, I have dreamed of working in a hotel in the future, so that I can make friends with people from different places. Not only can I have links with the world, but I can also broaden my international view. When meeting foreign customers, I can also make use of my specialty in my work.
M 4.3  If I am honoured to enter your school, I will keep my earnest learning attitudes and advance my professional abilities. I believe that in the future I will become proficient and your school will be proud of me.
M 5.  I hope I can learn more service skills during the university years, acquiring language skills and knowledge of hospitality and tourism. After graduation I wish that I can enter an international hotel, and put my theory into practice.
Table 2 exhibits the relative frequency and frequencies of moves and steps per text. As can be seen, in both the high school teachers and the students’ perceptions, the five moves are apparently obligatory as they have at least one occurrence per text; however, steps 2.1, 3.3 and 4.1 are seemingly considered to be optional. Furthermore, it can be found that the writers regarded describing their positive traits, describing their studies in school, relating their interests or hobbies to the programme and expressing expected gains as rather important, as these steps were employed two or more times on average per text. Apparently, their preferred highlights are different from the PS written by postgraduates in terms of how to distinguish self, build credentials, and catch the readers’ attention.

Table 2: Frequency and relative frequency of moves/steps per text of the present corpus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Move/Steps</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Relative frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Family background</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Introducing self</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>1.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Introducing other members</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>1.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Stating family values</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Education background</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Listing schools chronologically</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Describing procedures of studies</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>2.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Highlighting important gains</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>1.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Joining extra-curricular activities</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Self promotion</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Depicting positive traits</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>2.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Relating to interests and hobbies</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>1.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Presenting recognised merits</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>0.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Reasons of applying</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Praising the institute</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Expressing expected gains</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>1.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Emphasising determination</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Timeline for future plans</strong></td>
<td>42</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total steps/ Average steps in one text</strong></td>
<td>850/ 20.23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2 Word frequency and key words

While the moves/steps were identified and counted manually, the top frequently-used words and keywords were analysed with the help of the concordance software, WordSmith (2006). Concordance was used to run the frequency word counts and the key words of the present corpus compared to the other two corpora, BNC and BAWE. The top five high frequency words are *I* (1272 frequencies, or 30.3 per text on average), *my* (728/17.3), *the* (706/16.8), *and* (679/16.2) and *to* (672/16) while the top five key words are *I, my, English, school* and *learn*, and *I, my, English, school* and *me*, in BNC and BAWE, respectively. The highly-ranking first personal pronouns including *I, my* and *me*, firstly, reflect one of the unique linguistic features in this particular genre, which requires the authors to explicitly display their identities and to claim the ownership of the statements made in the text. Furthermore, the words preceding and following the key word *my* also emphasise the statements the authors would like to highlight and which differentiate them from other applicants. Table 3 lists the high frequency words occurring after *my*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Mother</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>family</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>classmates</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>parents</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>Dream</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>father</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>Future</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>name</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>Friends</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>best</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>favourite</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This tendency represents the hierarchy of priorities which they regard as important when writing ASP, namely, (1) stating their experiences of using English (e.g. *I have an abundance of opportunities to learn and practice English*), (2) discussing their family values or pride (e.g. *My*
family always teach me in a democratic method), (3) making a promise to show determination (e.g. I will do my best to accomplish my task), (4) interacting socially with peers (e.g. I will play volleyball with my classmates to relieve my pressure), (5) picturing the future or plans to reveal personal responsibility (e.g. In order to fulfil my dream, I have to strengthen my other foreign language abilities) and (6) mentioning personal interests or hobbies (e.g. Watching movies and listening to music are my favourite hobbies). In addition, the authors are apt to use the strategy of ‘making a promise or plan’ to convince the reviewing committees of how good they will be in the future rather than overtly talking about how good their English is now. Hence, phrases such as improve my English, do my best to study English or enhance my language skills are commonly seen in the texts. Differing from PS for postgraduate programmes where previous related experience and knowledge are deemed as essential (Barton et al., 2004; Bekins et al., 2004), prospective undergraduate applicants rely more on discussing the present and the future, which apparently makes informing overwhelm promoting.

In Ding’s (2007) and Henry and Roseberry’s (2001) studies of PS, they pinpoint the significance of the word and (679 times or 16.2 per text on average), which ranks fourth in the word list and ranks 228th in the keyword list (referred to BNC) but is not a keyword when compared to BAWE. According to their corpora (Ding, 2007; Henry & Roseberry, 2001), and is used in binary phrases, most frequently with two nouns, to serve as instances to manifest the applicants’ qualifications, relevant experience and desire to pursue a career related to the programme being applied to. Based on her two corpora, Ding concludes that successful applicants tend to use more binary phrases related to the programme. However, the situation is slightly different in the present corpus. Although binary noun phrases are still commonly seen across all of the texts, as in the previous studies, binary independent clauses also appear very frequently in the corpus and are mainly about narrating the applicants’ life experiences, personal
story and qualities (e.g. I entered the English drama club in school and I learned many things from this club, or After this activity, I cherish everything I have, and I never complain all the time), though several examples of promoting personal triumph can also be found in the texts (e.g. Besides, I took part in the speech contest in our school, and I got the championship). Hence, apparently the prospective undergraduate applicants have slightly different focuses and linguistic choices when composing this genre. The reasons could stem from their insufficiency of outstanding experience related to the programme, which would make the writers adopt the avoidance strategy of shifting focuses from distinguishing self to narrating self. This tendency of narrative writing apparently differentiates the genre of ASP written by prospective undergraduates from other professional genres which are relatively expository, argumentative and informational. Anecdotal evidence and individual stories may indeed carry little academic weight in professional genres (Rowley-Jolivet & Campagna, 2011) and they may not help much on promoting self in ASP. The second explanation could be that their command of the English language is obviously not nearly as proficient as that of postgraduate applicants, and furthermore, they are seldom or never taught how to write this genre. These reasons may hinder the applicants from using the language skilfully and promoting themselves purposefully.

4.3 Results of the questionnaire survey

Except for two respondents who had no experience of helping students with their ASP and thus did not answer the questions in sections B and C of the questionnaire but did answer the questions in section D, the other 46 high school teachers completed all the question items. Table 4 exhibits the results of sections B and C. It can be found that the teachers believed that student writers made the fewest mistakes on presenting the trustworthy content and identifying the purposes of writing an ASP, and the readers. Nevertheless, it is accuracy, strategy and style that
were regarded as the three most common problems these writers would confront. On the other hand, except for the writing style of the ASP, all of the remaining items such as the purposes of writing, the organisation, language accuracy or the strategies employed in composing ASP reached over 4.0 in their mean scores, which implies that the respondents perceived nearly all the items to be crucially important and thus they would focus much on these areas when giving comments. However, without formal and explicit instruction on how to write a persuasive ASP in the classroom, it is supposed that these EFL student writers would inevitably confront unfamiliarity, uncertainty and even anxiety when composing an English ASP, and this would usually lead to the situation that they simply follow the provided models. Thus, most of their ASP would be similar, without clear distinguishability.

Table 4: Mean scores and SD of each question item in the questionnaire (N=46), M (SD)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sec. B: Frequencies of students’ making errors (^1) (SD)</th>
<th>Sec. C: Scales of teachers’ focuses on commenting (^2) (SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Audience</td>
<td>2.70 (1.2)</td>
<td>4.28 (0.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>2.72 (1.2)</td>
<td>4.74 (0.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisation</td>
<td>3.57 (0.9)</td>
<td>4.65 (0.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flow</td>
<td>3.57 (0.9)</td>
<td>4.57 (0.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Style</td>
<td>3.65 (0.9)</td>
<td>3.98 (0.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation</td>
<td>3.33 (0.8)</td>
<td>4.17 (0.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustworthiness</td>
<td>2.61 (1.0)</td>
<td>4.28 (0.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuracy</td>
<td>3.93 (0.9)</td>
<td>4.61 (0.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategy</td>
<td>3.72 (0.7)</td>
<td>4.09 (0.7)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\) Five-point Likert scale ranging from 5 (always making errors) to 1 (rarely making errors)

\(^2\) Five-point Likert scale ranging from 5 (emphasised very much) to 1 (nearly not emphasised)

Based on what most writers would include in their ASP, all the respondents were also required to rank the importance or essentiality of each step. The results are shown in Table 5. The respondents believed that writers picturing a future, describing personal traits, showing
determination of application, stating the procedure of previous and current learning and presenting awarded recognitions are fairly important in ASP. Nevertheless, this ranking is slightly different from what the learners actually wrote in their ASP. As shown in Table 1, the students focused more frequently on addressing their personal qualities, their study history, interests and hobbies, expressed gains and self introduction. Both the EFL teachers and learners agreed upon the priority of describing personal traits and the process of current and previous studies in ASP. Two of the top 5 priorities in both groups, namely steps 3.1 and 3.2 in the students’ choices, and steps 3.1 and 3.3 in the teachers’ preferences, are in the promotion move, which also clearly evidences that ASP is a promotion-based text as perceived by both EFL teachers and learners. Yet, while the teachers believed that presenting recognised merits was essentially significant, not all the students wrote this step. Besides, introducing family members is apparently an obligatory step in ASP according to the students, but the teachers regarded this step as the least essential, making it the only step with a mean score of below 3.0.

The possible reasons which can explain this divergence could be that firstly, EFL teachers adopt the role of proofreaders rather than instructors or facilitators when students write their ASP. On one hand, teachers would respect what students choose to include and thus make comments mainly on grammatical accuracy; on the other hand, both parties might assume ‘better too much rather than too little’, which makes writers include as many steps as possible and teachers keep the content as intact as possible. This attitude reflects the truth that neither of the two parties can exactly anticipate what the admission committee would expect to read in applicants’ ASP, and accordingly writers can only rely on following some models or established conventions, and teachers just provide comments on grammar. Hence, teachers’ initiative and explicit instruction in this genre is seemingly indispensable in the writing classroom.
Table 5: Mean scores and SD of high school teachers’ perceptions of the importance of each step in student’s ASP\(^1\) (N=48), M/ SD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Future plans</td>
<td>4.77</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Personal traits</td>
<td>4.66</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Determination</td>
<td>4.60</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Schooling</td>
<td>4.58</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Recognition</td>
<td>4.53</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Self introduction</td>
<td>4.38</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Activities</td>
<td>4.36</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Expected gains</td>
<td>4.26</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Academic merits</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Interests</td>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Family education</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Study schools</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Univ. fame</td>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Family members</td>
<td>2.83</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\)Five-point Likert scale ranging from 5(very important) to 1(least important)

4.4 Qualitative results of the interviews

To elicit different readers’ expectations of reading applicants’ ASP, two EFL teachers from high schools and four university professors were interviewed for the present research, and the results are discussed in the following two sections. …

4.4.1 Interviews with university professors

The results of the interviews with the four university professors can be categorised into the following three headings.

1. Preferred parts of ASP: This category refers to the obligatory components all professors mentioned and agreed on in the applicants’ ASP. It includes presenting prospective students’ recognised merits and their personal qualities well. All professors stated that they would be much impressed by official certificates/awards/honours, especially language proficiency certificates, since they represent that the student’s proficiency is officially approved. As one male professor said,

“\textit{We don’t have much time to read ASP word by word, so if the applicant can mention what official certificates, especially about language proficiency, s/he has obtained, then this can help us make a quick judgement.}”
Yet, all the professors are suspicious to some extent of what the applicants write in their ASP, and thus they believe the fairer way for them to make a decision is to focus on the parts stating their merits for which evidence is provided. As one NS professor said,

“If they (the applicants) don’t photocopy [proof of] what they are saying, I will not trust too much what they say.”

This lack of trust results from the fact that most applicants simply follow established models or conventions to write their ASP and thus these texts would all look very similar.

2. Dis-preferred parts of ASP content: All the interviewees expressed the opinion that introducing the applicant’s family background is unnecessary in ASP; in other words, none of the steps in move 1 are obligatory, but they nonetheless receive high attention from the writers. As one of the interviewees said,

“I don’t really care too much about their family background. We should not let their background affect our decisions, should we? Actually, I’m not interested in knowing anything about his/her family. This is not the purpose of why s/he is applying to our programme.”

3. Divided views: Except for the moves/steps in categories 1 and 2, all the other moves/steps are classified under this heading. The professors had divided attitudes towards these items. For instance, one professor preferred ASP written in a formal style while the rest welcomed an informal or personal style. In addition, one professor would focus on reading the
applicants’ previous and current education, as this would indicate how good the applicant would be, but the others did not express this same preference. Another example is that in terms of describing personal traits, female professors tended to be impressed by ‘well-behaved’ (or quiet) applicants but male professors would like applicants to be more outgoing and active. One female professor said,

“I personally like students to be well-disciplined in their behaviour; I don’t like students who are too outgoing. They should be fond of reading literature, rather than joining too many extra-curricular activities.”

Another female professor also added,

“I would like to know how they solve the problems when facing challenges or confronting difficulties in life. These skills are crucial in studying at college. So, I believe personal qualities play an important role when I am screening applicants.”

Yet, a male NS professor commented that,

“English majors should be able to interact with others so they should be outgoing and willing to socialise and join activities. Students who take part in many extra-curricular activities tend to be the people who are bettering the hospitality jobs like association activities or organisations.”

These divided views suggest that writers may need to address two different audiences since actual readers have differentiated focuses, except for the step of presenting recognised
merits. This might also lead to the situation that writers choose to include as many points as possible as they cannot anticipate what committee members are interested in. In other words, they cannot take any risks of missing any steps which are assumed to impress the committee. In the researched context, personal statements for applying to undergraduate programmes are mixed with narrative autobiographies, which make the texts multi-purposeful and hybrid, and different from the PS written in various contexts. This divergence or fluidity also reflects that varied cultures like students or teachers cultures would very likely affect how the reception of one genre may vary with orientations/cultures of its readers (Bhatia, 1995, 1997).

4.4.2 Interviews with high school EFL teachers

Before submitting ASP, students always seek assistance from their English teachers; therefore, two high school teachers were also interviewed to realise how they help students with their ASP. Their responses can be discussed from two main perspectives.

1. Teacher’s roles: First of all, both interviewees stated that there is no formal instruction in how to write an ASP in high school, and vocational high school students do not even have any English writing classes in school. Teachers simply follow the curriculum and teach the content in the textbooks. How to write an ASP is not a focus in those textbooks and thus teachers seldom instruct this genre explicitly. Usually, they serve as consultants or proofreaders to check the accuracy of the English after the students have completed their texts by following established exemplars. Therefore, analysing the genre as a pre-writing task is rare in EFL classrooms. As one interviewee said,

“It is students who would like to apply to undergraduate programmes. They should write their
ASP by themselves as they are the only ones who know what they are going to study and why they are interested in the programmes. But I can check the grammar for them. It should be correct since most of them want to study in English programmes.”

In other words, the role of EFL teachers would be as passive consultants or proofreaders rather than as active initiators or instructors in helping students with their ASP.

2. Supposed focuses in ASP: Though the real situation is that both interviewees simply provided some good samples for their students to modify, they do in fact have opinions about what ASP should include if they had to instruct how to write this particular genre. Both of them agreed that ASP should be written in a very formal style, and that applicants’ family background seems redundant and irrelevant to their study purpose. They also argued that the highlights should be distinguishing self from others or promoting self, for instance, their achievements, experiences, motivation, and personality. Interestingly, these aspects are virtually identical with what the professors expected to read, as discussed in section 4.3; nevertheless, the interviewees choose to keep silent while reading their students’ texts. The reason still lies in the lack of sufficient time and explicit instruction in this genre in EFL classrooms. One teacher expressed that,

“Of course, I would love to or would have to teach students how to write ASP if the curriculum included it. But, unfortunately, we teachers always have great pressure to keep up with the official course syllabus. The teaching schedule is always so tight in the final academic year that we have no spare energy or time to teach beyond what a textbook does not contain or the joint exam does not test.”
Presumably, contextual differences in the status of how English is used and taught can determine what and how teachers should instruct in the classroom. In a number of EFL contexts such as the present one, English is mainly used for testing, which indirectly affects how a genre is approached and then constructed by instructors and writers, respectively.

5. Implications and conclusion

5.1 Pedagogical implications for EFL writing classrooms

As discussed in section 4.4, high school English teachers in fact spend no or very little time on instructing this genre to their students in the classroom, which makes most ASP similar and fail to meet readers’ expectations. Thus, it is firstly advised that communication should be bridged between writers and readers in order to establish the purposes of the texts. University professors can be invited to high schools to address what they expect to read as a committee member when screening many ASP in a short time. This way helps both high school students and teachers to identify the real purpose and contents? ASP should focus on.

Secondly, high school teachers are encouraged to spend time training students how to conduct small-scale genre studies in EFL writing classrooms, as asserted by some genre researchers (Johns, 1993; Paltridge, 2001; Swales, 1990). They have claimed that teachers should train student writers to become ethnographers. Writers should investigate the texts they are going to write by considering the following macro-level issues: the social and cultural context of a genre, i.e. its setting, the purpose and the content of the genre, the author’s role, the intended audience, the relationships between writers and audience, audience’s expectations, shared understandings, and assumed background knowledge. Furthermore, they should also study the texts from a micro-level, which includes its tone, typical discourse-level, grammatical features,
and lexical choices (Paltridge, 2001). The answers to the above questions can be collected by conducting interviews, observations or sample analysis and this type of coaching can be applied to all the other genre texts. In other words, the students should be trained to discover what their writing is for and about (Johns, 1997), and then they can cope with other genre writing in the future since they have been trained to self-learn the genre and equipped with the skills of analysing a text.

5.2 Conclusion and suggestions for further studies

This study examined and described the generic structure and linguistic features of 42 ASPs written by EFL learners submitted to an undergraduate English programme in an EFL context. Besides, a questionnaire survey was conducted to investigate high school English teachers’ perceptions of their students’ ASP together with the interviews with the possible readers of ASP, namely, high school English teachers and university professors. Five functional moves as well as their recurrent sub-steps were identified: Family background, Education background, Self-promotion, Reasons for applying, and Timeline for future plans. In addition, the study found that the applicants tended to include as much narration of personal life as possible in this promotional genre, which made the statements of purpose look like a hybrid of an autobiography in the researched context. Moreover, gaps also existed between what the writers wrote and what the readers expected to read. The main cause lies in the situation that the EFL writers were not explicitly instructed in how to write this genre in the classroom and thus they simply relied on a number of established exemplars which they modified to create their own text.

As argued by many rhetoric researchers (Bhatia, 2011; Connor, 2011; Fairclough, 1992; Gee, 2005; Hyland, 2009), texts should be understood from textual, contextual and social perspectives. The structure of a genre may have its variations across contexts, which would make
a universal structure of one genre less and less likely. For instance, in the present study, the results confirm that promotional steps such as presenting merits or describing experiences (Barton, et al., 2004; Bekins, et al., 2004) are crucial, but disagree with Sii’s (2004) finding that Chinese writers would self-degrade in their PS. Moreover, a narrative style of the texts found in the present study is similar to what Ding (2007) defines as successful PS in her study, but on the contrary this writing style also makes the texts less academic and professional (Rowley-Jolivet & Campagna, 2011). These apparent similarities or conflicts clearly evidence that a text should be examined with regard to the cultures it is exposed to. The construction of statements of purpose in the current context is greatly influenced by many cultural factors, namely, students’ over-reliance on established conventions, high school teachers’ insistence on following the official curriculum and reluctance to teach the genre, the divided expectations of committee members, lack of communication between prospective applicants and potential readers, and even the status of English use and writers’ English proficiency. Indeed, the interplay of these big and small cultures contributes to the peculiar generic structure of PS in the context studied. Hence, the fact that all’s well in the beginning does not necessarily mean that it will end well. This study verifies that a genre should be studied and appropriated by taking different cultural factors into consideration.

Since this study may be one of a very few pilot studies examining generic structure, linguistic features, and readers’ opinions of ASP written by prospective undergraduates in an EFL context, there are unavoidable limitations in the design of this research project. First, the size of the corpus and the discipline of the ASP are limited in this study. Therefore, more ASP from other disciplines should be added to increase the generalisability of the results. Furthermore, cross-contextual or cross-disciplinary comparisons of this genre, such as examining ASP written in L1 and other ESL/EFL contexts or from other programmes such as those offered by medical or
law schools should be conducted too. Second, to better understand why they choose certain forms and lexis and how they perceive themselves as writers of ASP, continued investigations such as ethnographic methods or interviews with authors need to be integrated into projects that concentrate on corpus analysis.

References


### Appendix A:

A Survey of High School Teachers’ Opinions of Autobiographical Statement of Purpose Written by EFL Students for Applying to Undergraduate Programmes

This questionnaire aims to investigate your opinions of students’ autobiographical statements of purpose (ASP) for applying to undergraduate programmes. Please put an X in the appropriate box.

#### A. Background Info.

| 1. Gender | □ F | □ M |
| 2. Teaching years | □ 1-6 yrs | □ 7-14 yrs | □ over 15 yrs |
| 3. School category | □ senior | □ vocational | □ comprehensive |
| 4. Have you ever helped on students’ ASP? | □ Yes (Please continue from Part B) | □ No (Please go to Part D.) |
| 5. Students’ applying programmes | □ English-related | □ non-English-related |

#### B. To what extent do your students make errors in the following sections in their ASP?

(5: always making errors ≤-----------------------------------------------1: rarely making errors)

| 1. Not knowing who the audience will be | □ 5 | □ 4 | □ 3 | □ 2 | □ 1 |
| 2. Not knowing the purposes of ASP | □ 5 | □ 4 | □ 3 | □ 2 | □ 1 |
| 3. Lack of organisation in the content | □ 5 | □ 4 | □ 3 | □ 2 | □ 1 |
| 4. Lack of flow in coherence | □ 5 | □ 4 | □ 3 | □ 2 | □ 1 |
| 5. Inappropriate writing style | □ 5 | □ 4 | □ 3 | □ 2 | □ 1 |
| 6. Unconventional presentation format | □ 5 | □ 4 | □ 3 | □ 2 | □ 1 |
7. Low trustworthiness of information □ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1
8. Inaccurate grammar usage □ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1
9. Not using writing strategies □ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1

C. To what extent do you emphasise the following sections when commenting on students’ ASP? (5: strongly emphasised ←-----------------------------------------------→ 1: rarely emphasised)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Emphasis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The audience of ASP</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The purposes of ASP</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The organisation of content</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The flow/coherence</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The style of writing</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The format of presentation</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The trustworthiness of the content</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The correct usage of grammar</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. The application of writing strategies</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Continued from P. 1

D. To what extent do you believe the following sections are important in students’ ASP? (5: highly important ←-----------------------------------------------→ 1: not important)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Importance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Self introduction</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Family members</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Family education</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Schools attended</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Learning procedures</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Academic merits</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Extra-curriculum activities</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Personal traits</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Interests or hobbies</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Officially-recognised awards</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. University/Programme reputation</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Expected gains</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Determination for studying</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Future plans</td>
<td>□ 5 □ 4 □ 3 □ 2 □ 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[This is the end of the questionnaire. THANK YOU.]
Construing Experiential Organization in Research Article Abstracts: A Genre-based Approach

Yu Hui

Beijing Normal University, China

Biodata

YU Hui, Professor of School of Foreign Languages and Literature, Beijing Normal University. She got her Ph.D. in linguistics from Sun Yat-sen University in 2001. She completed her postdoctoral research in Beijing Normal University and has since been teaching in the English Department. Currently she gives courses on pragmatics and discourse analysis for the MA program. Her research interests include discourse analysis, systemic functional grammar, English for specific purposes and genre typology.

Abstract

In this paper we explore the relationship between the genre of research article abstracts and its typical experiential organizations. The analysis is set within the framework of Systemic Functional Linguistics. Our data consist of 47 naturally occurring abstracts in journals from five academic disciplines, i.e. linguistics, science, management, economy and geography. First we explore the occurrence and distribution of process types in our data. Then we make a comparative analysis of Transitivity patterns of two generic elements (viz. Purpose of Study and Conclusion) in research article abstracts. Our analysis reveals systematic variation in their general process types and the nature of participants involved in the process. Our findings provide evidence that the choice of Transitivity at each stage of a text is conditioned by its
communicative purpose. Our conclusion is that Transitivity patterns as clausal realizations of experiential meanings can be influenced by the genre to which the text belongs and that Transitivity analysis provides important linguistic clues to the identification of generic structures. Keywords: experiential organization; transitivity; process type; generic element; generic structure

1. Introduction

An abstract is an abbreviated representation of a document, without added interpretation or criticism. It is now a widely recognizable genre as a result of its well-defined and mutually understood communicative purpose. Scholars in the area of ESP have explored this genre in terms of “moves” (see, for example, Bhatia 1993) or what Hasan (1985) calls “generic structural elements”. However, little research has been done on the contrastive analysis of linguistic realizations across different moves within this particular genre. In this paper, we are going to explore from a systemic functional point of view the experiential organization of research article abstracts. Specifically, we are going to address the following questions:

(1) What are the prototypical experiential meanings encoded in the genre of abstracts?

(2) Are there systematic differences across different generic structural elements? If yes, how does the purpose of each individual element condition and influence its experiential organization?

Language enables human beings to build ‘a mental picture of reality, to make sense of what goes on around them and inside them’ (Halliday 1994: 106). This is realized by the ideational metafunction of language, which is responsible for construing our experience of goings-on around us — doing, feeling, relating, behaving, saying, and so on. In this paper, our focus will be on the organization of clause to realize experiential meanings. The description of
the experiential strand of meaning involves crucially one major lexicogrammatical system, that of Transitivity. The Transitivity system construes our inner and outer experience of the world into a set of process types. Choices of process types and participant roles are seen as the lexicogrammatical realizations of writers’ encoding of their experiential reality: actions, participants and circumstances that constitute the experiential structure of the clause.

For the purpose of genre analysis, it is useful to find out what kinds of process types occur in abstracts and whether they are motivated by this particular genre. We shall begin by illustrating the meaning of Transitivity, which incorporates the discussion of its major variables and the process types. Our data consist of 47 naturally occurring abstracts in academic journals from five different disciplines, i.e. linguistics, science, management, economy and geography. These disciplines range from natural sciences to social sciences. By doing so, we hope to find out any generalizations about academic discourse as a whole. We shall then go into a more detailed discussion of the typical experiential meanings as encoded by process types in our data as well as the function played by clause constituents. Finally, realization patterns across different generic stages will be discussed. The purpose is to find out whether different elements of generic structure will reveal different choices in terms of Transitivity.

2. Previous genre-based studies on academic discourse

The current study adopts a genre-based approach. A genre-based approach to academic discourse has great potential for pedagogical purposes. An important consideration for setting curriculum for schools is the need to prepare students for the types of language use they are likely to encounter in their future lives, and to prepare students for careers such as in business or industry. Genre analysis, with the useful insights it provides for language patterning above and beyond the sentence, offers frameworks for higher order structuring of syllabuses and materials. The
eventual aim of a genre analyst with a pedagogical perspective is to develop ways of presenting the results of linguistic research in such a way as to be useful for teachers. Much research work has been done on genres in more specialized varieties of written English, which emphasizes the socially rooted nature of genres and their recognizability by specialists within discourse communities.

Since genres have different purposes, we may assume that speakers will also differ in their lexicogrammatical choices according to the different purposes they want to achieve. That is, a genre might have its own prototypical realization patterns. The same is true with different stages of the same genre, which, predictably, will reveal different lexicogrammatical encodings across different elements.

The assumption that there may be prototypical, recurrent features in particular genres is important in an educational context. Indeed, according to McCarthy and Carter (1994: 24), this assumption ‘complements theories which posit a correlation between language use and specific situations’. Such a correlation can be incorporated into situation-based language curricula which focus on teaching how language is used in a range of communicative contexts such as at the post office, in the supermarket, in the travel agency, etc. Courses of this kind may be of special value in improving students’ spoken proficiency by familiarizing them with the prototypical patterns of communication found to occur in such contexts.

Examples of the most common academic genres that have been extensively examined for their generic features include medical research articles (Adams-Smith 1984, Nwogu 1991, 1997, Salager-Meyer 1994, Varttala 1999), legal documents (Bhatia 1987, 1993), discussion sections of research articles (Dudley-Evans 1986, McKinlay 1984, Holmes 1997, Hopkins and Dudley-Evans 1988), abstracts (Graetz 1985, Swales 1990), the discussion sections of seminars (Basturkmen 1995, 1999), etc.
Analyses of this kind have usually focused on how these genres are organized on the macro level. Bhatia (1993), for instance, in an examination of two sub-genres of what he calls the ‘promotional genre’, presents a four-move structure for research article abstracts (introducing purpose – describing methodology – summarizing results – presenting conclusions), thus distinguishing it from the other often confused genre, i.e. research article introductions, as these two genres have practically nothing in common in their generic structures. Martin (2003) investigates the rhetorical variation between the research article abstracts written in English for international journals and those written in Spanish and published in Spanish journals in the area of experimental social sciences. Samraj (2005), for instance, compares the generic structure of research article introductions and abstracts. Zand-Vakili & Kashani (2012) makes a contrastive move analysis between Persian and English research articles’ abstract and introduction parts.

Work of applied discourse analysis has also examined the linguistic aspects of particular genres, such as hedging in academic writing (Hyland 1994, Salager-Meyer 1994, Crompton 1997), collocation frameworks in specific professional writing (Marco 2000), etc. Of these studies, Martínez (2001) makes an inquiry which is closest to the current study. However, Martínez seems to be more concerned with interpersonal meanings rather than experiential meanings created by transitivity structures. She investigates how impersonal constructions, encoded in the transitivity structure, are used in experimental research articles. The result of this study reveals a tension between the need to present findings objectively and the need to persuade readers of their validity.

Such work on the macro-level textual descriptions and linguistic level features of particular genres can be ascribed to what Bhatia (1997a) refers to as the genre knowledge. So far very little research has been done to uncover the experiential meanings as encoded in the transitivity patterns of research article abstracts. Even much less research has been done to
compare the experiential organizations across different generic structural elements in the same genre.

3. Revisiting transitivity in a systemic functional framework

One strong point of SFL is that language makes not just one meaning at a time, but several modes of meaning simultaneously (Halliday 1994, Halliday & Matthiessen 2004). These types of meaning or metafunctions can be identified on all levels of language, in words, phrases, clauses and texts. In other words, language is organized around three metafunctions, i.e. ideational, interpersonal and textual.

Ideational meanings are meanings about the world, representation of reality. In addition to the function of experiential representation, ideational meaning has the other metafunction, the logical metafunction. Interpersonal meanings are concerned with the relationship between the addressor and the addressee, their participatory roles. The ideational metafunction is responsible for representing the natural world, with the interpersonal for enacting social relations. Unlike these two metafunctions, the textual metafunction is oriented towards the language itself. It enables the ideational and interpersonal meanings to be organized as information that can be shared by the speaker and the listener. The three metafunctions are simultaneous, both systemically and structurally. Different purposes of study may give rise to different perspectives in research work. Focus on the ideational meaning, for example, involves studying what topics are being talked about, by whom, when and how. Grammar provides resources for the simultaneous realization of these three metafunctions in one clause, which selects independently for TRANSITIVITY, MOOD and THEME (see Halliday 1994, Halliday & Matthiessen 2004, Martin 1992).

In traditional grammar, the term Transitivity is most familiar to us as a way of classifying
verbs according to whether they can be followed by objects. In SFL, however, the term is used in a much broader sense. Transitivity is one of the major grammatical systems for the ideational metafunction, which construes a variety of social processes and goings-on.

One major sub-system of Transitivity is that of PROCESS TYPE, which is encoded at the clause rank. A process can be analyzed from three perspectives. Looked at from above, a clause construes a happening, acting, sensing, being, etc, which is related outwardly to the natural world inside and around us. Looked at from below, a clause may be characterized as a structural configuration which consists of, for example, Actor + Process + Goal. This perspective relates the clause inwardly to its linguistic realization. Looked at from around, a clause may be the entry condition to a number of other process types. This is closely related to the phenomenon of projection, which, as mentioned previously, is either quoting or reporting speech or thought (e.g. We suggest that…, The analysis indicates that…). Usually we find that projection is possible only with verbal and mental processes. Verbal and mental clauses are the most common types of projecting clauses.

There are three primary options of process types in the English Transitivity system, viz. MATERIAL, MENTAL and RELATIONAL processes. Three other process types that are also identified are behavioral, verbal and existential processes.
Figure 1 presents a network of process types in the Transitivity system. The network suggests that any major clause in English selects from the Transitivity system a process type. It is in this sense that Transitivity offers a network of options for representing different types of experience – our experience of the material world, of the world of our mental consciousness, of the world of relations, and so on. Each process type has associated with it certain functional participant roles. The element not included in brackets suggests that the participant role is obligatory in the process. Any process can also be expanded by circumstantial elements.

From the ideational point of view, a clause can be construed as a configuration of actions with people, places, things and qualities. The frame for analyzing the process encoded by a clause is simple. A process mainly consists of three components: the process itself; participants involved in the process; circumstances associated with the process. These three notions are the
major semantic categories that account for in the most general way how phenomena of the real world are represented by means of linguistic structure.

Figure 2 illustrates the semantic interaction between components in a process. When we interpret the grammar of the clause, we need to recognize functions which are more specific than these and which may differ with respect to the type of processes being encoded.

*The girl opened the door.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>metafunction</th>
<th>system</th>
<th>The girl</th>
<th>opened</th>
<th>the door.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ideational</td>
<td>TRANSITIVITY</td>
<td>Actor</td>
<td>Material process</td>
<td>Goal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2: Transitivity analysis of a clause

In terms of Transitivity, this clause reflects a material process, which builds a mental picture of happenings, including actions, activities or events. It is characterized by particular configurations such as Process + Actor + Goal (See Halliday 1994 for a much more detailed account of the system). The function of Actor is obligatory, whether it is explicit (as in the girl opened the door) or implicit (as in the door opened).

Transitivity, then, offers a network of options that represent different types of our experience of the world. In the following section, we are going to take a closer look at the experiential meanings encoded in research article abstracts via the system of transitivity.

4. Transitivity patterns in abstracts

The determination of a process type encoded in a clause is not simply a matter of picking out a verb that is conventionally ascribed to a certain process. A number of verbs can function in more
than one process type and in different senses. Rather, as Halliday (1994: 134) points out, the criteria are a combination of three perspectives: (i) relations to other parts of the lexicogrammatical system; (ii) the contribution they make to discourse semantics; (iii) their realizational form in structure. Based on these criteria, we examine the Transitivity patterns that are found in abstracts, and the meanings that are related to these patterns. Our investigation into the typical realization of Transitivity in our data shows that virtually all process types occur in abstracts. The distribution, however, differs with respect to different types. The result of our analysis reveals that a large proportion of clauses are featured by relational and verbal processes that report the content of the source articles. The frequency of occurrence for each process type is presented in Table 1.

Table 1: Distribution of process types in abstracts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process type</th>
<th>relational</th>
<th>mental</th>
<th>material</th>
<th>verbal</th>
<th>behavioral</th>
<th>existential</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>total number</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percentage</td>
<td>43.7</td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>21.9</td>
<td>20.6</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>1.47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.1 Relational processes

As shown in Table 1, the most salient type of processes is the relational, which accounts for over forty percent of all processes. This is a particularly rich and complex area of clause Transitivity. Its system network is presented in Figure 2.
It is clear from the network that a relational clause is a process either of attribution or identification. This means that readers simply need to recognize that an entity is being described in some way – as belonging to a certain category, as possessing certain characteristics, or as being in a certain place.

Halliday (1985: 123-4) states that ‘in many registers – various kinds of scientific writing, for example, relational processes tend to be the most frequent and perhaps the most informative of the primary clause type’. This is true for texts in our data. An extreme case can be found in Text 11 of our data, which consists wholly of relational clauses. The following are a number of examples in our data that are realized by relational processes, with (1)-(7) being attributive relational clauses and (8)-(14) being identifying relational clauses.

(1) They are highly context-dependent items with very little lexical content… (Text 1)
(2) the lexical aspectual semantics of the verb phrase have an increasing influence on … (Text 6)
(3) The small chromosome also carries a gene capture system… (Text 11)
(4) Their primary application has been to medical treatment decision (Text 24)
(5) Autonomy in language learning is sometimes presented as a Western concept … (Text 4)
(6) the optimal tax system follows a ‘cash cow’ pattern… (Text 33)
(7) concern about the environment reached a new high point (Text 46)

(8) Our main concern is to locate our students’ writing within… (Text 2)

(9) The genome consists of two circular chromosomes of 2,961,146 bp and 1,072,314 bp (Text 11)

(10) Four native speakers acted as a control group. (Text 6)

(11) this triggered seismicity marked the beginning of a five-year trend… (Text 14)

(12) The most damaging change during cancer progression is the switch from … (Text 18)

(13) Intercluster traffic minimization is chosen as the clustering criterion… (Text 22)

(14) Both realities are represented through the language used in the courtroom (Text 8)

We see from these examples that a relational clause is not simply a matter of ‘being’. Rather, it can be marked by a variety of verbs such as consist of, represent, be considered, follow, mark, and so on.

Of all the types of relational processes, the intensive attributive relational clause occurs with perhaps the highest frequency. Examples of this kind from our data are abundant. Presumably, this is because in certain genres such as abstracts, the aim of which is to report the content of the source article, the meanings that are to be construed in texts are highly symbolic and condensed. A much more detailed description would probably involve more identifying relational processes.

Nearly ten percent of the relational processes belong to the circumstantial type. Most of the circumstantial clauses encode the circumstance of location as relationship between participants. This circumstantial relationship, however, is highly metaphorical. A number of examples of this type of clause found in our data are presented in (15) to (20).

(15) The study was based on the analysis of oral movie narratives (Text 6)

(16) The vast majority of recognizable genes …are located on the large chromosome. (Text
11) (17) The thermodynamics and kinetics … depend on their structure (Text 12) (18) transactions prices tend to fall towards competitive levels (Text 37) (19) A review … leads to the identification of four paradigms… (Text 39) (20) The development policies… resulted in widespread environment damage (Text 47)

This circumstantial relation in its metaphorical sense suggests that the text is itself a location. Under this interpretation, this type of clause in fact encodes a kind of textual relation between participants. They may be useful clues for novice readers in guiding their reading process, as they are suggestive of the textual spatial relationship between participants.

Of the possessive type, only the attributive relational process is found in our data. In an attributive possessive clause, possession may be encoded either through the participants (as in The piano is Peter’s) or through the process, typically realized by the verb own. In our data, possessive processes are predominantly realized by the second type of possession. In addition, possession in the usual sense of owning is rare in our examples. The possessive processes typically encode abstract relations of containment, involvement and the like. (21)-(28) are examples of possessive processes from our material.

(21) This article provides a developmental description of the language … (Text 7) (22) Such changes may have significant influences upon evidence … (Text 8) (23) Sea ice and oceanic boundaries have a dominant effect in … (Text 15) (24) Expression of these genes requires calcium influx … (Text 17) (25) This switch is believed to involve numerous alterations… (Text 18) (26) This paper contains an econometric analysis of the transition period. (Text 30) (27) Selective search … has attracted considerable attention as a possible source … (Text 32)
(28) increasing number of motor vehicles is encouraging high levels of air pollution... (Text 47)

How should we account for the meaning of relational processes? The Identified/Identifier analysis, according to Thompson (1997: 91), helps us to perceive how ‘the particular text is unfolding’. This might be interesting in view of the fact that the typical realization of the Identified or Identifier is the unmarked Theme. And Theme sometimes contributes to the method of development of texts. We may reasonably assume that one reason for the predominance of relational processes in abstracts is due to the writer’s desire to guide readers towards the larger textual organization. Thompson (1997: 91) further postulates that the Token/Value analysis is suggestive of the ‘broader concerns and values of the writer’. This is particularly important for the genre of abstracts, the purpose of which is to give a condensed representation of the major content of the source article. On the one hand, the Token selection will be constrained by the writer’s desire to present the most essential, and, on the other hand, the Value reveals how the writer evaluates the Tokens he is most concerned with. The Token/Value selection suggests what the abstractor considers to be most important in the academic experiential world. To some extent the Token/Value analysis may even reveal wider ideological beliefs, particularly in highly valued genres such as ‘scientific, commercial, political and bureaucratic discourse’ (Halliday 1994: 126).

4.2 Verbal processes

Verbal processes encode a symbolic relationship ‘constructed in human consciousness and enacted in the form of language’ (Halliday 1994: 107). It is regarded as a symbolic process because it does not necessarily require a conscious participant. Although according to Halliday (1994: 107) verbal is not one of the main types of processes in the English Transitivity system, we find in our data a large number of clauses are characterized by verbal processes. That is to say,
who says what to whom, who makes what claims, is a matter of great importance in abstracts.

Verbal process has the important characteristic of being able to project, with mental process being the other type that is able to project. In addition, a verbal process encodes three participant functions: (1) Receiver, the one to whom the saying is addressed; (2) Verbiage, what is said; (3) Target, the entity that is targeted. Interestingly, no instances of Receiver as a participant role are found in our data. The implicit Receiver is usually either ‘you’ or ‘us’, as in This paper reports (to you) a series of… Our studies indicate (to us) that…. Presumably, the absence of Receiver is due to the general principle in academic writing to avoid as many personal items as possible.

In our data, a limited number of speech verbs are used, and verbal clauses in abstracts follow certain fixed patterns. In one type of verbal clauses, the author refers anaphorically to part of the article in order to arouse the reader’s attention to its significance. Here we find a number of examples that can be ascribed to this type. Notice that the Sayer or the Subject in the following clauses is impersonal and it usually refers to different aspects of the research reported in the article. This enables the writer to guide the reader towards understanding how the projected clause is derived without appearing to give any interventions as a participant. Again it is motivated by impersonality requirement in academic writing.

(29) Our research suggests that … (Text 2)
(30) The results of the study show that… (Text 6)
(31) Comparison of … indicates that … (Text 13)
(32) These data indicate that … (Text 14)
(33) Analysis of … indicates that … (Text 18)
(34) Results from these studies demonstrate that …(Text 25)
(35) Problems …suggest that … (Text 43)
In Examples (36)-(44), the Sayer either refers to the research as a whole (this paper) or to the exclusive we (i.e. the authors themselves). In Example (37), both strategies are used, but this paper appears in a location circumstantial Adjunct. The distribution of this paper and we is motivated. Non-personal elements such as this paper or the present study occur more frequently in our data than personal elements such as we or I. Although both types of verbal clauses follow a Sayer:Verbiage pattern, their realizations of Verbiage differ. In Examples (29)-(35), Verbiage is realized by a projected clause, whereas Verbiage in Examples (36)-(44) is usually realized by a nominal group. In the latter type of verbal clauses, as the Sayer refers to the overall research, the Verbiage, i.e. what is said, naturally concerns the research content as a whole. We may reasonably assume that this type of clauses may characterize certain generic element (e.g. the Purpose of Study). We shall explore this further in the next section.

(36) This paper reports a series of … (Text 2)

(37) In this paper, we discuss central … (Text 3)

(38) This paper argues that … (Text 4)

(39) This paper addresses this issue … (Text 5)

(40) Here we report the discovery … (Text 19)

(41) We describe ...(Text 25)

(42) This paper discusses … (Text 29)

(43) This paper reports … (Text 36)

(44) This paper demonstrates that … (Text 43)

Sometimes the Sayer refers to the work of other researchers or related participants rather than the article per se. The Sayer usually takes the thematic position, which highlights the source of the Verbiage. There are not many examples of this pattern that are found in our data. This is due to the nature of abstracts. As an abstract is a very short representation of the major content of
the source article, little space can be devoted to reporting the result of other researches. Even if such verbal clauses do occur in abstracts, they would most probably occur in the generic element of research background.

(45) Previous research has shown that … (Text 6)

(46) Recent molecular dynamics simulations have predicted… (Text 12)

(47) The MMC claimed that … (Text 30)

(48) several geographers have commented on … (Text 40)

Finally, we find in our data that the verbal process is the major type of clause that can project a clause. There are three dimensions along which projection can be classified: speech function (whether the projected clause is a proposition or proposal), taxis (whether the projecting and the projected clauses are in a relationship of hypotaxis or parataxis), and orientation (whether the projected clause is a quote or report). There is only one type of projection that occurs in our data, i.e. the hypotactic reported proposition. Though the mental process is the other type of clause that can project, very few instances of mental clauses functioning as a projecting clause are found in our data. There are perhaps two reasons that can account for this finding.

The first reason has to do with the nature of a mental process. All mental clauses involve a process of ‘sensing’. There are three sub-types of a mental process, namely, PERCEPTION (seeing, hearing, etc), AFFECTION (liking, fearing, etc), and COGNITION (knowing, understanding, etc). In other words, a mental process encodes a process of human consciousness, though the Senser is not necessarily human. All the abstracts in our data, however, belong to the larger category of academic writing, which means that the projected content is not simply a result of ‘sensing’, but a result of experimental investigations, scientific calculations, strict deductions, etc. A clause projected by a mental process would therefore appear to be less scientific and
convincing. The second reason is in fact related to the first one. For academic writing, it must try to avoid any personal involvement in order to appear objective. A mental process, however, which encodes a process of sensing, is most closely associated with personal involvement, particularly the subcategory of Affection that is concerned with personal feelings. The scarcity of projecting mental processes reflects the writer’s desire to make his writing take on an impersonal and detached tone.

4.3 Material processes

A material clause encodes a process of doing, typically concrete, tangible actions and events. It is from this type of process that our traditional understanding of Transitivity is derived. In terms of linguistic structure, a material process is characterized by structural configurations such as Actor + Process + Goal. This structure is based on the transitive/intransitive distinction. From an ergative point of view, however, the structure is Medium + Process. The Medium corresponds to the Actor in a clause of middle voice, and to the Goal in an effective voice.

On the whole, there are not so many material clauses as relational clauses in our data, and they do not lend themselves to easy categorization. Presumably, the actions encoded in material processes are related to each specific discipline.1 In our analysis, the clauses that encode a material process fall largely into two broad categories. The first type is what we would refer to as a meta-action, that is, action carried out by researchers. The second type of material processes usually encodes actions that are observed by researchers to take place during the research process.

Examples (49)-(57) below belong to the meta-actions. Of course, they all include activities belonging to the world of research, in which the writers themselves are the Actors. We can see that the Subject in these clauses is not necessarily ‘we’. The Actor can be implicit through the use of passive voice, as in Examples (51), (52), (54), (57). Usually the action
encoded in this type of clauses is to make sure that the research can be carried out successfully, or it is concerned with what researchers do to end up the research (e.g. by establishing a taxonomy or by developing a model).

(49) we have established a taxonomy… (Text 1)

(50) we have completed five studies …. (Text 2)

(51) Casual conversations … were recorded … (Text 7)

(52) Testing and assessment … has... been carried out ...(Text 9)

(53) We set up a continuous time version… (Text 20)

(54) Numerical studies are conducted…(Text 23)

(55) We develop an … (Text 26)

(56) we quantify this effect (Text 27)

(57) A theoretical model … is developed … (Text 34)

For the second type of material clauses, we find that a striking number of clauses make use of the middle voice, a system under the ergative interpretation. There seems now to be a growing tendency in the system of modern English to employ an ergative pattern. This tendency, according to Halliday (1994: 163), is due to an increasing emphasis on the ‘textual function’ in ‘the organization of English discourse’, and an emphasis on the ‘cause-and-effect aspect’ of the process. Our assumption is that the writer’s choice of the middle voice is related to textual considerations, as the Subject of the clause is in most cases also the ideational Theme.

Interestingly, we find that the group of clauses with a middle voice falls further into roughly two categories. We define them separately as the ‘changing’ type and the ‘emerging’ type. Note that most of the Mediums in the following clauses (e.g. incidence, variability, surprises, improvements), are not conscious beings, but have shaded into the symbolic type of meaning. Of the emerging type of clauses, what emerges or occurs is not some entity, but some
change of state. That is to say, verbs in this group of clauses are descriptive of some change of situation in the experiential world.

**Middle voice**

(i) *Changing type*

(58) Incidence of cutaneous melanoma is rising…(Text 19)

(59) Drug use and related problems change … (Text 20)

(60) the optimal price decreases …. (Text 23)

(61) demand variability increases… (Text 27)

(62) retail prices have risen (Text 30)

(ii) *Emerging type*

(63) the near-critical-size clusters formed during… (Text 12)

(64) some surprises emerge (Text 33)

(65) a large rise …has occurred…(Text 35)

(66) a significant divergence is occurring… (Text 38)

(67) many of the expected improvements …have not materialized (Text 47)

Finally, one interesting observation is that the two types of material processes occur in different positions. For the meta-action type, the process usually takes place in independent clauses or the primary clause in a clause complex. Almost half of the second type of material processes, however, appear in the secondary clause in a projection. They function as projected clauses, suggesting their status as observations or comments. In this sense, the projected status of the material clause is a kind of textual guide as to the interpretation of the clauses.

Due to the limit of space, we shall not report our findings for other process types, as,
compared with the above three types, there are much fewer occurrences of other minor processes in our data. Generally speaking, it seems that the demands of abstract writing – to integrate, to condense, and to generalize the source, require that language choices in the abstract increase their level of abstraction and incongruence.

5. Transitivity and genre

This paper has so far analyzed the distribution, realization and meaning of process types in abstracts. Each clause can be seen to select for a process type that specifies the action, events or relationship between participants. The purpose of abstracts predicts its preference for relational processes, which reflect the writer’s choice of the most important Tokens in the source article and how he values them. Our analysis further shows that there is a general tendency in the language of abstracts to be symbolic and abstract. Analysis of this kind offers a description of the relationship between one strand of clause and the macro aspect of the text that contains the clause, i.e. the genre. In this section, we shall explore further the relationship between Transitivity and genre. The analysis will mainly focus on the relationship between Transitivity patterns and different generic elements.

Now, since genres are different ways of using languages, we should find that writers make different lexicogrammatical choices according to the different purposes they want to achieve. Each genre favors some linguistic structures and elements over others. For example, the type of words and structures used in a fairy tale will not be the same as those used in an academic paper. Similarly, each genre is made up of a number of elements that are functionally different. Each stage of the text has its own specific purpose to achieve. We may assume that the lexicogrammatical realizations will differ across different generic elements. For example, the words and structures used in the Purpose part will be different from those of the Conclusion part.
Realization patterns of Transitivity will, predictably, also differ across generic stages. In the following, we shall analyze respectively the realization of Transitivity at the stage of PS (Purpose of Study) and the stage of C (Conclusion) in abstracts. After that we shall make some comparison between these two stages.

5.1 Generic element: Purpose of Study

The element of PS is an important component of the abstract. It answers the question of ‘what the writer is going to talk about in the paper’ or ‘what actions to be undertaken by the writer for the present research’. Usually it is realized as a concise indication of the author’s intention that forms the basis of the ongoing research. Our analysis of the lexicogrammatical patterns that realize the PS element is summarized in Table 2, which reveals the complexity of the actual language in texts.

The purpose of the article is usually articulated in one single clause in the abstract. In some cases, it is realized by a clause complex that encodes a semantic relationship of projection. As shown in Table 2, four process types occur in the PS element, (viz. mental, verbal, relational, and material). However, further investigation into the frequency distribution of the four types suggests that they differ with respect to the degree of preference by the element. More than eighty percent of processes are taken up by mental and verbal clauses. Though relational clauses are the most frequent type of clauses that occur in abstracts, for the PS element, however, only a little more than ten percent of clauses are taken up by relational processes. In our data, there is only one instance of material process that realizes the PS element (In this paper we quantify this effect…). It is possible that, in a much larger size of data, the percentage of mental and verbal processes will probably be even higher. This is because, generally speaking, the purpose for an academic study is to investigate, examine, explore, discuss, evaluate, analyze, etc, processes
usually associated with mental or verbal activities. A material action might be too specific for the purpose of a research article, and may be more appropriate in a more elaborative articulation of the purpose.

The nuclear semantic property for the PS element is the action to be undertaken for the overall research. The action is realized either by an entire process element or is part of a participant that shares the semantic property. The former type is commonly seen in mental and verbal processes (e.g. *consider, examine, report, discuss*, etc), whereas the latter is found in relational and verbal clauses (e.g. *provides comparative analysis of the Mexican currency crisis, contains an econometric analysis of the transition period, present a quantitative reconstruction of biological production*). It is in the latter type that the notion of ideational metaphor is involved.

In the following, we shall summarize the verb and verbal group types in the PS element. The most prototypical tense for verbs that features the PS element is the simple present. Though Table 2 shows that simple future, simple past and present perfect also occur in our data, there is only one or two occurrences for each type of tense. This contrasts with, for example, the tenses that characterize the generic element of RD (Research Design), in which we find a great variety of tense forms. The voice for the clauses is always the active.

Verbs
analyzing type: explore, analyze, examine, consider, investigate
reporting type: report, describe, present, show
discussing type: address, discuss
evaluating type: reassess, assess, evaluate, survey

Verbal group complexes
time-phase: set out the explore
conation: aim to raise, attempt to examine
An analysis of the realization of participants reveals interesting findings. As all of the clauses are active, there is always an Agent involved in the process. The realization of the Agent is remarkably similar. It is realized either by impersonal *this paper* (with only two exceptions, *this article, the present study*) or by personal *we*. The demonstrative *this* is used instead of *the* even though *the* is the unmarked one. Here *this* is used in a sense to refer to something that is being treated as ‘near’, as the abstract is immediately followed by the source article.

Further Transitivity analysis shows that there is one type of circumstance that consistently occurs in the PS element, viz. *in this paper*. This circumstantial element always occupies the thematic position and is followed by the Agent *we*. In terms of thematic analysis it can be labeled as the ideational Theme signaling location in space. Space in this case is, of course, highly metaphorical. The text itself is a place. Presumably, the function of this circumstantial element is to guide readers in interpreting the meaning of the remaining part of the clause, as *in this paper* already suggests that the proposition which follows is very likely to be associated with the overall research content. This assumption is further confirmed by our finding that in this paper as a circumstantial element only appears in the PS element of abstracts in our data.

**5.2 Generic element: Conclusion**

If the PS describes an outside-inside movement, the Conclusion describes an inside-outside movement. In the Conclusion, the author moves from specific findings to wider implications. The primary function of this section is to make some reflection on the research findings, in which the author summarizes his research, proposes some implications or significance with reference to the current work, and sets further questions, further developments and applications in the field of study, thus concluding the research work. Naturally the function of the Conclusion
differs from that of the PS element. Predictably, the lexicogrammatical realization patterns will also differ. Indeed the Conclusion part reveals a much greater diversity of lexicogrammatical realizations than that of the PS part. It is also at this stage of the abstract that we find interpersonal meanings are most heavily loaded.

Our analysis suggests that, unlike the element of PS, the Conclusion of most abstracts in our data is realized by more than one clause. The semantic relationship encoded in a clause complex can be expansion or projection. As Table 3 shows, the Conclusion part manifests a greater variety of process types. Practically all process types take place in the Conclusion with the exception of behavioral process. The general pattern that emerges, however, is that Conclusion stages are realized for the most part by relational, verbal and material processes, which together account for over ninety percent of the processes. There are only a couple of clauses that encode a mental process or an existential process. Of all these processes, the relational is the most frequent type of clauses that occur in the Conclusion. The Carrier:Attribute structure further accounts for a greater majority of relational processes in the Conclusion. How then should we explain the large proportion of attributive relational processes?

A comparison of the Conclusion stage of abstracts with the evaluation stage of a narrative reveals some similarities. For Labov and Waletzky (1967), a narrative lacking evaluation is not a complete narrative: ‘such a narrative lacks significance; it has no point’ (1967: 33). To some extent, the conclusion of an academic paper is similar to the evaluation of a narrative in that the conclusion sometimes implicates the significance of the research: it is where the research work finally leads to. In some cases, the conclusion makes evaluations or summarizes implications for the present research. The most prototypical realization of an evaluative remark is a relational process. The encoding of a Token:Value structure enables the writer to bring to the fore what he considers to be the most important Tokens, and more importantly, to introduce Values for these
Tokens, thus revealing his wider beliefs and attitudes. It is in this aspect that the Conclusion element is related to the interpersonal meanings encoded in the abstract.3

Compared with the PS element, it seems more difficult to make generalizations concerning the verbs that realize the process. The verb be is most frequent in the Conclusion. Apart from be, we have identified three types of verbs that commonly occur in the Conclusion, as illustrated in the following (cf. verbs in the PS element).

suggesting type: suggest, indicate, propose, anticipate,
resultative type: result from, determine, be caused by, be governed by,
explaining type: explain, account for

Of particular interest is the first type of ‘suggesting’ verbs, which has been described by some linguists as epistemic reporting verbs because verbs of this kind denote an explicit display of lack of commitment (Hyland 1994, Salager-Meyer 1994, Crompton 1997, Varttala 1999). Such verbs characteristically occur as markers of tentativeness in reporting the author’s own work. In this sense, they can be said to carry an interpersonal meaning as they function as a kind of modulation device. They are often used as predicates in clauses where the Subject is either the researcher or, in many cases, an inanimate noun such as data, evidence, findings, and results. Note that what qualifies these verbs as having an interpersonal function is not their inanimate Subjects, but the fact that the author could have expressed complete commitment, yet has chosen not to. For example, the following is a common form for a knowledge claim. The verb indicate is commonly used in the Conclusion.

(68) Analysis … indicates that RhoC is important in tumour cell invasion (Text 18)

Instead of (68), the writer could have written:

(69) Analysis … demonstrates that RhoC is important in tumour cell invasion

Verbs of the former type are much more common. The writer has at his disposal a set of
verb choices from which he can select one to realize the reporting process. The fact that he chooses the verbs that express less epistemic commitment reflects not his lack of confidence, but his modesty and due respect to readers who are most likely members of the same special discourse community.

Lexis is not, of course, the only means for expressing interpersonal meanings of this kind. Another powerful source for creating interpersonal meanings is by means of modality. In our analysis we find that the Conclusion section of the abstract makes the heaviest use of modalized expressions compared with other generic elements. Modality has been defined by Halliday (1994: 88) as the ‘intermediate degrees between the positive and negative poles’. Both propositions and proposals can be modalized. One way of creating modalization is the use of a finite modal operator in the verbal group, for example:

(70) The findings may help to equip EAP students to interact better socially … (Text 7)
(71) similarly unexpected critical nucleus structures may be quite common … (Text 12)
(72) an environmental source of stress – plausibly barometric pressure – might be responsible for the annual variation (Text 14)
(73) the unimodal relationship often observed in natural communities can be caused by selection for specialized types … (Text 16)
(74) This discontinuity … may help explain tax reforms commonly seen over the course of economic development (Text 33)
(75) the influence of the Soviet legacy should not be underestimated (Text 47)

By resorting to such expressions, researchers are able to avoid absolute remarks and indicate the degree of certainty with which they present their conclusions and also how strongly they want to commit themselves to their claims. In this way they provide space for disagreements or counter-opinions. More importantly, modals allow writers to present their claims with due
caution, modesty, and humility because writers are expected to present themselves as ‘servants of the discipline while asserting an individual contribution’ (Hyland 1994: 241). They have to be careful in defining their relationship to the research community, and the use of modals to modify verbs is a crucial way to mediate between their claims and the consensus of the discourse community. The above examples illustrate how modal auxiliaries enable research results to be presented as indicative or suggestive rather than definitive. Indeed, modals are the most important means of allowing authors to ‘make claims about what is legitimate to conclude from the results, what may or must be the case, what phenomena are sometimes or generally observable and so on’ (Butler 1990: 166).

Compared with the PS element, the Conclusion part illustrates a greater variety of participant realizations. One thing that may be worthy of our interest is that some of the participants refer anaphorically to the research findings or results, or to the nominalized research process, for example:

(76) **Our research** suggests that … (Text 2)

(77) **The findings** may help to equip EAP students … (Text 7)

(78) **Comparison of** … indicates that … (Text 13)

(79) **These data** indicate that … (Text 14)

(80) **Our result** provides experimental evidence … (Text 16)

(81) **Analysis of** … indicates that … (Text 18)

(82) **The data** in both studies are consistent with the model predictions (Text 21)

(84) **These results** explain why … (Text 23)

Reference to the above research results or research process helps us to identify the function of the clause that contains the reference as conclusive. This type of participant realization is obviously related to the function of the Conclusion section.
5.3 Discussion

The Purpose of Study and Conclusion are different stages of the abstract, and hence they serve different communicative purposes. If the Purpose of Study is hyper-Theme of the abstract, the Conclusion is a kind of hyper-New. The Purpose marks the beginning of the research and allows the writer to ‘establish a niche’; it is what the research is going to be concerned with, whereas the Conclusion marks the end of the research; it presents the essence of what can be concluded or summarized from the research results. The difference between the Purpose and the Conclusion sections illustrates a clear-cut break between the objective detached reporting and the more subjective author involvement. Such difference is, presumably, also reflected in their linguistic realizations.

In the PS section, the author ‘examines’ or ‘discusses’ some problem or phenomenon. Hence objective reporting processes are characteristic of this element. Usually the writer is straightforward in telling the reader what this article is going to talk about. The Subject realization of the clause that reports the process is also clear; it is realized either by the paper or by the researcher(s).

In the Conclusion section of the abstract, however, the writer speculates, argues, contrasts, and comments on the described results. The writer has to avoid stating remarks too conclusively so that readers will not think that the writer is claiming to have the final word on the subject. An important feature that distinguishes the Conclusion part is the modalization of verbs, which functions to qualify the proposition by downplaying the statement so as to gain acceptance by the discourse community. As every explanation for the research results is by nature tentative and hypothetical, there is always the possibility that someone else may come up with alternative explanations. The writer must take into account possible reactions from other academics and
provide space for counter opinions or disagreement. Thus, instead of saying ‘I know’, the writer should rather suggest or *propose* something when he addresses other scholars. Similarly, one should preferably say *how things might be* or *how things plausibly are* instead of saying *how things are*. This explains why the Conclusion section is most heavily loaded with interpersonal meanings.

Our discussion of the Conclusion section is echoed by Francis and Kramer-Dahl (1991: 346), in which they find that the concluding section of a medical report is featured by a large number of relational processes. They ascribe this feature to the task of the concluding section, which they consider is to draw inferences from evidence and show how these inferences fit in with or extend existing knowledge within the research community. Similarly, verbs such as indicate, suggest are repeatedly used in their data. Scholars from the field of ESP have made similar findings. Salager-Meyer (1994), for example, in a discussion of the relationship between hedges and textual communicative function in medical English written discourse, discovers that the concluding discussion or comment section makes the heaviest use of modulation devices. Research of this kind suggests that the communicative purpose of different generic sections influences and conditions the patterns of lexicogrammatical realizations in each section.

**6. Conclusion**

Abstracts as a particular academic genre have been explored in the area of ESP from a macro-structural point of view. In this paper, we shifted our focus to the patterns of experiential realizations in this genre. We have explored the relationship between the genre of abstracts and its typical experiential organizations. Our investigation of the occurrence and distribution of process types in our data reveals that the abstract as a genre is featured by a high frequency of relational processes. A relational process is reflective of what the writer considers to be the most
important Tokens in the source article as well as their Values. This is of special importance to the
genre of abstracts, which is supposed to be a condensed representation of the most important
content of the article. Another major process that features abstracts is the verbal. The meaning of
a verbal process is in line with the task of the abstract, which is to report, to demonstrate, to show,
etc. The nature of participants involved in the process further suggests that the abstract as a genre
is highly symbolic and condensed. Our discussion demonstrates how Transitivitiy patterns as
clausal realizations of experiential meanings can be influenced by the genre to which the text
belongs. In selecting the process types and the configuration of participants and circumstance,
the writer is actively involved in a process of representing the experiential world in a genre-
specific way.

Transitivitiy analysis is also helpful in accounting for the generic structure of the genre. A
comparative analysis of two generic elements (viz. Purpose of Study and Conclusion) reveals
systematic variation in their general process types and the nature of participants involved in the
process. Our findings provide evidence that the identification of generic elements is related to
Transitivitiy patterns. That is, the choice of Transitivitiy at each stage of a text is conditioned by
its communicative purpose, and by the level of claim the writer wishes to make. Our conclusion
is that Transitivitiy analysis provides important linguistic clues to the identification of generic
structures.

Acknowledgements
This paper is financially supported by the Ministry of Education of China (10YJA740117). I’d
like to thank the anonymous readers for their comments on an earlier draft of this paper.
Notes

1. Due the limit of space, we shall not explore further the generic conditioning of sub-genres on the realization of process types.

2. Hasan (1996) distinguishes between the notions of nuclear and elaborative meanings of a generic element. Nuclear semantic attributes are essential and obligatory to the determination of a generic element, whereas elaborative properties are optional, and contribute the development of the nuclear meanings.


References


Appendix

Journals from which the abstract texts are selected:

Sample full abstracts in our data
[Text 1] This paper sets out to explore the function of items of procedural vocabulary as signals of conceptual relations in scientific discourse. Procedural vocabulary, a general strategic vocabulary first studied by Widdowson (1983), consists of lexical items which do not belong to any particular schema. They are highly context-dependent items with very little lexical content, which accounts for their important role in the elaboration of rhetorical functions related to the explanation of concepts. On the basis of a database of definitions, descriptions and classifications occurring in scientific discourse, we have established a taxonomy of procedural items in terms of the contextual relations that they set up between content-bearing words. These relations signaled by procedural vocabulary can be classified into nine major groups: identity, difference, inclusion, exclusion, process, function, spatial relations, feature relations, and quantity modification. An awareness of the vocabulary signaling these relations is part of the language user’s communicative strategies which allow for the negotiation and comprehension of concepts in discourse. (*Applied Linguistics*, 1999, Vol. 20, No. 1)

[Text 11] Here we determine the complete genomic sequence of the Gram negative, γ-Proteobacterium *Vibrio cholerae* El Tor N16961 to be 4,033,460 base pairs (bp). The genome consists of two circular chromosomes of 2,961,146 bp and 1,072,314 bp that together encode 3,885 open reading frames. The vast majority of recognizable genes for essential cell functions (such as DNA replication, transcription, translation and cell-wall biosynthesis) and pathogenicity (for example, toxins, surface antigens and adhesins) are located on the large chromosome. In contrast, the small chromosome contains a larger fraction (59%) of hypothetical genes compared
with the large chromosom (42%), and also contains many more genes that appear to have origins other than the \( \gamma \) –Proteobacteria. The small chromosome also carries a gene capture system (the integron island) and host ‘addiction’ genes that are typically found on plasmids; thus, the small chromosome may have originally been a megaplasmid that was captured by an ancestral \( Vibrio \) species. The \( V. \) cholerae genomic sequence provides a starting for understanding how a free-living, environmental organism emerged to become a significant human bacterial pathogen. *(Nature, 2000, Vol. 406, No. 3.)*

[Text 21] We examine the key factors that influence a firm’s decision whether to use front-loaded or rear-loaded incentives. When using price packs, direct mail coupons, FSI coupons or incentive. However, when buying products with in-pack coupons or products affiliated with loyalty programs, promotion incentives are obtained on the next purchase occasion or later, i.e., a rear-loaded incentive. Our analysis shows that the innate choice process of consumers in front-loaded and rear-loaded promotions. While in both variety-seeking and inertial markets, the sales impact and the sales on discount are higher for front-loaded promotions than for read-loaded promotions, from a profitability perspective, rear-loaded promotions may be better than front-loaded promotions. We show that in markets with high variety-seeking it is more profitable for a firm to rear-load, and in markets with high inertia it is more profitable to front-load. Model implications are verified using two empirical studies: (a) a longitudinal experiment (simulating markets with variety-seeking consumers and inertial consumers) and (b) market data on promotion usage. The data in both studies are consistent with the model predictions. *(Management Science, 2000, Vol. 46, No. 3)*

[Text 36] Research in social sciences other than economics indicates substantial differences in behaviour between men and women. The general conclusion drawn from this work is that women will be more socially-oriented (selfless), and men more individually-oriented (selfish). This paper reports the results of a double-anonymous dictator experiment designed to permit the emergence of basic gender differences in economic behaviour. Our results are intended to provide a baseline for further research. We find that women, on average, donate twice as much as men to their anonymous partners when any factors that might confound cooperation are eliminated. *(The Economic Journal, 1998, Vol. 108 (May))*
In Prague, as with many other European historic cities, the growth of tourism has altered perceptions of the cultural meaning of place which is embedded in the built environment. This paper draws on research undertaken to explore the impact of tourism on perceptions of the historic core of that city. Data from surveys of the views of residents and visitors reveal a growing recognition of a number of negative impacts of tourism. These perceptions have far reaching implications for the continuing success of the historic city center not only as a place of residence, but also as a tourist destination. Conclusions drawn from the research underline the need for tourism to be managed in a more effective and sustainable way if the character of the historic center is not to be altered irreversibly. (*The Geographical Journal*, 1999. Vol. 165, No. 2)
### Table 2: Transitivity patterns: Purpose of Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generic element</th>
<th>Process type</th>
<th>Verbal group</th>
<th>Voice</th>
<th>Sample realizations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of study</td>
<td>Mental</td>
<td>Simple present</td>
<td>Active</td>
<td>This paper sets out to explore the function of items …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verbal</td>
<td>Simple future</td>
<td></td>
<td>This paper reports a series of ethnographic studies …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Relational</td>
<td>Simple past</td>
<td></td>
<td>Here we present a quantitative reconstruction of biological production…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Material</td>
<td>Present perfect</td>
<td></td>
<td>Here we have examined the ecosystem structure …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>We examine the key factors…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>We consider a dynamic pricing model …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This paper contains an econometric analysis of the transition period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This paper surveys the progress …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This paper aims to raise the question of a new conceptualization …</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 3: Transitivity patterns: Conclusion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generic element</th>
<th>Process type</th>
<th>Verbal group</th>
<th>Voice</th>
<th>Sample realizations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Relational</td>
<td>Simple present</td>
<td>Active</td>
<td>Our research suggests that … … concepts … are in need of revision …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verbal</td>
<td>Simple past</td>
<td>Passive</td>
<td>The findings may help to equip EAP students to interact better socially …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Material</td>
<td>Present perfect</td>
<td></td>
<td>The V. cholerae genomic sequence provides a starting point for understanding how…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mental</td>
<td>Present in present</td>
<td></td>
<td>Our result provides experimental evidence that the unimodal relationship … can be</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Existential</td>
<td>Modalization and</td>
<td></td>
<td>caused by selection for specialized types …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>modulation</td>
<td></td>
<td>These results explain why yield management has become so essential to fashion …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>It is concluded that a dual emphasis of … is required to assist Albania in moving away</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>from…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the influence of the Soviet legacy should not be underestimated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Analysis … indicates that RhoC is important in tumour cell invasion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>